# Critical Issues in Policing Series



# Embracing Civilianization Integrating Professional Staff to Advance Modern Policing





# **July 2024**

**CRITICAL ISSUES IN POLICING SERIES** 

# Embracing Civilianization: Integrating Professional Staff to Advance Modern Policing

July 2024



This publication was supported by the Motorola Solutions Foundation. The points of view expressed herein are the authors' and do not necessarily represent the opinions of the Motorola Solutions Foundation or all Police Executive Research Forum members.

Police Executive Research Forum, Washington, D.C. 20036

Copyright © 2024 by Police Executive Research Forum

All rights reserved

Printed in the United States of America

ISBN: 978-1-934485-77-4

Graphic design by Dave Williams. Cover design by Dustin Waters.

# Contents

A Message from Executive Director Chuck Wexler 1
Acknowledgments4
Executive Summary 6
Information Gathered for this Report10
The Crisis in Law Enforcement Agency Staffing11
What the Numbers Say about Sworn Officer Staffing11
Potential Solutions to the Sworn Staffing Crisis13
What Is "Civilianization"?13
"Professional Staff" 14
Protessional Statt 14
Professional Staff       14         Growth of Civilianization       14         Sidebar: Civilianization in the LAPD       15         Sworn and Professional Staffing       15         by the Numbers       15

#### 

Benefits of Civilianization	18
Challenges of Civilianization	23
<b>Sidebar:</b> The Importance of Municipal Government Support for Civilianization	28

# Commonly Civilianized Positions .... 29

Appendix B: Position Descriptions	29
Community Service Officers	30
Civilian Investigators	31
Analysts	32
Auditors	33
Forensics Personnel	34
Trainers	35

# 

Focusing on the Needs of Sworn Pe	ersonnel 36
Integration of Professional Staff	
Overcoming Opposition to Civiliani	ization 39
Orientation and Training of Professional Staff	40

## 

Prioritize College Graduates 4	2
Work to Improve Retention 4	3
Career Path and Growth Opportunities 4	4

# Civilianization Success Stories ...... 47

Communications Center Manager – Charlotte-Mecklenburg Police Department	47
Community Response Specialists – Salt Lake City Police Department	47
Investigative Specialists – Baltimore Police Department	48

Professional Staff Investigator – Tucson Police Department
Sex Offender Notification Unit – Phoenix Police Department
Third-Party Vendors – New Orleans Police Department
Training Specialists – Baltimore Police Department

## 

Baltimore Police Department	51
Charlotte-Mecklenburg Police Department	53
Chicago Police Department	53
Houston Police Department	54
Milwaukee Police Department	55
Philadelphia Police Department	55
San Jose Police Department	56

# **Evaluating the Results**

of	Civilianization	58	3
----	-----------------	----	---

What Agencies Should Measure	58
Sidebar: RCMP's Audit and Evaluation	
of the Civilian Criminal Investigator Position	59

# 10 Tips for Successful Civilianization ......64

Conclusion71	Conclusion	••••••	71
--------------	------------	--------	----

Appendix A	Interview	Guide	73
------------	-----------	-------	----

# Appendix B: Position Descriptions......75

Background Investigator: San Jose Police Department
Civilian Criminal Investigator: Royal Canadian Mounted Police
Civilian Traffic Investigator: Greensboro (NC) Police Department

Community Engagement Liaison: Orange County (FL) Sheriff's Office
Community Response Specialist: Salt Lake City Police Department
Community Services Officer: San Jose Police Department
Crime Prevention Coordinator: Seattle Police Department
Crime Scene Investigation Lead Specialist: New Orleans Police Department
Information Technology Specialist 2: New York State Police
Investigative Specialist: Baltimore Police Department
Law Enforcement Analyst: Philadelphia Police Department
Police Civilian Investigator: Phoenix Police Department
Police Media Relations Specialist: Mesa Police Department
Police Service Aide: Albuquerque Police Department
Professional Staff Investigator: Tucson Police Department
Quality Assurance Auditor: Albuquerque Police Department
Research and Policy Analyst: Chicago Police Department
Training Officer: Chicago Police Department

## 

## About the Motorola Solutions

Foundation	•••••	104
------------	-------	-----

# A Message from Executive Director Chuck Wexler

#### In his 2001 best-selling book, Good to Great,

Jim Collins made a remarkable discovery about high-performing organizations. His research found that while many leaders first decide where to take the organization and then focus on assembling the people to get it there, truly transformational leaders take a different approach. They focus first on getting "the right people on the bus, the wrong people off the bus, and the right people in the right seats" on the bus.<sup>1</sup> In other words, great leaders assemble their teams before they decide where they should go.

Six years later, PERF published a report on how law enforcement agencies can apply Collins's principles in their organizations, including his advice on how to "get the right people on the bus."<sup>2</sup> Reflecting on our research and discussions from nearly two decades ago, it has become increasingly clear that for many positions in police organizations, the right people on the bus may not always be sworn police officers. Especially today, with the enormous challenges facing policing and the complex tools and technologies at agencies' disposal, the right people on the bus are frequently highly educated, trained, and experienced professional staff members.

In short, the concept of "civilianization" is a natural fit with Jim Collins's formula for great organizations.

Of course, the policing profession has talked about civilianization for decades. And there has



been some progress over the years, as reflected by the law enforcement agencies profiled in this report. But the reality is that many agencies have paid little more than lip-service to civilianizing their workforces. In some cases, agencies have started down the path to civilianization, only to quickly backtrack when budgets became tight or labor organizations balked. Our latest research found that the percentage of professional staff in U.S. police agencies has remained essentially unchanged over the past two decades. So, it would seem the time is right for a renewed push for civilianization in policing.

A quick aside about the terminology used in this report. For years, people have referred to police employees who are not sworn officers as "civilians," as a way to distinguish them from their

Jim Collins, *Good To Great: Why Some Companies Make the Leap and Others Don't*, 2001, Random House Business Books, p. 13.
 PERF, "Good to Great Policing: Application of Business Management Principles in the Public Sector," June 2007, https://www.policeforum.org/assets/docs/Free\_Online\_Documents/Leadership/good%20to%20great%20policing%20-%20application%20of%20 business%20management%20principles%20in%20the%20public%20sector%202007.pdf.

"sworn" colleagues. The use of these terms seems to minimize and undervalue the work of non-sworn employees and sets up a false and unhealthy divide between the two types of employees. As former Philadelphia Police Commissioner Chuck Ramsey was fond of reminding colleagues, before they became police officers, they were "just civilians" too. Ramsey stressed that high-performing police organizations contain a variety of employees from a diversity of backgrounds. Some are sworn officers; others aren't. But everyone, regardless of role or rank, needs to be working together toward a common mission.

As for the language in this report, we chose the term "civilianization" to describe the process of hiring employees who are not police officers, mostly because it's widely known and there doesn't seem to be a better alternative. But when it comes to referring to employees who are not police officers, we use the term "professional staff." Why? Because they are professionals, filling critical roles at a critical time in our profession. Professional staff hold a variety of job titles: Community Services Officer, Crime Prevention Coordinator, Information Technology Specialist, Investigative Specialist, Quality Assurance Auditor, Director of Personnel, Chief of Staff, Assistant to the Police Chief, and Research and Policy Analyst, just to name a few. The sooner we acknowledge that professional staff are indeed professionals and that they are a vital part of policing, the better the profession will become.

The latest push toward civilianization has been driven largely by the predicament many agencies face with their sworn officer staffing. For the past several years, PERF has documented a troubling trend: policing hiring has declined, while both resignations and retirements have increased. Although our latest 2023 survey found these trends appear to be reversing, the reality is that many agencies continue to struggle with having enough officers to fully staff patrol cars, let alone investigative and specialized units. It only makes sense that hiring qualified professional staff for some positions currently held by sworn personnel would allow agencies to move those sworn officers to assignments that require the unique training, skills, and responsibilities of police officers.

But, as outlined in this report, the benefits of civilianization extend far beyond addressing the immediate staffing crisis. Civilianization has the potential to lower costs (for salaries, benefits, and training), improve performance by "getting the right people on the bus, in the right seats," expand the diversity and perspectives of agencies, reduce the burdens and pressures on sworn officers, and improve employee morale overall. This report provides real-life examples from 20 agencies that are working to embrace civilianization. Other agencies can learn from both the obstacles they faced and the successes they achieved.

Of course, there are obstacles and barriers to civilianization. This report highlights many of them: resistance from unions and other labor organizations, skepticism from some elected officials and members of the public, short-term budgetary pressures, and the overall inertia that often comes with tradition and a strong culture like the one in policing. To overcome these and other pitfalls, agencies need to be intentional about civilianization and committed to the process. I hope this report, especially the 10 tips we offer at the end, will help make civilianization easier to successfully implement.

Some final observations: As some of you know, I started my career as a "civilian" in the Boston Police Department. I joined the agency as an intern when I was a graduate student at MIT in the 1970s. The department was in the midst of major reforms led by Commissioner Robert di Grazia, who arrived at the agency as an outsider from the St. Louis County Police Department. Di Grazia brought in a group of outside professional staff who shared his vision and came to be known as the "whiz kids."

One member of the group was Robert Wasserman, an expert on police training and one of the most creative people I've known. He was my boss and mentor when I interned in the academy, and I joined him when he moved to the police commissioner's office. Another member of the group was Gary Hayes, an iconoclast who had worked closely with University of Wisconsin-Madison Professor Herman Goldstein and later became PERF's first executive director. A third whiz kid was Michael Gardner, whose expertise was civil service rules and regulations. Before the 1970s, promotions in the Boston Police Department were based on two factors: the number of years served and knowledge of the "blue book" of Massachusetts laws. Gardner was instrumental in changing these requirements. Instead of memorizing laws, candidates for promotion had to study the principles of modern management practices, personnel administration, and problem solving.

These changes altered the composition of future generations of Boston Police Department leaders. Most notably, Bill Bratton had been planning to leave the agency early in his career because he was disillusioned by the corruption and institutional culture in place at the time. Due to di Grazia's reforms, Bratton stayed with the department and went on to lead six agencies, including the Boston Police Department, the NYPD, and the LAPD. And I became the operations assistant to Boston's police commissioner, where I oversaw the Community Disorders Unit that investigated racially-motivated crime.

I was lucky to be a fly on the wall and learn from di Grazia and the whiz kids. These young professionals, working alongside the sworn command staff, added a critical component to di Grazia's management team. Bratton and I never forgot our experience in Boston, and we carried the lessons learned there throughout our careers.<sup>3</sup> I think every reform-minded police chief should build a leadership team comprised of the best and brightest professionals and sworn personnel. It may sometimes feel like a "team of rivals," but tension can yield amazing results.

Chuck Wester

Chuck Wexler Executive Director

<sup>3.</sup> William J. Bratton and Chuck Wexler, "A Boston police commissioner who transformed the profession," May 3, 2018, https://www0. bostonglobe.com/opinion/2018/05/03/boston-police-commissioner-who-transformed-profession/wWat6v0yM6mGyyvJeYhXQK/ story.html.

# Acknowledgments

#### What makes PERF reports so relevant and

impactful is the input and insights of our members. This report on civilianization is no different. Leaders and staff from 20 law enforcement agencies provided information and other valuable assistance in developing this report. PERF would like to thank the following staff from the agencies that served as case studies:

Albuquerque Police Department – Deputy Director Cara Garcia;

**Aurora (CO) Police Department** – Chief Art Acevedo (former);

Baltimore Police Department – Commissioner Richard Worley, Deputy Commissioner Brian Nadeau, and Major Derek Loeffler;

**Charlotte-Mecklenburg Police Department** – Director Kellie High-Foster and Director Tammy Pippen;

**Chicago Police Department** – Deputy Director Ryan Fitzsimons;

**Greensboro (NC) Police Department** – Chief John Thompson;

Houston Police Department – Executive Assistant Chief Chandra Hatcher;

Los Angeles Police Department – Chief Michel Moore (retired);

**Milwaukee Police Department** – Chief of Staff Heather Hough;

**New Orleans Police Department** – Superintendent Anne Kirkpatrick;

New York State Police – Staff Inspector Armil DeGuzman;

**Orange County (FL) Sheriff's Office** – Undersheriff Mark Canty;

**Philadelphia Police Department** – Associate Chief of Staff Blake Norton;

**Phoenix Police Department** – Commander Sara Garza;

Royal Canadian Mounted Police – Manager Anna-Maria da Silva, Manager Jessica Hearty, and Director Lori Wilkinson;

**Sacramento Police Department** – Deputy Chief Greg Halstead;

**Salt Lake City Police Department** – Chief Mike Brown;

**San Jose Police Department** – Acting Chief Paul Joseph and Division Manager Lisa Perez;

**Seattle Police Department** – Chief Adrian Diaz (former);

**Tucson Police Department** – Captain Colin King.

This is the 49th report in the Critical Issues in Policing series, which PERF has published for more than a quarter-century with the support of Motorola Solutions and the Motorola Solutions Foundation. PERF would like to thank Greg Brown, Motorola Solutions Chairman and CEO; Jack Molloy, Executive Vice President of Products and Sales; Jason Winkler, Executive Vice President and Chief Financial Officer; John Zidar, Senior Vice President, North America Government; Tracy Kimbo, Chief of Staff, Global Enterprise and Channels; Monica Mueller, Vice President of Government Affairs; Shamik Mukherjee, Chief Marketing Officer; Karem Perez, Executive Director of the Motorola Solutions Foundation; Wesley Anne Barden, Manager of Evaluation and Grantmaking at the Foundation; and Matthew Starr, Director of Government Affairs and Privacy Policy.

Many PERF staff contributed to this report. Senior Principal Martin Bartness managed the project, conducted background research, interviewed subject matter experts, and wrote the report. Director Tom Wilson and Deputy Director Jennifer Sommers of the Center for Management and Technical Assistance provided project leadership and guidance. Senior Research Assistant Caleb Regen conducted background research, analyzed data, and assisted with interviews. Research Associate Ashley Richards and Research Consultant Eva Fontaine researched and developed content on program evaluation. Dave Williams designed and laid out the report. Former Executive Editor John Springer, former Editor Kevin Morison, Senior Communications Principal James McGinty, and Communications Associate Dustin Waters edited the report.

# **Executive Summary**

#### For the past several years, the policing

profession has faced a workforce crisis. Hiring of new police officers has slowed, while resignations and retirements have increased. PERF has documented these trends in annual surveys of our members.<sup>4</sup> PERF found that the onset of the COVID-19 pandemic and the widespread protests following the murder of George Floyd by police in Minneapolis only accelerated these trends.

PERF's latest survey did have some encouraging news: Police hiring rebounded in 2023, while resignations and retirements eased.<sup>5</sup> But the crisis in police staffing has by no means disappeared. Many agencies, especially large police departments and sheriffs' offices, continue to be far below their authorized levels, sometimes by hundreds of officers. These agencies are forced to take sometimes drastic measures, such as mandating overtime and canceling days off, just to adequately staff patrol cars and other units.

One potential solution to the workforce crisis in policing is civilianization — the process of hiring trained and skilled professionals to assume some of the roles currently performed by sworn law enforcement officers. This allows officers to be reassigned to duties that require their unique training, skills, and law enforcement responsibilities.

This report provides a roadmap for agencies that are serious about implementing civilianization.

It contemplates civilianization not simply as a shortterm solution to the staffing crisis currently facing many agencies. Rather, it presents civilianization as a long-term strategy for effectively staffing any law enforcement agency, improving performance, and, ultimately, advancing public safety.

Civilianization begins with police leaders rethinking the qualifications that are needed for many positions in their agencies. They are likely to find that while sworn law enforcement authority — the ability to make arrests, carry a firearm, use force, etc. — is needed for the majority of agency positions, it is not required for every one of them. Leaders are also likely to discover that many of the positions that do not require a badge and a gun are currently held by sworn police officers. These are the positions that are ripe for civilianization.

## The Benefits of Civilianization

The benefits of civilianization are many, as outlined in this report. Many of these benefits are not simply "wishful thinking." They are backed up by the reallife experiences of the 20 law enforcement agencies profiled in the report. They have embraced civilianization and have tangible evidence that it works. Here are just a few examples:

Civilianization can free up police officers' time for duties that require their training, skills, and law enforcement responsibilities. The Salt

4. PERF, "New PERF Survey Shows Police Agencies Have Turned a Corner with Staffing Challenges," April 27, 2024, https://www.policeforum.org/staffing2024.

5. Ibid.

Lake City Police Department hired 16 Community Response Specialists to handle a variety of non-emergency calls such as 911 hangups, found property, evidence pickup, traffic hazards, and civil disputes. These specialists go through rigorous training that includes a six-week in-house academy and 10 weeks of field training. During the first 11 months of 2023, they responded to close to 2,500 calls for service. Having these professional staff members allows sworn officers to focus on more serious calls where enforcement powers are essential.

Civilianization can improve service. The New Orleans Police Department (NOPD) found that in addition to hiring professional staff to help refocus the workload of sworn personnel, it could outsource certain law enforcement duties to private companies. Following an extensive pilot program, the NOPD contracted with a third-party vendor to respond to minor traffic accidents. Over the course of a year, it is projected the vendor will respond to roughly 10,000 calls for traffic accidents, the equivalent of approximately 13 sworn officers or 25,000 hours saved. Besides freeing up officers to respond to more urgent calls, this approach means that minor traffic accidents are being handled more promptly and efficiently, which can improve public satisfaction with the police.

Civilianization can bolster productivity. Arizona law requires law enforcement agencies to notify the community within 45 days of a sex offender's registration. The Phoenix Police Department (PPD), which oversees approximately onethird of the registered sex offenders in the state, faced challenges meeting that requirement for 15 years. However, within six months of adding three new professional staff - Police Civilian Investigators to bolster the two Police Assistants already in place — the PPD finally met the state requirement in March 2023. Working alongside a sergeant and two detectives, the new professional staff have not only helped the PPD Sex Offender Notification Unit adhere to the state law; they have also been able to expand community notifications for the highestlevel offenders and digitize more than 20,000 paper files, which will improve efficiency in the future.

Civilianization can lower the costs for some functions. The Baltimore Police Department (BPD) historically faced challenges finding officers who wanted to work in Internal Affairs. So, the department transitioned eight of the sworn detective positions to 10 professional staff positions, called Investigative Specialists. BPD officials cited a practical benefit of this move: lower costs related to salaries, pensions, training, uniforms, and staff turnover. And those cost savings will accrue even as the unit eventually expands by two employees. In addition to saving money, officials have found the four Investigative Specialists hired thus far are excellent writers, are meticulous at sifting through facts, and bring a strong level of objectivity to the job.

**Civilianization can bring stability to key agency roles.** As with many law enforcement agencies, the Charlotte-Mecklenburg Police Department's (CMPD) 911 center was led by a police captain who had extensive police experience but limited understanding of emergency communications. So, the department reclassified the position from Police Captain to Communications Manager and hired an experienced 911 professional to lead the center. The CMPD also hired two other professional staff members to oversee administration and operations.

The three new staff members brought a level of professionalism and harmony to the 911 center. Employee complaints and grievances declined, and both morale and operational efficiency improved. Importantly, civilianization also brought greater leadership stability to this critical function. Instead of rotating in a new sworn official every few years, the CMPD now has a knowledgeable professional who can remain and grow in the role.

**Civilianization can enhance professionalism and quality.** The 2017 consent decree the Baltimore Police Department (BPD) negotiated with the U.S. Department of Justice imposed new training requirements in just about every operational and administrative function within the department. To meet these new training obligations, the BPD hired a group of professional educators to work alongside the sworn personnel in the training academy. They included an academic director, curriculum writers, and law instructors. According to the Consent Decree Monitoring Team, the results were immediate and significant. The team found that the overall quality of instruction had improved as the team brought a renewed focus to scenario-based, problem-solving, and adult-learning techniques.

These are just some of the benefits that civilianization can bring to law enforcement agencies — and just a few examples of how it is working in various agencies. The body of this report explores the benefits in much greater detail (see pp. 18-23) and provides additional examples from agencies that have successfully civilianized positions (see pp. 47-50).

## **Overcoming Challenges** to Civilianization

Civilianization is not without its challenges. This report outlines many of the barriers and obstacles that agencies can expect as they work to implement civilianization in a meaningful way (see pp. 23-27). These include resistance from labor organizations, an organizational culture that has often viewed professional staff as second-class employees, and budgetary pressures. When budgets are tight, mayors and city council members often insist that cuts to professional staff come before cuts to sworn hiring or other costs, even if those decisions end up taking officers from the street in order to backfill administrative positions.

To help overcome these obstacles, it is critical that agencies be able to evaluate the effectiveness of their civilianization efforts. Evaluations must include more than cost savings, although in many instances, cost will be a key factor that municipal leaders will want to examine. However, agencies should also look at changes to their operational efficiency. Is the response time to calls for service improving? Are more crimes being solved? Is crime decreasing? Has community satisfaction with the police improved? Has internal morale gotten better? This report offers a guide for agencies on what variables they should identify and how to go about measuring them (see pp. 58-63).

## **10 Tips to Ensure Success**

The report concludes with "10 Tips" for agencies that are serious about civilianization, whether they are just beginning the process or want to expand and improve their current efforts. These tips cover the gamut of issues that agencies need to consider.

- 1. **Call Civilians "Professional Staff."** The language agencies use matters. Calling non-sworn employees "professional staff," instead of "civilians," sends the message that they are welcomed and valued members of the agency.
- 2. Adopt Civilianization as an Organizational Best Practice. To be successful, agencies should not look at civilianization as a one-off or shortterm process to get through an immediate crisis (such as the current sworn staffing emergency). Civilianization works best when agencies make a long-term, organizational commitment to the practice.
- 3. **Develop a Comprehensive Implementation Strategy.** Civilianization will have a greater chance of success if agencies carefully think through the desired benefits and the anticipated obstacles, and then develop a wide-ranging implementation plan.
- 4. Set Ambitious Goals. Articulating ambitious goals for civilianization sends the message internally that the agency is serious about the process. It also lets key external stakeholders including prospective employees know that professional staff are viewed as a critical part of the agency.
- 5. **Prepare for Internal Resistance.** As noted throughout this report, agencies can expect some resistance to their civilianization plans from current employees. To help overcome any opposition, agencies should be up-front about their plans, communicate with existing staff, and seek their ideas and input.
- 6. Treat Professional Staff as Equals to Sworn Staff. Sworn police officers and professional staff play different roles in every law enforcement agency, but both groups contribute to an agency's success. And while their pay structures

and retirement systems may differ, police leaders need to ensure that professional staff are treated equitably and fairly when it comes to issues such as training opportunities, quality supervision, and awards and recognition.

- 7. **Provide Career Growth Opportunities.** One of the reasons agencies often have trouble retaining qualified professional staff is that they do not have clear career growth and advancement opportunities. For civilianization to succeed, agencies need to create promotional and career development opportunities for their professional staff.
- 8. **Prioritize College Students and Recent Graduates.** In today's highly competitive job market, many college students and recent graduates may not even be aware of the professional job opportunities available in law enforcement agencies. Agency recruiters and leaders need to focus on targeting these populations through internships (such as PERF's program with Historically Black Colleges and Universities), career fairs, and other outreach. This is especially important for filling highly specialized positions in information technology, data analysis, and forensics.
- 9. Offer the Most Competitive Compensation Possible. Law enforcement agencies can't solve every problem by throwing money at it, and budgetary practicalities often limit their ability to vie with private industry for the most highly credentialed professional staff. But offering competitive salaries and other incentives is as essential for recruiting and retaining talented professional staff as it is for police officers.
- 10. **Evaluate Implementation.** Agencies will gain support for civilianization if they are able to demonstrate that it works. Evaluating how civilianization affects costs, performance, public support, and employee morale is critical to getting both internal audiences and external stakeholders to back civilianization efforts.

The foundation of this report lies in the experiences of the 20 law enforcement agencies PERF studied. Each had a slightly different focus for its civilianization strategy; they targeted different positions and had different goals. Each went about implementation in different ways. But there was a common takeaway from all their experiences: Civilianization is successful when an agency commits to the process and carries it out in thoughtful, strategic, and creative ways. These organizations' experiences, stumbles, and successes are something from which every agency can learn.

# **Information Gathered for this Report**

#### To understand how police departments and

sheriffs' offices are using civilianization to address the crisis in sworn staffing, maximize scarce financial and personnel resources, and improve organizational performance, PERF conducted extensive background research and interviews. This included reviews of agencies' staffing studies, trade and academic literature on civilianization, and interviews with officials from 20 law enforcement agencies. The officials interviewed — all from midsized or large agencies — offered valuable insights into how their agencies have employed and assimilated professional staff. (The names of these officials are included in the Acknowledgments — see p. 4.) The guide PERF used to facilitate the interviews is in Appendix A. PERF also featured the topic of civilianization at its 2024 annual meeting in Orlando, Florida. Attended by over 200 chiefs, sheriffs, law enforcement executives, researchers, and industry leaders, Executive Director Chuck Wexler kicked off the afternoon's town hall session with a robust discussion about how agencies are increasing their numbers of professional staff, integrating them into the organization's culture, and overcoming sworn resistance. The attendees' contributions are reflected in this report.

# The Crisis in Law Enforcement Agency Staffing

# What the Numbers Say about Sworn Officer Staffing

PERF has extensively researched and reported on the sworn officer staffing crisis facing U.S. law enforcement agencies. We have identified a "triple threat" in officer recruitment and retention: 1) fewer people applying to become police officers; 2) more officers leaving their departments well before reaching retirement age; and 3) more current officers becoming eligible for retirement.<sup>6</sup> The causes of this crisis — a strong job market, competition among police agencies for officers, negative public perceptions and media portrayals of police, the COVID-19 pandemic, and generational differences in career ambitions and work-life balance — continue to fuel the threat.<sup>7</sup> In fact, the protracted nature of the crisis has led the Bureau of Justice Assistance and the Office of Community Oriented Policing Services (COPS Office) to contemplate whether agencies should reexamine their "foundational organizational structure and processes to more clearly and easily meet the needs and expectations of both law enforcement and the community."<sup>8</sup>

In April 2023, PERF reported the results of its annual staffing survey, which "show[ed] police agencies are losing officers faster than they can hire new ones" — with total sworn staffing declining by nearly 5 percent over the previous three years.<sup>9</sup> Some agencies have been hit especially hard. In the Minneapolis Police Department, the number of sworn officers fell by roughly 38 percent between 2019 and 2024.<sup>10</sup> In the Seattle Police Department, staffing is at its lowest level since the 1990s, with the loss of nearly half its officers in the past five years.<sup>11, 12</sup> The New Orleans Police Department experienced a 24 percent decrease in the number of officers between 2018 and 2023.<sup>13</sup> The number

<sup>6.</sup> Police Executive Research Forum, "The Workforce Crisis, and What Police Agencies Are Doing About It," September 2019, https://www.policeforum.org/assets/WorkforceCrisis.pdf; "Responding to the Staffing Crisis: Innovations in Recruitment and Retention," August 2023, https://www.policeforum.org/assets/RecruitmentRetention.pdf.

<sup>7.</sup> PERF, "Responding to the Staffing Crisis."

<sup>8.</sup> Bureau of Justice Assistance and Office of Community Oriented Policing Services, "Recruitment and Retention for the Modern Law Enforcement Agency," 2023, https://portal.cops.usdoj.gov/resourcecenter/content.ashx/cops-r1136-pub.pdf.

<sup>9.</sup> Police Executive Research Forum, "New PERF Survey Shows Police Agencies Are Losing Officers Faster Than They Can Hire New Ones," April 1, 2023, https://www.policeforum.org/staffing2023.

<sup>10.</sup> Jay Kolls, "Minneapolis City Council Wants Update on MPD Staffing Recommendations," KSTP-TV, March 3, 2024, https://kstp.com/kstp-news/top-news/minneapolis-city-council-wants-update-on-mpd-staffing-recommendations/.

<sup>11.</sup> Conner Board, "Seattle Police Department Reaches Lowest Staffing Level In 30 Years," KING-TV, March 12, 2024, https://www.king5.com/article/news/local/seattle-police-staffing-shortage-action-needed-councilmembers-say/281-c3f43855-f877-4ba9-a37b-aeaf27e1ec67.

<sup>12.</sup> Amy Radil, "To Ease Seattle Police Shortage, City Looks to Speed Up Hiring Process," April 11, 2024, https://www.kuow.org/stories/ seattle-looks-to-speed-up-hiring-process-to-ease-police-shortage.

<sup>13.</sup> Letter from Edward Michel, Inspector General, New Orleans Office of Inspector General to Michelle Woodfork, Interim Superintendent of Police, New Orleans Police Department, August 17, 2023, https://nolaoig.gov/wp-content/uploads/2023/08/NOPD-Recruitment-and-Retention-Public-Release.pdf.

of full-duty officers in the San Francisco Police Department dropped approximately 19 percent between 2017 and 2023.<sup>14</sup> And the Philadelphia Police Department has roughly 1,000 fewer officers than the 6,400 authorized.<sup>15</sup>

There are signs of a potential turnaround, however. "For the first time since the start of the pandemic," PERF's 2024 annual survey of over 700 agencies "reported a year-over-year increase in total sworn staffing. Responding agencies reported hiring more sworn officers in 2023 than in any of the previous four years. Agencies saw fewer resignations in 2023 than they did in 2021 or 2022, ... [a]nd retirements dropped back down to roughly where they



were in 2019 after being elevated for the previous three years."16 Nevertheless, large agencies continue to struggle, with sworn staffing still nearly 5 percent below where it was in January 2020.<sup>17</sup> PERF's survey results reflect employment data published by the FBI in May 2024, which, as crime analyst Jeff Asher wrote, "shows that many agencies still shrank in terms of officer counts in 2023, especially in big cities, but the trend was less negative for departments in 2023 than it has been in a few years."18



14. Joe Eskenazi and Will Jarrett, "Yes, The SFPD Has A Staffing Crisis," Mission Local, March 13, 2023, https://missionlocal.org/2023/03/police-staffing-crisis-san-francisco/.

16. PERF, "New PERF Survey Shows Police Agencies Have Turned a Corner with Staffing Challenges," April 27, 2024, https://www.policeforum.org/staffing2024.

#### 17. Ibid.

18. Jeff Asher, "Police Departments Shrank Less In 2023," May 20, 2024, https://jasher.substack.com/p/police-departments-shrank-less-in.

<sup>15.</sup> Joe Holden and Will Kenworthy, "Philadelphia Police Department Is Down Nearly 1,000 Officers, Investigation Shows," CBS News Philadelphia, November 9, 2023, https://www.cbsnews.com/philadelphia/news/philadelphia-police-department-down-officers-investigation/.



## Potential Solutions to the Sworn Staffing Crisis

Stakeholders have written extensively about the sworn staffing crisis, recommending a wide range of solutions for agencies to consider: reexamine eligibility and hiring practices; market the profession more strategically and realistically; leverage technology; reimagine academy training and focus on the quality of field training; reevaluate benefits and incentives; elevate work-life balance and officer wellness; prioritize diversity, equity, and inclusion; build a strong and healthy organizational culture; work to repair law enforcement's tarnished image through community outreach; and create career pathways for youth and college students.<sup>19</sup>

Another potential solution, which has received much less attention, is civilianization.

## What Is "Civilianization"?

"Civilianization" in law enforcement typically refers to one or more of the following:

- 1. "Efforts to fill jobs currently held by sworn personnel with non-sworn personnel."<sup>20</sup>
- "Identif[ying] existing or new work duties that may be handled by civilians rather than sworn officers."<sup>21</sup>
- "Build[ing] staff capacity in the department on a parallel path to adding police officers and maximiz[ing] limited sworn personnel resources."22
- 4. "Shifting some administrative, investigative, and reporting work from sworn officers to civilian employees in police departments."<sup>23</sup>

For examples, see Bureau of Justice Assistance and Office of Community Oriented Policing Services (COPS Office), "Recruitment and Retention for the Modern Law Enforcement Agency," 2023, https://bja.ojp.gov/doc/recruitment-retention-modern-le-agency.pdf; International Association of Chiefs of Police, "The State of Recruitment: A Crisis for Law Enforcement," 2019, https://www.theiacp. org/sites/default/files/239416\_IACP\_RecruitmentBR\_HR\_0.pdf; Police Executive Research Forum, "Responding to the Staffing Crisis: Innovations In Recruitment and Retention," August 2023, https://www.policeforum.org/assets/RecruitmentRetention.pdf.
 PERF and Justex System, Inc., "Houston Police Department: Operational Staffing Model," May 2014, https://www.houstontx.gov/ council/committees/pshs/20140602/workdemand.pdf.

<sup>21.</sup> Baltimore Police Department, "Civilianization," accessed March 4, 2024, https://www.baltimorepolice.org/civilianization. 22. *Ibid.* 

<sup>23.</sup> City of San Diego, Office of the City Auditor, "Performance Audit of SDPD Overtime," February 2024, https://www.sandiego.gov/sites/default/files/2024-02/24-08\_performance\_audit\_sdpd\_ot.pdf.



Chief Mike Brown, Salt Lake City Police Department (FAR LEFT) Deputy Chief Greg Halstead, Sacramento (CA) Police Department (LEFT)

- "Assigning non-sworn (civilian) employees to conduct police work that does not require the authority, special training, or credibility of a sworn police officer."<sup>24</sup>
- Reassigning police officers whose duties are now performed by civilians to other work in the organization "based on their skills, experience, and work status."<sup>25</sup>

The term "civilianization" in this report refers to one or more of these actions. The concept involves putting the most qualified people in the myriad positions within a police organization and ensuring agencies are reserving sworn police officers for the jobs that require their unique training, skill sets, and authorities.

## "Professional Staff"

Research has found police agencies are vulnerable to divisions between sworn and civilian personnel that can erode morale and hinder organizational cohesion.<sup>26</sup> In light of these divisions, some agencies refer to "civilian" or "non-sworn" employees as "professional staff," a term that uplifts the value of these employees and reduces the likelihood of creating an organizational rift by subordinating a class of personnel.

Salt Lake City Police Chief Mike Brown identified this as an important issue. "We don't call personnel sworn versus non-sworn," he said. "Civilians are extremely important to what we do, and we value them greatly. They're a professional staff, and we couldn't do the job we do here and serve our community without them."

**Deputy Chief Greg Halstead of the Sacramento (CA) Police Department** agreed: "You hear a lot of agencies refer to professional staff as civilians, but we transitioned our terminology about four or five years ago, to really help make them feel more included."

## **Growth of Civilianization**

According to the COPS Office, professional staff have played an essential role in law enforcement agencies since the 1930s, with "the number and proportion of civilian employees steadily increasing . . . through the 1970s and 1980s."<sup>27</sup> Both the President's Commission on Law Enforcement and Administration of Justice (1967) and the National Advisory Commission on Criminal Justice Standards and

<sup>24.</sup> Charlotte-Mecklenburg Police Department, "2021 Charlotte-Mecklenburg Police Department Civilianization Opportunities," December 30, 2020.

<sup>25.</sup> Declan Sullivan and Alaynah Tombridge, "Civilianization in the Philadelphia Police Department," Fels Institute of Government, August 2021, https://www.documentcloud.org/documents/23118177-civilianization-in-the-ppd.

<sup>26.</sup> Paul Bentley, "Objectification of the Subject through the Exercise of Power: An Ethnographical Inquiry of Power in an American Policing Organization," PhD dissertation, Arizona State University, 2013. In John Kiedrowski *et al.*, "The Civilianization of Police in Canada," Public Safety Canada, 2015, https://www.publicsafety.gc.ca/cnt/rsrcs/pblctns/2015-r042/2015-r042/2015-r042.

<sup>27.</sup> William R. King and Jeremy M. Wilson, "Integrating Civilian Staff Into Police Agencies," COPS Office, December 2014, https://portal.cops.usdoj.gov/resourcecenter/content.ashx/cops-p290-pub.pdf.

# **Civilianization in the LAPD**

Reflecting on his 40-year career, recently retired Police Chief and former PERF Board Member Michel Moore recounted how the Los Angeles Police Department integrated a growing number of professional staff into the organization over several decades.

We began civilianization in its earliest form back in the '70s. We took what was previously parking and traffic control away from the police department and gave it to the department of transportation, thereby civilianizing the role. In the '80s and '90s, we established what was called a police service representative, where professional civilians would handle front-desk services and other administrative tasks that had been done by police officers. And from the 2010s to the present, we professionalized our crime analysis function so that people who are doing crime analysis work would be trained specifically in that field of study. Now, with the onset of body worn video and digital car video, professional staff are doing audits and inspections of those recordings for compliance with department operations.



Former Chief Michel Moore, Los Angeles Police Department

Goals (1973) encouraged increased civilianization in areas such as communications, planning, and laboratory work, believing these tasks "could often be performed better by civilians with specialized training than by sworn police officers."<sup>28</sup>

Those recommendations still make sense today. As the International Association of Chiefs of Police (IACP) has written,

> The efficiency and effectiveness of law enforcement agencies is enhanced when sworn and non-sworn personnel are appropriately used to perform those functions that are best suited to their special knowledge, skills[,] and abilities. Therefore, . . . agenc[ies] shall employ civilians for selected functions

that do not require the authority of a commissioned officer, thereby freeing sworn personnel for enforcement functions and capitalizing upon the talents of all employees.<sup>29</sup>

# Sworn and Professional Staffing by the Numbers

The Bureau of Justice Statistics reported in 2020 that professional staff accounted for one-third of the more than one million full-time personnel in general-purpose state and local law enforcement agencies (Table 1).<sup>30</sup> While that number may seem high at first glance, the reality is that the percentage of professional staff in U.S. agencies has not changed appreciably in the past two decades.

<sup>28.</sup> John Kiedrowski *et al.*, "The Civilianization of Police In Canada," Public Safety Canada, 2017, https://www.publicsafety.gc.ca/cnt/rsrcs/pblctns/2015-r042/index-en.aspx.

<sup>29.</sup> International Association of Chiefs of Police, "Civilian Personnel," October 1993, https://www.theiacp.org/resources/policy-center-resource/civilian-personnel.

<sup>30.</sup> Sean E. Goodison, "Local Police Departments Personnel, 2020," Bureau of Justice Statistics, November 2022, https://bjs.ojp.gov/ sites/g/files/xyckuh236/files/media/document/lpdp20.pdf.

Type of Agency	Total	Sworn	Sworn %	Professional	Professional %
Local Police	598,620	473,102	79%	125,518	21%
Sheriff's Office	364,533	173,899	48%	190,634	52%
Primary State	92,866	61,153	66%	31,733	34%
Total	1,056,038	708,153	67%	347,885	33%

# Table 1: Full-time personnel in general-purpose state and local law enforcement agencies, by type of agency, 2020

Source: Bureau of Justice Statistics

Personnel composition varies significantly among agency types. In local police departments, which include general-purpose law enforcement agencies such as municipal, county, and regional police departments, professional staff comprised approximately 21-23 percent of all personnel in every year studied from 2007 to 2020 (Table 2). By contrast, professional staff accounted for 52 percent of personnel in sheriffs' offices<sup>31</sup> and 34 percent in "primary state" and highway patrol agencies in 2020 (Table 3).<sup>32</sup> Given the recent challenges of recruiting and retaining sworn personnel, it makes sense for local police departments to work at increasing the share of professional staff in the coming years.

There is no single "appropriate" ratio of sworn personnel to professional staff in a law enforcement agency. Both categories of personnel are essential to effective management and organizational performance, and mixing the two groups to handle some functions often makes sense. As Acting Chief Paul Joseph of the San Jose Police Department noted in explaining his agency's need for information technology expertise, "We have sworn personnel assigned to the Bureau of Technical Services to chime in on discussions, because the techies don't understand our jobs. And the cops don't understand tech all that well, but they know police work. You have to have a marriage of the two."

Agencies with fewer professional staff would be well served to examine the reasons why and explore opportunities for hiring more of them. In the Philadelphia Police Department (PPD), for example, professional staff made up only 10.3 percent of total personnel in 2021,<sup>33</sup> a stark contrast to all agencies serving more than one million people, where professional staff make up 24.5 percent of total personnel.<sup>34</sup> In the Baltimore Police Department (BPD), professional staff comprised 13.6 percent of total personnel, well below the national average of 21 percent among local law enforcement agencies.<sup>35</sup> And in the Houston Police Department

<sup>31.</sup> Ibid.

<sup>32.</sup> Primary state and highway patrol agencies "are distinct from special-purpose agencies, sheriffs' offices with jail and court duties only, and federal law enforcement agencies. Primary state law enforcement agencies operate at the state level and may perform highway patrol, conduct statewide investigations, assist local and county police agencies with matters extending beyond their jurisdictions, and provide primary coverage in areas with no local or county police services." Connor Brooks, "Primary State Law Enforcement Agencies: Personnel, 2020," Bureau of Justice Statistics, January 2024, Primary State Law Enforcement Agencies Personnel, 2020 (ojp.gov).

<sup>33.</sup> Declan Sullivan and Alaynah Tombridge, "Civilianization in the Philadelphia Police Department," Fels Institute of Government, August 2021, https://www.documentcloud.org/documents/23118177-civilianization-in-the-ppd.

<sup>34.</sup> Sean E. Goodison, "Local Police Departments Personnel, 2020," Bureau of Justice Statistics, November 2022, https://bjs.ojp.gov/sites/g/files/xyckuh236/files/media/document/lpdp20.pdf.

<sup>35.</sup> Police Foundation, "Baltimore Police Department Staffing Study," August 2018. The study, which also references the 2017 report discussed here, can be found in *United States of America v. Baltimore Police Department, et al.*, "Notice of Approval of Staffing Study Under Paragraph 428 of the Consent Decree," https://www.documentcloud.org/documents/5691880-Baltimore-PoliceFoundation-Staffing-Study-2018.

(HPD), professional staff (including cadets) made up roughly 16.4 percent of total personnel.<sup>36</sup>

To address these staffing disparities, all three agencies have undertaken staffing studies to identify opportunities for civilianization (see pp. 51-57). The PPD has struggled to implement its civilianization plans due to collective bargaining practices and the historical resistance to assign professional staff to jobs that have traditionally been filled by police officers. The HPD has experienced setbacks because of budget cuts that have forced it to choose between cutting professional staff or police officer positions. Meanwhile, BPD has increased its composition of professional staff to 21 percent — an amount equal to the national average of local police departments.

Year	Total	Sworn	Sworn %	Professional	Professional %
1997	531,313	419,996	79%	111,317	21%
2000	564,611	440,770	78%	128,874	23%
2003	580,749	451,737	78%	129,013	22%
2007	601,027	463,147	77%	137,880	23%
2013	604,959	477,317	79%	127,642	21%
2016	599,548	468,274	78%	131,274	22%
2020	598,620	473,102	79%	125,518	21%

#### Table 2: Full-time personnel in local police departments, 1997 – 2020

Source: Bureau of Justice Statistics

Table 3: Full-time	personnel in	primary	y state law	enforcement	agencies,	1997 – 2020

Year	Total	Sworn	Sworn %	Professional	Professional %
1997	82,261	54,206	66%	28,055	34%
2000	87,028	56,348	65%	30,680	35%
2003	82,419	57,611	70%	24,808	30%
2007	99,135	64,872	65%	34,263	35%
2013	88,160	58,131	66%	30,029	34%
2016	91,097	59,645	65%	31,452	35%
2020	92,886	61,153	66%	31,733	34%

Source: Bureau of Justice Statistics

36. Yilun Chung, "Houston's Record \$1 Billion Police Budget Still Isn't Enough to Fix Officer Shortages, Officials Say," *Houston Chronicle*, May 22, 2023, https://www.houstonchronicle.com/politics/houston/article/houston-s-1b-police-budget-won-t-fill-staff-18108477.php.

# Benefits and Challenges of Civilianization

## **Benefits of Civilianization**

"Increased civilianization in police departments brings myriad benefits to organizational efficiency, cost effectiveness, culture, and professionalism," according to the National Policing Institute.<sup>37</sup> Civilianization can help address the sworn staffing crisis and has the potential to transform how agencies provide police services.

#### **Reduced Burdens on Sworn Personnel**

A harsh consequence of the staffing crisis is an increased workload on a smaller workforce. Far too often, officers are mandated to work overtime to fill empty patrol cars and investigate new cases. This potentially leads to fatigue, intrudes on personal time, compromises health and safety, diminishes performance, and contributes to turnover. Fortunately, professional staff can help reduce the burden on sworn personnel by performing non-enforcement duties currently handled by police officers. Furthermore, civilianization can serve as a force multiplier by moving sworn officers from administrative roles to enforcement activities, where their skills and training can be applied more effectively.<sup>38</sup>

New Orleans Police Superintendent Anne Kirkpatrick explains, "When you're down hundreds of officers, how do you relieve the 911 call-for-service load? Well, we civilianize some of the functions, and we call that burden-reduction."

In the Albuquerque Police Department, "Civilianization was a way for the city to say, 'This is how we're going to try to resolve some of those issues,'" according to Deputy Director Cara Garcia. "We were adding a lot of positions, but there were no sworn positions being eliminated. It addressed the union's largest concerns, which were staffing shortages in the field and officer safety."

Providing professional staff support is essential for the health and well-being of sworn personnel and for providing quality public service. For example, when agencies cut investigative units due to sworn staffing shortages, detectives are vulnerable to cutting corners, creating workarounds, treating victims poorly, and making mistakes. Reducing the workload of sworn personnel through civilianization not only wards off attrition but also helps protect an agency from these kinds of performancerelated risks.

Former Seattle Police Chief Adrian Diaz sees this issue clearly:

Most of my detectives [were]... so overworked. They [couldn't] respond to new cases and simultaneously build probable cause for cases they received a couple of days or weeks ago. So, why shouldn't I hire retired detectives

<sup>37.</sup> National Police Institute (formerly the National Police Foundation), "Baltimore Police Department Staffing Study," August 2018, https://www.documentcloud.org/documents/5691880-Baltimore-PoliceFoundation-Staffing-Study-2018.

<sup>38.</sup> Charlotte-Mecklenburg Police Department, "2021 Charlotte-Mecklenburg Police Department Civilianization Opportunities," December 30, 2020.



Chief John Thompson, Greensboro (NC) Police Department (FAR LEFT)

Greensboro (NC) PD Motorist Assistance Patrol Vehicle (LEFT)

or other civilians to interview victims and witnesses and file the paperwork the court needs?

#### More Effective Use of Sworn Staff

When the Greensboro (NC) Police Department (GPD) partnered with a national research organization to consider what they could be doing differently within the national conversation around police reform, they discovered (through an analysis of 911 calls for service) that officers spent approximately 20,000 hours per year handling automobile crashes. Thus, as GPD Chief John Thompson explains, the impetus to civilianize the department's response to traffic accidents wasn't a sworn staffing crisis. Rather, the call-for-service data compelled him to think about how police officers could more usefully spend their time.

Two other cities in North Carolina had already obtained a change in state law to allow professional staff to conduct traffic investigations in their jurisdictions; Greensboro successfully lobbied lawmakers to provide this authority statewide. With the new law in effect, GPD planned to hire, train, and deploy five new professional traffic investigators in the first quarter of 2024, which would dramatically reduce the call burden on sworn personnel and allow officers to focus on other priorities.

#### **Specialized Skills and Improved Performance**

It is widely recognized that "civilians bring specialized skills or formal training that regular sworn officers might not possess, such as engineering, legal, or scientific training."<sup>39</sup> However, for a host of reasons — including organizational culture, job security, budget cuts, union resistance, and officers' desire to remain in coveted administrative positions with better work hours — many agencies have not fully realized the potential benefits of civilianization.

Agency staffing studies have consistently found that "Many law enforcement agencies use sworn officers to perform tasks that could be better performed by professional nonsworn staff. ... [And] when sworn personnel are used for administrative tasks, the agency underutilizes the skills and training that has been invested into sworn officers."<sup>40</sup> By using sworn generalists rather than professional experts to fill critical positions in specialized assignments like finance, information technology, evidence management, training, and forensic analysis, agencies are potentially compromising excellence.

In explaining his reasoning for hiring professional staff, Salt Lake City Police Chief Mike Brown says, "We've looked at it from the perspective of putting the right people in the right roles, for the right reasons, at the right time. Just like the corporate

39. William R. King and Jeremy M. Wilson, "Integrating Civilian Staff Into Police Agencies," COPS Office, 2014, https://www.researchgate.net/publication/272480179\_Integrating\_Civilian\_Staff\_into\_Police\_Agencies.

<sup>40.</sup> Alexander Weiss Consulting, LLC, "Baltimore Police Department Staffing Plan," February 26, 2020, https://public.powerdms.com/BALTIMOREMD/documents/652754.

world, we're looking for precision and expertise at all levels. And to achieve that, we need a diversified portfolio of employees."<sup>41</sup>

Tammy Pippen, a professional staff member and Director of the Charlotte-Mecklenburg Police Department's (CMPD) Human Resources Division, told PERF:

> One of the things we do all too frequently is put police officers in positions that they're not qualified for. For instance, in crime scene, we had someone who had a degree and certifications that the sergeants did not have. I remember the sergeant saying to me when we were creating the job description, 'She's more qualified for the position to be supervisor than I am.' In another agency I worked for, we had a major over budgeting and accounting who didn't have an accounting degree, or even a degree. I think since CMPD has started putting qualified civilians in positions that they have been professionally trained for we have seen success and continuity. So that's why I think there hasn't been pushback to what we're doing now: You can't argue with qualifications, education, and experience.



Director Tammy Pippen, Charlotte-Mecklenburg (NC) Police Department

For similar reasons, when the Albuquerque Police Department agreed to a consent decree with the Department of Justice, one of its first actions was to hire professional staff to work as auditors alongside detectives in the Inspections Unit. Since then, according to Deputy Director of Compliance and Oversight Cara Garcia, the agency's use of professional staff has "increased dramatically."

#### **Lower Costs**

Professional staff in some positions, such as those requiring technical expertise or advanced degrees, may have higher salaries than sworn staff. But research has found that "most civilian positions are less expensive than sworn officers in terms of salary, retirement, and benefits in the long run."42 For example, a 2023 staffing study of the Milwaukee Police Department estimated that sworn salaries are "upward of 50 percent more" than the salaries of professional staff.<sup>43</sup> A report from the San Jose City Auditor on civilianization possibilities in the police department found that "The estimated annual cost difference between having sworn personnel in the 88 positions we identified versus civilian staff is about \$5.1 million."44 And according to Staff Inspector Armil DeGuzman of the New York State Police, the agency could hire Information Technology Specialists at a starting salary of \$61,270 to fix computers in patrol cars, whereas a veteran state trooper doing the same job "is probably making over \$100,000 before any type of overtime," not to mention the trooper's costlier pension and health care benefits and uniform and equipment expenses.

41. PERF wrote about getting "the right people on the bus, in the right roles," in its adaption of Jim Collins' management classic, "Good To Great: Why Some Companies Make the Leap and Others Don't." See "'Good to Great' Policing: Application of Business Management Principles in the Public Sector," June 2007, https://www.policeforum.org/assets/docs/Free\_Online\_Documents/Leadership/good%20 to%20great%20policing%20-%20application%20of%20business%20management%20principles%20in%20the%20public%20sector%20 2007.pdf.

42. Charlotte-Mecklenburg Police Department.

43. Deirdre Rockefeller-Ramsey, "The New Era of Law Enforcement: Civilianization," Police1, October 2, 2023, https://www.police1. com/police-recruiting/articles/the-new-era-of-law-enforcement-civilianization-jduO3jGF8MnIsa3Q/.

44. City of San Jose, Office of the City Auditor, "Audit of Civilianization Opportunities in the San Jose Police Department," January 2010, https://www.sanjoseca.gov/Home/ShowDocument?id=33700.



Staff Inspector Armil DeGuzman, New York State Police (FAR LEFT)

IT Specialist Mark Williams, New York State Police (LEFT)

#### **Reduced Overtime**

As departments continue to experience staffing shortages, they are increasingly relying on overtime to fill the gaps in their ranks. The Minneapolis Police Department has increased their overtime payments from \$5.2 million in 2019 to \$21.1 million in 2023 — nearly a 300 percent increase.<sup>45</sup> Likewise, the Montgomery County (MD) Police Department saw a 54 percent increase in overtime hours from 2022 to 2023 to make up for its 14 percent sworn vacancy rate.<sup>46</sup>

Even though it takes time to advertise positions and hire and onboard professional staff, civilianization of certain sworn positions can help reduce overtime spending. An audit of the San Diego Police Department's (SDPD) overtime spending concluded that "overtime costs are primarily due to staffing needs" and that "more civilian positions could help reduce overtime costs and improve response times."<sup>47</sup> For example, the audit found professional staff who hold the position of Police Investigative Service Officer (PISO) could have handled approximately 13 percent of SDPD's calls for service. However, because "PISO positions currently represent only about 1.4 percent of SDPD's budgeted sworn officer staffing," sworn officers are needed to respond to some of those calls on overtime.<sup>48</sup>

#### **Role Stability**

Sworn personnel frequently move between assignments. They get promoted, injured, or involuntarily transferred; they seek new roles and experiences; and they retire. This routine turnover is a challenge for law enforcement agencies because many sworn personnel lack the requisite knowledge and skill to quickly meet performance expectations in specialized assignments. There is also a steep learning curve for officers who take on assignments in units such as training, media relations, crime scene, audits, human resources, finance, crime analysis, and information technology.

Alternatively, agencies can hire professional staff specifically for their education and experience in these roles and create career paths to promote stability and longevity within their areas of expertise. For example, a 2022 report by researchers at the RAND Corporation and PERF addressed the benefits of hiring professional

48. Ibid.

<sup>45.</sup>Jay Kolls, "Minneapolis police overtime climbs to \$21 million in 2023", KSTP-TV, March 2024, https://kstp.com/kstp-news/top-news/minneapolis-police-overtime-climbs-to-21-million-in-2023/.

<sup>46.</sup> Courtney Cohn, "County police department facing highest vacancy rate of sworn officers in 10 years", Moco360, March 2024, https://moco360.media/2024/03/19/county-police-department-facing-highest-vacancy-rate-of-sworn-officers-in-10-years/.

<sup>47.</sup> City of San Diego, Office of the City Auditor, "Performance Audit of SDPD Overtime," February 2024, https://www.sandiego.gov/ sites/default/files/2024-02/24-08\_performance\_audit\_sdpd\_ot.pdf. https://www.sandiego.gov/sites/default/files/2024-02/ 24-08\_performance\_audit\_sdpd\_ot.pdf.

staff with a background in media relations as law enforcement public information officers:

The purpose of this shift to civilian employees [is] to open the position to a larger pool of individuals specifically trained in the talents that are important for a PIO, including the interpersonal skills necessary to regularly interact with diverse groups, the organizational skills necessary to coordinate multiple schedules and projects, the problem-solving skills necessary to manage sensitive and controversial topics, and the communication skills necessary to effectively write and speak in public. ... Moreover, it may be more straightforward to find civilians who are willing and able to bring a long-term commitment to the role than it would be to find sworn officers. Sometimes it can also be more effective for the public to see a nonsworn staff member (e.g., an outsider from the community's perspective).49

#### **Simpler HR Process**

Professional staff are recognized as being "easier to hire, transfer, and even fire" than sworn personnel.<sup>50</sup> In the hiring stage, police officer applicants are required to take civil service, physical fitness, medical, drug, and psychological exams. These tests are often waived or modified for prospective professional staff, which makes for a faster and less intrusive process. Likewise, the background investigation process is often less demanding for professional staff than for sworn personnel.

Former Baltimore Police Commissioner Michael Harrison commented on this when announcing the creation of Investigative Specialist Former Baltimore Police Commissioner Michael Harrison



positions: "The new civilian investigator positions ... still require background investigations but allows us to hire at a much faster pace."<sup>51</sup> The separation process, if contested, is also typically less pro-tracted for professional staff who do not have the bargained rights that sworn personnel have gained over many years of labor negotiations.

#### **Greater Diversity of Personnel**

Another benefit of civilianization is the opportunity to hire professional staff who more closely reflect the population being served than is currently represented by sworn personnel. According to Alexander Weiss Consulting, gaining access to a diverse pool of professional talent "can support progress towards diversity and inclusion goals and potentially improve community relations"52 by building an organization that socioeconomically and demographically reflects the population it serves. It stands to reason that the public will be more inclined to confer legitimacy on an agency that is comprised of sworn and professional staff who possess a wide range of skills and experiences and are working in partnership to deliver police services than on an agency that is largely staffed by sworn personnel.

52. Alexander Weiss Consulting.

<sup>49.</sup> Michael J. Vermeer, Jeremy D. Barnum, Siara I. Sitar, Dulani Woods, and Brian A. Jackson, "Amplifying the Speakers: Identifying High-Priority Needs for Law Enforcement Public Information Officers," 2022, Santa Monica, CA: RAND Corporation, https://www.rand.org/pubs/research\_reports/RRA108-15.html.

<sup>50.</sup> William R. King and Jeremy M. Wilson, "Integrating Civilian Staff Into Police Agencies," COPS Office, 2014, https://www.researchgate.net/publication/272480179\_Integrating\_Civilian\_Staff\_into\_Police\_Agencies.

<sup>51.</sup> Jessica Anderson, "Baltimore Police Look to Be Among First Law Enforcement Agencies to Hire Civilian Investigators," April 17, 2022, *The Washington Post*, https://www.washingtonpost.com/local/baltimore-police-look-to-be-among-first-law-enforcement-agencies-to-hire-civilian-investigators/2022/04/17/885b5f62-bd09-11ec-8c09-e73af7e12d67\_story.html.



Acting Chief Paul Joseph, San Jose (CA) Police Department

#### More Potential Hires to Fill Staffing Gaps

As noted throughout this report, many agencies are turning to civilianization because they can't recruit sufficient sworn personnel. "I don't think this recruitment and retention issue is going to change anytime soon," says Acting Chief Paul Joseph of the San Jose Police Department (SJPD).

> I think a lot of the things set in motion in 2020 — politically, legally, culturally — aren't going to change overnight. So, we have really tried to rely on hiring more civilians, like analysts in our Bureau of Investigations. The reality is, we just don't have enough cops, and we can hire analysts easier and more cheaply than we can hire police officers. And let's face it, there's a lot of work that can be done that doesn't require you to be a police officer.

In San Jose, where a contentious pension battle decimated the ranks of sworn personnel even before COVID and calls for police reform took center stage,<sup>53</sup> Acting Chief Joseph told PERF that the move to civilianization was "born out of necessity." He described a "brutal time, when morale was horrific and staffing was atrocious. The department went from a high of close to 1,400 police officers in 2010 down to about 850 in 2015. Every day, about a third of the cops on patrol were there on overtime, some of them willingly, some of them not willingly. Specialized units were gutted."

Even though the Police Officers' Association (POA) expressed reservations about the creation of a Community Service Officer (CSO) program out of fear it would supplant police officer positions, the need to maintain public safety and provide basic police services compelled the department to hire professional staff to assume duties previously performed by sworn personnel. And in recent years, according to Acting Chief Joseph:

> The POA has been far more agreeable to us hiring civilians, ... as long as it does not come at the expense of sworn staffing. Because CSOs do not count toward meeting minimum staffing numbers for police officers on the street, they have been used to free the police officers up to do things that only a police officer can do.

#### **Reduced Training Time**

Another benefit of civilianization is the reduced time it usually takes to train professional staff as compared to sworn officers. In "Transforming Police Recruit Training: 40 Guiding Principles," PERF reported the average police academy in the United States is 20 weeks.<sup>54</sup> By comparison, professional staff are typically hired with much of the requisite education, skills, and experience to begin working independently or as part of a team within a week or two of their start date and after a comprehensive orientation.

## **Challenges of Civilianization**

Despite their best intentions, agencies often fail to meet the goals and objectives of civilianization. The New York City Police Department (NYPD), for example, has developed several civilianization plans in the past 25 years, but independent audits have found they did not meet their desired outcomes. A 2002 New York City Comptroller's Office "Followup Audit Report on the Opportunities for Savings

<sup>53.</sup> Rick Lyman and Mary Williams Walsh, "Struggling, San Jose Tests A Way to Cut Benefits," *New York Times*, September 23, 2013, https://www.nytimes.com/2013/09/24/us/struggling-san-jose-tests-a-way-to-cut-benefits.html.

<sup>54.</sup> Police Executive Research Forum, "Transforming Police Recruit Training: 40 Guiding Principles," November 2022, https://www.policeforum.org/assets/TransformingRecruitTraining.pdf.

in Administrative Units through Civilianization in the New York City Police Department" "determined that the City lost \$24.4 million<sup>55</sup> in annual potential cost savings because the NYPD did not civilianize positions in administrative units."<sup>56</sup> Two decades later, another Comptroller's Office audit stated, "the agency was unable to substantiate its reported civilianization of 415 positions ... 21 months past the target date," and between 2019 and 2021 the department had not civilianized any of the 368 additional positions it had identified for conversion from sworn to professional staff.<sup>57</sup>

The NYPD is not alone in laboring to meet civilianization goals. There are numerous reasons why agencies struggle to implement civilianization plans. These include organizational culture, budget pressures, union resistance, low retention of professional staff, and concerns of external stakeholders. This section of the report explores these challenges.

#### **Organizational Culture**

According to a 2021 study of civilianization in the Philadelphia Police Department, "Retention is often lower among civilian employees, with concerns about career growth and hostile organizational culture cited as primary reasons for leaving the organization."58 Powerful cultural forces in policing have long influenced the degree to which professional staff can be integrated into a law enforcement agency. Over 20 years ago, the Citizens Budget Commission in New York pointed out that "efforts at civilianization often have failed" because "police leaders want to keep a substantial number of assignments with limited risk available to officers as a type of reward or as a temporary assignment when an officer is under unusual stress or disciplinary review."59

To this day, civilianization is viewed negatively in some agencies. As Sean McGillis, Executive Director at the Royal Canadian Mounted Police (RCMP), stated:

> "There will always be cultural issues to overcome when making changes to how we have traditionally gone about our business. And while our sworn members may see a civilian doing something that only a police officer used to do and view it as potentially taking jobs and opportunities away from [sworn] members, integrating specialized professional staff is one effort designed to help ensure we have all the skill sets that we need — the right people in the right places at the right time doing the right things. To be world class means being agile and responsive to the needs of today, as well as the needs of tomorrow."

This agility is reflected in the RCMP's creation of the Civilian Criminal Investigator (CCI) position.

#### **Budget Pressures**

Budget cuts are one reason the benefits of civilianization have not always been realized. PERF and Justex System, Inc. wrote about this in their 2014 study of the Houston Police Department's (HPD) operational staffing:

> When a police department must cut its budget, sworn officers often are considered more 'essential,' so civilians are usually the first employee[s] to be laid off. Elected officials and the public often say that their top priority is to avoid reducing the number of officers on the street, in order to maintain a level of public safety. However, when civilians are cut from essential positions in the police

<sup>55.</sup> Although \$24.4 million represents a small percentage of the NYPD's total budget, the cost savings could have been useful to the agency in other ways.

<sup>56.</sup> Office of the Comptroller, City of New York, "Audit Report on the New York City Police Department's Civilianization Efforts," January 19, 2022, https://comptroller.nyc.gov/wp-content/uploads/documents/MG20\_117A.pdf.
57. *Ibid.*

<sup>58.</sup> Declan Sullivan & Alaynah Tombridge, "Civilianization in the Philadelphia Police Department," August 2021, Fels Institute of Government, https://www.documentcloud.org/documents/23118177-civilianization-in-the-ppd.

<sup>59.</sup> Citizens Budget Commission, "Preserving Police Services In Tough Fiscal Times: A Report of the Citizens Budget Commission," December 2022, https://cbcny.org/sites/default/files/report\_policeservices\_12042002.pdf.



Executive Assistant Chief Chandra Hatcher, Houston Police Department (FAR LEFT)

Sacramento Police Chief Kathy Lester (LEFT)

Chief of Staff Heather Hough, Milwaukee Police Department (RIGHT)



department, those positions usually end up being "backfilled" with sworn officers. Thus, the outcome of cutting civilian personnel in non-discretionary positions is the same: fewer officers on the street.<sup>60</sup>

This challenge remains for the HPD. In her interview with PERF, Executive Assistant Chief Chandra Hatcher said the ebb and flow of municipal budgets can adversely affect the long-term stability of professional staff positions. In 2011, the department laid off approximately 154 professional staff as part of citywide budget cuts, forcing the department to backfill their positions and duties with sworn personnel. "Officers took on more responsibilities," Hatcher said. "And over time, we found ourselves in positions where we needed to find creative ways to transition officers back to those core competencies that only police officers can fill." By the end of fiscal year 2017, Hatcher reported HPD had increased its professional staff from 1,168 to 1,235; then, due to another round of budget cuts, professional staffing plummeted again, most recently to 846 employees a 32 percent reduction.

Cutting professional staff is contrary to what many police executives said they would do during

a budget crisis. Looking back to 2009 when cities were grappling with the Great Recession, 43 percent of police executives surveyed at the time planned to rely on less-costly civilian employees, rather than sworn officers, in the face of budget shortages. In practice, however, civilian employees are the first to be terminated in the face of budget cuts.<sup>61</sup>

Sacramento Police Chief Kathy Lester said her department "held on as long as [it] could during the recession. But we had to cut a ton of our professional staff because we needed utility players, [which meant] we had to put cops in positions that typically would have been filled by professional staff."

Sometimes the need to maintain sworn staffing levels can be an impediment to civilianization. In Wisconsin, the state legislature passed Act 12 in 2023, requiring the Milwaukee Police Department (MPD) to increase its sworn staffing by several hundred officers within 10 years.<sup>62</sup> Failure to increase the number of officers to at least 1,725 will result in Milwaukee losing 15 percent of its shared state revenue.<sup>63</sup> In her interview with PERF, MPD Chief of Staff Heather Hough said this sworn staffing mandate has caused the city's 15-member Common

<sup>60.</sup> PERF and Justex System, Inc., "Houston Police Department: Operational Staffing Model," May 2014, https://www.houstontx.gov/council/committees/pshs/20140602/workdemand.pdf.

<sup>61.</sup> Police Executive Research Forum, "Violent Crime and the Economic Crisis: Police Chiefs Face a New Challenge," 2009, https://www.policeforum.org/assets/docs/Critical\_Issues\_Series/violent%20crime%20and%20the%20 economic%20crisis%20part%20 ii%202009.pdf.

<sup>62.</sup> Wisconsin State Legislature, "2023 Wisconsin Act 12," June 21, 2023, https://docs.legis.wisconsin.gov/2023/related/acts/12.
63. Alison Dirr, "The Act 12 Local Government Funding Law Is Shaping Milwaukee's 2024 budget. Here's How," Milwaukee Journal Sentinel, October 2, 2023, https://www.jsonline.com/story/news/politics/2023/10/02/act-12-local-government-funding-law-is-shaping-milwaukees-2024-budget/70994641007/.

Council to question the need for additional professional staff positions.

#### **Union Resistance**

Union opposition is another challenge to civilianization in many agencies. Associate Chief of Staff Blake Norton told PERF that the Philadelphia Police Department (PPD) relies heavily on sworn personnel to perform almost all its duties:

> The culture is very focused on sworn professionals, and our union has historically resisted civilianization. ... In our last arbitration in August 2022, we were granted a few positions in selected specialized units for civilianization. These positions were predicated on not replacing officers. ... Adding civilians to CBA<sup>64</sup> specialized units has to be done through natural attrition or transfer.

Norton added, "Even in units where sworn and civilian staff work alongside each other, the culture is so divided that often our sworn personnel believe their civilian counterparts cannot do the same tasks or functions."

In the San Jose Police Department, Acting Chief Paul Joseph said the Police Officers' Association did not support the effort to hire Community Service Officers (CSOs): "The sworn staff saw it as supplanting police officers. And the officers themselves argued more cops were needed rather than CSOs." Resistance among rank-and-file personnel to fully implement a civilianization plan is even reflected in the Memorandum of Agreement between the City of San Jose and the San Jose Police Officers' Association" (POA), which limits to five the number of positions the city may civilianize in the SJPD:

> Any discussion regarding the civilianization of positions in patrol, investigations or Internal Affairs will occur separately as part of the Police Reform discussions, ... [and] any contracting out and/or further civilianization of positions represented by the POA during the term of this Agreement would be subject to the meet and confer process.<sup>65</sup>

Agencies can potentially reduce internal opposition to civilianization if they avoid summarily removing police officers from their current positions to replace them with professional staff. A gradual approach, where professional staff replace sworn personnel as they retire, promote, or transfer to other assignments, is likely to mitigate resistance to civilianization. For example, according to Business Services Manager Kellie High-Foster of the Charlotte-Mecklenburg Police Department, "We didn't receive any pushback because we have never taken an active sworn person and removed them from a position to where it



Associate Chief of Staff Blake Norton, Philadelphia Police Department (FAR LEFT)

Business Services Manager Kellie High-Foster, Charlotte-Mecklenburg (NC) Police Department (LEFT)

#### 64. Collective Bargaining Agreement.

<sup>65.</sup> City of San Jose, "Memorandum of Agreement between the City of San Jose and San Jose Police Officers' Association," July 1, 2022, https://www.sanjoseca.gov/home/showpublisheddocument/32017/637744762471000000.



Chief Adam Palmer, Vancouver Police Department

would create any friction. And because we had so many vacancies, adding civilians ... benefited them because it lessened their workload."

Another recommendation for reducing union resistance is to develop a policy for the creation of professional staff positions. Chief Adam Palmer of the Vancouver Police Department (VPD) stated a guiding policy is essential when dealing with unions, city councils, city managers, and police commissions, and has proven its worth in growing VPD's professional staff from roughly 16 percent in 2006<sup>66</sup> to approximately 30 percent today.<sup>67</sup>

Most importantly, according to Palmer, a policy should establish a decision-making matrix to help an agency determine whether a professional staff member could perform the duties and responsibilities of a specific position. Considerations include whether the position requires law enforcement duties (e.g., arrest powers or the need to carry a firearm) or the skills, training, experience, or credibility of a sworn officer. "What we found," Palmer said, "is we actually don't need a cop in many positions where we historically thought it was necessary. As a result, we now have professional staff in public affairs, human resources, training, emergency management, and a variety of specialized investigative areas."<sup>68</sup>

#### **Concerns of External Stakeholders**

Concerns about civilianizing sworn positions are not limited to the employees of police departments and sheriffs' offices. In Greensboro (NC), for example, Chief John Thompson reported prosecutors and elected officials expressed misgivings about filling two sworn positions with professional staff. "A couple of the district attorneys wanted to talk about how much they valued a sworn officer in the role of court liaison," Chief Thompson said. A city council member contacted Chief Thompson to discuss her concerns that civilianizing the role of taxi inspector could adversely affect the department's relationship with the immigrant community, which she characterized as very positive due to how effectively the assigned police officer worked with the taxi drivers, many of whom were from other countries.

Chief Thompson listened carefully to their concerns but was candid about what is possible during the staffing crisis. "I can't afford to have somebody out here who's carrying a badge and a gun, and their only responsibilities are taxi inspections and court logistics. I don't have that luxury right now," he told them.

66. Vancouver Police Department, "Civilianization in the Vancouver Police Department," March 13, 2006, https://council.vancouver.ca/documents/rr1onfile4.pdf.

67. Adam Palmer, PERF Annual Meeting, May 30, 2024, Orlando, Florida.68. *Ibid.* 

# The Importance of Municipal Government Support for Civilianization

Civilianization goes much more smoothly when the mayor or county executive, governing council, and public are supportive of the process. In some jurisdictions, such as Greensboro, NC, support for civilianization has been overwhelmingly positive. "The mayor is extremely supportive, our council is supportive, and there hasn't been any internal pushback either," said Chief John Thompson.

Some communities have found that adding professional staff is more politically palatable than adding more police officers. Sacramento Deputy Chief Greg Halstead noted, "Our city council is more likely to add professional staff positions than they are to add more cops. It's the path of least resistance."

The Salt Lake City Police Department has had a similar experience, according to Chief Mike Brown. "They are our employees, and we couldn't have had more support from the city administration, the mayor, and the city council," he said. "And based on our success with professional staff, they're willing to fund more and more positions. I really see this as being kind of a model of the future as to how we do policing in our community."

# **Commonly Civilianized Positions**

#### In the earliest days of civilianization, police

agencies used professional staff to perform clerical duties, record keeping, and dispatch.<sup>69</sup> They continue to perform those duties today but have expanded their roles to include crime scene and forensic lab technicians, crime and intelligence analysts, attorneys, planning and research specialists, accountants, and administrators.<sup>70</sup> Today, professional staff can be found in positions that have historically not been considered for non-sworn personnel, including executive command, training, performance auditing, internal affairs, and criminal investigations.

This section of the report identifies some of these positions and describes how various agencies are using them as part of their civilianization efforts. Appendix B contains sample descriptions of some of the most civilianized positions in today's law enforcement agencies.

## **Appendix B: Position Descriptions**

- Background Investigator San Francisco Police Department
- Background Investigator San Jose Police Department
- Civilian Criminal Investigator Royal Canadian Mounted Police

- Civilian Traffic Investigator –
   Greensboro (NC) Police Department
- Community Engagement Liaison Orange County (FL) Sheriff's Office
- Community Response Specialist Salt Lake City Police Department
- Community Service Officer San Jose Police Department
- Crime Analyst –
   Memphis Police Department
- Crime Prevention Coordinator Seattle Police Department
- Crime Scene Investigation Lead Specialist New Orleans Police Department
- Field Service Officer Orange County (FL) Sheriff's Office
- Information Technology Specialist New York State Police
- Investigative Specialist/Public Integrity Bureau Baltimore Police Department
- Law Enforcement Analyst Philadelphia Police Department
- Police Civilian Investigator Phoenix Police Department

<sup>69.</sup> William R. King and Jeremy M. Wilson, "Integrating Civilian Staff Into Police Agencies," COPS Office, December 2014, https://portal.cops.usdoj.gov/resourcecenter/content.ashx/cops-p290-pub.pdf.

<sup>70.</sup> Brian Forst, "The Privatization and Civilianization of Policing," January 1, 2000, https://nij.ojp.gov/library/publications/privatization-and-civilianization-policing.

- Police Forensic Analyst New Orleans Police Department
- Police Information Specialist Salt Lake City Police Department
- Police Media Relations Specialist Mesa Police Department
- Police Service Aide Albuquerque Police Department
- Professional Staff Investigator Tucson Police Department
- Quality Assurance Auditor Albuquerque Police Department
- Research and Policy Analyst Chicago Police Department
- Training Officer Chicago Police Department

# **Community Service Officers**

Community Service Officer (CSO) — sometimes called Field Service Officer, Community Response Specialist, or another similar name — is one of the most common and visible professional staff positions. Although CSOs do not have law enforcement powers, they typically wear a modified police uniform and perform tasks that bring them into direct contact with the public. Depending on how agencies choose to use them, CSOs have tremendous potential to dramatically reduce the time sworn personnel spend on calls for service, thereby increasing the amount of time officers can engage in proactive enforcement, interact with the community, and solve crime.

In the San Jose Police Department, the CSO position was born out of a shortage of police officers. "We had to do it to meet minimum staffing on the street every day in patrol without spending a ton of overtime," according to Acting Chief Paul Joseph.

In the Orange County (FL) Sheriff's Office, Field Service Officers (FSOs) take non-emergency calls such as burglary reports, animal cruelty complaints, and some of the lower-level property crimes that don't involve a suspect. "Soon," says Undersheriff Mark Canty, "they're also going to be tasked with doing traffic crash investigations. That means the unit will grow much larger than the current 22 FSOs and their supervisors."

In the Sacramento Police Department, "Community Service Officers handle calls like minor traffic accidents, second degree burglaries, and missing persons that aren't at risk," according to Deputy Chief Greg Halstead. "We've had that position for a long, long time — since I got hired. We laid all of them off in 2011, and we started bringing them back a few years ago. The goal was to bring them in as a part of our police officer pipeline — to get people who didn't meet our education requirement or weren't old enough to be a police officer yet but wanted to be in the field."

Undersheriff Mark Canty, Orange County (FL) Sheriff's Office (RIGHT)

San Jose Police Department Community Service Officer (BELOW)





## **Civilian Investigators**

Due to sworn staffing shortages, agencies often assign detectives large caseloads, which can make it difficult for them to investigate all incidents thoroughly and according to best practices. In homicide investigations, the ideal situation is to assign a detective as the lead investigator for three homicides per year.<sup>71</sup> Caseloads beyond this, according to PERF's 2018 report "Promising Strategies for Strengthening Homicide Investigations," "can be associated with a decline in individual clearance rates, as detectives find it difficult to thoroughly investigate, document, and follow up on open cases."72

It's not surprising, then, why some cities are struggling to clear murders. In an April 2023

interview with National Public Radio (NPR), Oakland Police Department Deputy Chief Drennon Lindsey said "the veterans among her 16 [homicide] detectives are often handling two dozen or more cases at a time."73

Fortunately, because "detectives continue to spend an inordinate portion of their time on clerical and administrative duties,"74 there is an opportunity for professional investigators to take on these nonenforcement tasks. These professional investigators can perform a wide variety of tasks, as illustrated by the duties assigned to Police Civilian Investigators in the Phoenix Police Department (see Table 4, also Appendix B).75

#### Table 4: Police Civilian Investigator Duties – Phoenix Police Department

- Writes incident reports.
- Conducts follow-up phone calls, emails, and in-person contacts with members of the public, law enforcement, and various investigative partners.
- Collects data or information from various sources. Impounds property or evidence.
- Uses automated systems to research criminal histories and conduct background checks.
- Interviews victims, witnesses, parents/caregivers, and suspects.
- Assists with writing and reviewing subpoenas, court orders, and search warrants.
- Creates investigative support material such as photographic line-ups, crime bulletins, and flyers.
- Drives unmarked police vehicles.

- Reviews reports on impounded evidence for the purpose of property purges, crime analysis, and pended lab results.
- Updates the Records Management System and performs systems queries.
- Creates, updates, or maintains spreadsheets, timelines, or other digital records of large scale or high-profile investigations.
- Attends court hearings and testifies, as needed.
- Trains new civilian investigators.
- Attends training classes in police methods, investigative trends, and subjects related to the area of assignment.

72. Police Executive Research Forum, "Promising Strategies for Strengthening Homicide Investigations: Findings and Recommendations from the Bureau of Justice Assistance's Homicide Investigations Enhancement Training and Technical Assistance Project," October 2018, https://bja.ojp.gov/sites/g/files/xyckuh186/files/Publications/promising-strategies-for-strengthening-homicideinvestigations.pdf.

73. Eric Westervelt, "More People Are Getting Away With Murder. Unsolved Killings Reach A Record High," April 30, 2023, https://www.npr.org/2023/04/29/1172775448/people-murder-unsolved-killings-record-high.

74. John Liederbach, Eric J. Fritsch, and Charissa L. Womack, "Detective workload and opportunities for increased productivity in criminal investigations," February 2011, Police Practice and Research: An International Journal, 12:1, 50-65, DOI: 10.1080/15614263.2010.497379.

75. City of Phoenix, "Employment Opportunity: Police Civilian Investigator," Accessed March 15, 2024, https://www.phoenix.gov/ hrsite/jobdesc/62560.pdf.

<sup>71.</sup> David L. Carter, "Homicide Process Mapping: Best Practices for Increasing Homicide Clearances," September 2013, Washington, DC: Bureau of Justice Assistance, Accessed March 15, 2024, DOI:10.13140/RG.2.1.4844.0809.


Lisa Gutierrez, Police Civilian Investigator – Phoenix Police Department, Family Investigations Bureau

## Analysts

Skilled analysts are more essential than ever as law enforcement agencies increasingly rely on technology to help make decisions, solve crimes, deliver services, and provide transparency. These technologies range from abstract concepts such as predictive policing, intelligence-led policing, and artificial intelligence to concrete applications such as body-worn cameras, social media, gunshot detection systems, closed-circuit television, and crime mapping. The analysts who develop and implement these systems must possess a wide range of expertise and skills. While there are certainly some police officers who may possess these abilities, they are more typically found in skilled professionals who come from outside policing.

Salt Lake City Police Chief Mike Brown talked about the added value of having "a full-blown data scientist" on staff. "Ours has done a fantastic job of helping us become a smarter and a more transparent Police Department. She can take our data and convert it into real-time dashboards so that we can see exactly what we're trying to accomplish and where we need to put more staffing. She has helped us to be more transparent. A lot of these dashboards are things that people in our community can see."

As an example of the position's requirements, the Philadelphia Police Department (PPD) requires its Law Enforcement Analysts to know the following:<sup>76</sup>

- Standard sources and uses of information in law enforcement;
- Qualitative and quantitative analysis techniques;
- Principles and practices of statistical analysis;
- Law enforcement and statistical research methodology for the research assignment;
- Principles, methods and techniques for research, analysis, and data collection;
- Computer based systems used for data gathering, organization, and analysis;
- The principles and practices of utilizing computers for management reporting and analysis;
- Information system resources needed to design computerized data entry;
- Query languages, report writers, interactive database programs, spreadsheets and/or application generators or other software related to intelligence analysis; and
- Database management, geospatial software, and other software packages to manage data and produce tables, maps, and graphic displays if required by assignment.

The PPD position further requires a bachelor's degree in a closely related field and "two years of experience performing criminal investigative research or information management analysis work for a law enforcement agency, intelligence agency, government or non-profit organization, research institution, or private sector consulting firm."<sup>77</sup>

Few sworn personnel possess these highly specialized skills, and recruiting professional staff with the required skills can be a challenge for law enforcement agencies. Because of this, attracting qualified talent often requires reclassifying positions to allow for higher salaries. Acting Chief Paul Joseph of the San Jose Police Department has experienced this: "We're trying to develop a fusion

<sup>76.</sup> Philadelphia Police Department, "Law Enforcement Analyst," Accessed March 18, 2024, https://www.phila.gov/departments/office-of-human-resources/job-specs/6C26.htm.

center, so we've got some civilians who have a pretty unique skill set. ... They can make good money with their skills in Silicon Valley, somewhere outside of the Police Department, so we needed to get them into a job classification that paid enough to make it worth their while."

## Auditors

The Los Angeles Police Department (LAPD) has one of the nation's premier law enforcement auditing units. Established in April 2001 to comply with the requirements of a federal consent decree, what began as a small unit with only a handful of sworn and civilian personnel is now "staffed by over 30 sworn and civilian auditing professionals, including Certified Public Accountants, Certified Fraud Examiners, Certified Government Auditing Professionals, and Certified Internal Auditors."<sup>78</sup> Since 2004, the LAPD Audit Division has also administered "the nation's first Basic Law Enforcement Performance Auditing Course, which teaches law enforcement professionals and auditors the fundamentals of auditing police functions."<sup>79</sup>

In 2024, according to its Annual Audit Plan, the LAPD is scheduled to perform the following audits: California Public Records Act, Juvenile Detention Procedures, Gang and Narcotics Division Qualification/Selection, Custody Services Division, Bomb Squad Unit, Property/Evidence Room, and Assembly Bill 481 (Military Equipment Use Policy).<sup>80</sup>

Agencies such as the New Orleans (NOPD) and Albuquerque (APD) police departments have adopted many of the policies and practices of the LAPD Audit Division. In 2023, the NOPD's Audit and Review Unit — staffed by nine auditors and one supervisor<sup>81</sup> — published the following reports, among others, on the department's website:<sup>82</sup>

- Insight 320 (Early Warning System)
- Use of Force
- Child Abuse
- Custodial Interrogations
- Photographic Lineups
- Controlled Electrical Weapon (CEW)
- Domestic Violence (Patrol)
- Sex Crimes
- Crisis Intervention Team
- Performance Evaluation
- Academy In-Service
- Domestic Violence Unit
- Stops, Searches, and Arrests and Procedural Justice
- Search Warrant
- Limited English Proficiency
- Recruitment
- Supervision

The purpose of these audit and review reports is to "provide essential accountability and transparency to the Department and provide management with objective information to inform decisionmaking and to help improve the Department."<sup>83</sup>

When Cara Garcia, Deputy Director of Compliance and Oversight, joined the Albuquerque Police Department (APD) in 2015, one lieutenant and two detectives staffed the Audit Unit. Since

<sup>78.</sup> Los Angeles Police Department, "Audit Division," Accessed March 18, 2024, https://www.lapdonline.org/office-of-the-chief-of-police/constitutional-policing/audit-division/.

<sup>79.</sup> Ibid.

<sup>80.</sup> Michel Moore, "2024 Department Annual Audit Plan and Charter," November 28, 2023, https://lapdonlinestrgeacc.blob.core. usgovcloudapi.net/lapdonlinemedia/Department-Annual-Audit-Plan-and-Charter-for-2024-Calendar-Year.pdf.

<sup>81.</sup> The NOPD also employs five "Innovation Managers," whom Deputy Superintendent Nicholas Gernon describes as "people who work to come up with system improvements. They also create new audit protocols to measure emerging areas of concern for our auditors... This allows our audits to respond to changing conditions in the department and community."

New Orleans Police Department, "NOPD Consent Decree," Accessed March 18, 2024, https://nola.gov/nopd/nopd-consent-decree/.
 New Orleans Police Department, "Operations Manual Chapter 11.4.1: Audits and Reviews," July 10, 2016, https://nola.gov/getattachment/NOPD/NOPD-Consent-Decree/Chapter-11-4-1-Audit-and-Reviews.pdf/.

then, the department has expanded the unit to 13 professional auditors and civilian managers.

With most police agencies having implemented body-worn camera (BWC) programs, it is becoming more common to hire professional auditors to manage the evidence.<sup>84</sup> Auditors are commonly tasked with reviewing BWC video as part of use of force and misconduct investigations and conducting random audits of BWC video for compliance with agency policy.<sup>85</sup> Beyond BWC audits, performance assessments and policy audits may include inquiries of officers' overtime usage, charging documents (i.e., statements of probable cause), vehicle stops, and transportation and searches of persons in police custody.

## **Forensics Personnel**

Another area where agencies have increasingly transitioned from sworn personnel to professional staff is the crime laboratory. The Milwaukee Police Department, for example, has developed a comprehensive plan to fully civilianize its Forensics Division by 2024. This plan includes adding professional staff positions for evidence collection forensic investigators, latent print examiners, and laboratory forensic investigators. Additionally, professional staff supervisors and managers will replace sergeant, lieutenant, and captain positions in the unit.<sup>86</sup>

The Orange County (FL) Sheriff's Office has already taken similar action. Historically, the agency appointed lieutenants to lead its forensics unit. However, when the agency built the Orange County Crime Lab, Undersheriff Mark Canty said it recognized the need to put someone in charge "who really understands the world of forensics."<sup>87</sup> So the agency appointed Stephanie Callian, a career forensic scientist. Similarly, Salt Lake City Police Chief Mike Brown recognized the value of bringing stability to the position and named



Salt Lake City Police Department Civilian Evidence Technician (ABOVE)

Baltimore Police Forensics Personnel (BELOW)





<sup>84.</sup> Police Executive Research Forum, "Body-Worn Cameras A Decade Later: What We Know," December 2023, https://www.policeforum.org/assets/BWCdecadelater.pdf.

<sup>85.</sup> Ibid.

<sup>86.</sup> Interview with Milwaukee Police Department Chief of Staff Heather Hough on November 13, 2023.

<sup>87.</sup> Interview with Orange County (FL) Undersheriff Mark Canty on November 15, 2023.

Derek Mears as the Crime Lab/Evidence Unit Director. "He is a fantastic individual who has been doing forensic science work for 16 years," Brown said. "He's an expert in what he does, not only in criminal forensics but also in property management. When you get someone like him, you don't lose institutional knowledge by transferring in sworn personnel."<sup>88</sup>

### **Trainers**

In November 2022, PERF published a report recommending police academies adopt 40 guiding principles to "Transform Police Recruit Training." Two of these principles focus specifically on the need to upgrade the quality of instructors: 1) "Academies should diversify their leadership teams and include more people with a background in adult education and learning," and 2) "Academies should hire professional educators to teach classes in areas that do not require specific law enforcement experience."<sup>89</sup>

With these goals in mind, the Los Angeles, New Orleans, Portland, and Baltimore police departments, among others, have hired academic directors in recent years for their expertise in developing and integrating instructional content across subjects and delivering it in a way that is engaging, interactive, relevant, and adult learning centered.<sup>90</sup> However, in 2018, professional staff comprised only 11 percent of full-time academy instructors nationwide, according to the Bureau of Justice Statistics.<sup>91</sup> Hiring more professional educators would relieve the strain on sworn personnel to meet agencies' ongoing training requirements, provide stability to a unit that experiences frequent turnover in sworn personnel, and improve the quality of course curricula and classroom instruction.

In recognition of its increased training requirements while under a consent decree, the Chicago Police Department has committed to hiring 100 additional civilian trainers, including retired law enforcement personnel to teach tactics, attorneys to teach the law, and behavioral health professionals to teach crisis response. According to fiscal projections, hiring professional staff for these roles rather than assigning sworn personnel will save the department approximately \$3.6 million by 2025.<sup>92</sup>

<sup>88.</sup> Interview with Salt Lake City Police Chief Mike Brown on December 1, 2023.

<sup>89.</sup> Police Executive Research Forum, "Transforming Police Recruit Training: 40 Guiding Principles," November 2022, https://www.policeforum.org/assets/TransformingRecruitTraining.pdf.

<sup>90.</sup> Ben Steiner, Rehanna Kerridge, and Rebecca Rodriguez, "Improving the Quality of Training Through Targeted Instructor Development: A Replicable Training Model from the Portland Police Bureau," *Standards and Training Director Magazine*, March 2024, 2024March.pdf (iadlestmagazine.org).

<sup>91.</sup> See U.S. Department of Justice, Bureau of Justice Statistics. "State and Local Law Enforcement Training Academies, 2018 – Statistical Tables." July 2021. https://bjs.ojp.gov/sites/g/files/xyckuh236/files/media/document/slleta18st.pdf.

<sup>92.</sup> Interview with Deputy Director Ryan Fitzsimons, Chicago Police Department, January 22, 2024.

# **Preparing for Civilianization**

#### The civilianization process creates challenges

not only for the professional staff being hired, but also for the sworn personnel they may be replacing and for the overall culture and operation of the organization. As police agencies look to civilianize more positions, they need to be intentional and strategic in how they go about integrating professional staff into their organizations.

## Focusing on the Needs of Sworn Personnel

One of the often-overlooked challenges of civilianization is preparing the sworn personnel who are being reassigned to new positions or who will be working alongside professional staff for the first time. Managing this process in a thoughtful and prudent manner can help employees transition to their new roles and minimize hard feelings and resistance to change.

Houston Executive Assistant Police Chief Chandra Hatcher explained how sworn personnel who have been in administrative roles for several years can experience growing pains when returning to operational assignments: "With some officers, because they have gotten into their comfort zone, there are concerns about going back to patrol. There may be some retraining or refresher that needs to take place. [For example], they may have to ride with someone to get re-acclimated to new technology they haven't used on a regular basis." Deputy Commissioner Brian Nadeau talked about how the Baltimore Police Department messaged the civilianization process to Internal Affairs investigators, assuring them they would not lose their positions: "I told everyone, nobody who currently works here is going to be transferred out. Are we going to take in civilians? Yes, we're going to see how it goes. Will some sworn personnel that [transfer or promote from] here not have their positions refilled? Yes. But at the end of the day, nobody was getting removed, and we weren't looking to completely make internal affairs a civilian shop."

## Integration of Professional Staff

Ensuring professional staff feel as valued and invested in as sworn personnel is essential to optimizing their performance. There are several indicators of how fully integrated professional staff are in an agency: The ratio of professional staff to sworn personnel, the number of formal leadership positions professional staff hold, and the frequency and quality of communication and collaboration between sworn and professional staff.

Beyond these quantitative metrics, agencies need to ensure that their professional staff receive adequate orientation to the organization, access to ongoing training opportunities, appropriate technology, strong supervision, and regular recognition through commendations and awards. These types of opportunities, often more so than pay or benefits, determine whether employees are satisfied with their jobs and are willing to remain in them.

#### **Professional Staff in Leadership Positions**

One indicator of the degree to which professional staff are integrated in an agency is the number of formal leadership positions professional staff hold. In many agencies, sworn personnel continue to occupy most or all of the positions in command and middle management, including in bureaus or divisions that have large numbers of professional staff.

Some agencies, however, are taking a different approach. In the Baltimore Police Department (BPD), former Police Commissioner Michael Harrison appointed civilians to serve as Deputy Commissioner of Compliance and Deputy Commissioner of Administration, serving alongside two sworn deputy commissioners (for Operations and Public Integrity).93 At the division chief level, the BPD has professional staff overseeing finance, information technology, and forensic and evidence services.94 In the Seattle Police Department, half of former Chief Adrian Diaz's 12-member command staff was comprised of professional staff: Chief of Staff, Chief Operating Officer, Executive Director of Human Resources, General Counsel and Executive Director of Analytics and Research, Executive Director of Budget and Finance, and Executive Director of Administration.95

Having professional staff members in leadership positions serves two important purposes. First, it demonstrates that an agency is committed to having a knowledgeable and diverse leadership team. Second, it sends the signal to professional staff members at all levels that the organization values its civilian staff and that there are career opportunities for professional staff to move up.

## Frequency and Quality of Communication and Collaboration

Another important indicator that agencies value their professional staff is the frequency and quality of communication and collaboration between professional staff and sworn personnel. Evidence of these qualities can be found in a variety of situations: commanders consulting with professional staff in media relations before making a public statement about a critical incident; detectives conferring with professional crime analysts to help break a robbery pattern; commanders assembling an *ad hoc* committee of professional staff to develop a recruitment strategy for civilianization; and executives convening professional dispatchers, evidence technicians, and trainers as part of performance review boards to identify opportunities for organizational improvement.

The Albuquerque Police Department models this kind of collaboration in the design and implementation of its Force Review Board. According to Deputy Director Cara Garcia, "There's a lot of collaboration and correspondence between the Compliance Unit, the Force Investigation Unit that presents the [use of force] cases, and executive command staff. And that has served us really well here."

Deputy Chief Greg Halstead explained how the Sacramento Police Department treats its professional command staff as equal to sworn command personnel: "When we excuse lieutenants and below [from a meeting], the [civilian] communications center manager — the equivalent of a captain stays in the room. And every year for three days, when our command staff goes to an off-site retreat, she joins us as a member of the team. In my conversations with other agencies that have professional staff, I've learned this isn't a standard practice." For those agencies that have not yet adopted this as a standard practice, there is an opportunity to bridge a personnel divide, boost employee morale, and improve performance.

>> continued on page 39

<sup>93.</sup> Justine Barron, "The Baltimore Police Org Chart: A Journey," April 26, 2019, https://www.baltimorepolice.org/sites/default/files/ General%20Website%20PDFs/BPD\_Org\_Chart\_April\_2019.pdf.

<sup>94.</sup> Baltimore Police Department, "Organizational Chart," February 2024, https://www.baltimorepolice.org/about/about-department/ organizational-chart.

<sup>95.</sup> Seattle Police Department, "Command Staff," Accessed March 11, 2024, https://www.seattle.gov/police/about-us/about-the-department/command-staff.

#### Here are some of the leadership roles professional staff are filling in seven major-city police agencies:

- Baltimore Police Department<sup>96</sup>
  - Director, Community Policing
  - Director, Equal Opportunity and Diversity Section
  - Director, Consent Decree Implementation Unit
  - Deputy Director, Consent Decree Implementation Unit
  - Director, Equity Office
  - Chief, Information Technology Division
  - Director, IT Services
  - Deputy Director, Records Management
  - ▶ Chief, Finance
  - Director, Fiscal Services
  - Director, Budgets and Grants
  - Director, Asset Management
  - Deputy Director, Applicant Investigations
  - Director, Human Resources Section
  - Deputy Director, Human Resources Section
  - Deputy Director, Civilian Backgrounds
  - Chief, Forensic Services and Evidence Services
  - Director, Forensic Laboratory
  - Deputy Director, Analytical Services
  - Deputy Director, Comparative Services
  - Director, Crime Scene, and Evidence Management
  - Deputy Director, Crime Scene Sciences
  - Deputy Director, Evidence Management
- Houston Police Department<sup>97</sup>
  - Deputy Director, Chief Financial Officer
  - Deputy Director, Community Affairs
  - Deputy Director, Office of Planning and Data Governance
  - Deputy Director, Office of Legal Services
  - Deputy Director, Office of Technology Services
- Los Angeles Police Department<sup>98</sup>
  - Commander, Administrative Services Bureau
  - Commander, Audit Division
  - Commander, Community Safety Partnership Bureau
  - Commander, Evidence and Property Management Division
  - Commander, Fiscal Group

- Commander, Forensic Science Division
- Commander, Information Technology Division
- Commander, Office of Constitutional Policing and Policy
- Commander, Personnel Division
- Commander, Technical Investigation Division

#### • Milwaukee Police Department<sup>99</sup>

- Manager, Office of Community Relations, Engagement and Recruitment
- Director, Forensic Services Division
- Manager, Budget and Finance
- Director, Information Technology Division
- Manager, Facility Services Division
- Manager, Human Resources Division
- Manager, Property Control Division
- Manager, Records Management Division
- Salt Lake City Police Department<sup>100</sup>
  - Legal Counsel
  - Director, Communications
  - Director, Finance
  - HR Business Partner
  - Director, Internal Affairs
  - Director, Records Division
  - Director, Promising Youth Project
  - Director, Social Work
  - Director, Crime Lab

#### • Seattle Police Department<sup>101</sup>

- Chief Operating Officer
- Executive Director, Human Resources
- General Counsel and Executive Director of Analytics and Research
- Executive Director, Budget and Finance
- Executive Director, Administration
- Chief of Staff
- Tucson Police Department<sup>102</sup>
  - Forensics Division Administrator
  - Finance Section Manager
  - Analysis Division Superintendent
  - Violence Reduction Coordinator
  - Community Engagement Coordinator

**38** — Preparing for Civilianization

## 96. Baltimore Police Department, "Organizational Chart," February 2024, https://www.baltimorepolice.org/about/about-department/organizational-chart.

97. Houston Police Department, "Organization of the Houston Police Department," December 9, 2023, https://www.houstontx.gov/police/contact/images/org\_chart.pdf.

98. Los Angeles Police Department, "Meet Your LAPD Command Staff," Accessed March 11, 2024, https://www.lapdonline.org/lapd-command-staff/.

99. Milwaukee Police Department, "Organizational Chart," January 21, 2024, https://city.milwaukee.gov/police/About-MPD/Command-Staff-Bios.

100. Salt Lake City Police Department, "Police Chief Mike Brown," Accessed June 18, 2024, https://slcpd.com/about/bureaus-staff/chief/.

101. Seattle Police Department, "Command Staff," Accessed June 18, 2024, https://www.seattle.gov/police/about-us/about-the-department/command-staff.

102. Tucson Police Department, "Organizational Chart," July 28, 2023, https://www.tucsonaz.gov/files/sharedassets/public/v/2/police/documents/tpd-org-chart-07282023.pdf.

#### continued from page 37

Communication and collaboration between professional staff and sworn members should not be relegated to formal meetings, quarterly or annual performance reviews, and the like. In a healthy organization, interaction among all personnel should be a regular and natural occurrence.

## Overcoming Opposition to Civilianization

Agencies looking to civilianize should expect some degree of opposition and pushback, both internally from current employees (especially sworn members who may be displaced) and potentially from external partners and stakeholders as well. Opposition to civilianization can be minimized and support generated through consistent communication and relationship building. "Whether those discussions are with your unions or your elected officials," says Deputy Chief Greg Halstead of the Sacramento Police Department, "having those offline conversations to explain why we need to add these professional staff positions is critical, internally and externally."

Executive Assistant Chief Chandra Hatcher of the Houston Police Department shared similar advice: "Definitely talk to the leadership of the city and explain the challenges. Definitely talk internally. Talk to all the stakeholders, because you don't want to [make a decision] without weighing all the costs."

New Orleans Police Superintendent Anne Kirpatrick confronts the critics of civilianization head on, challenging them to explain why certain sworn positions shouldn't be reclassified to professional staff positions: "The first reaction is for people to question how civilians would do a lot of this work, such as traffic accident investigations. I think one of the best ways to deal with this is to begin with a question of why not? And then they struggle intellectually trying to tell you why the function cannot be done by a professional staff member." To her good fortune, the NOPD did not experience "pushback like you would find in other agencies, mainly those that are unionized. ... The officers like the help, and the consent decree requires it."

In the Charlotte-Mecklenburg Police Department, Business Services Manager Kellie High-Foster explained how the department leveraged the staffing crisis to change organizational culture around civilianization. "Culturally, prior to 2020," she said, "it was not something sworn personnel wanted to do. But then they were put under a tremendous amount of stress from vacancies and what was going on nationwide, ... with calls for service every year going up and up. And so, I think that's probably one of the reasons we did not get any pushback: We're not taking anything from you; we're adding something for you, to relieve your workload and to give you help."

The Phoenix Police Department builds support for civilianization by involving sworn personnel in the selection process of professional staff. "On [a recent] oral board, we had representatives from the places that were hiring the most," Commander Sara Garza said. "Family investigations had someone, so did our violent crimes, so did the lab, and some other [units]. … We tried our best to plug everyone in where they were going to be happy, we were going to be happy, and where their experience was."



Charlotte-Mecklenburg Police Department CSU (FAR LEFT)

Phoenix Communications Operator (LEFT) Once police officers experience the benefits of civilianization, any reluctance to have professional staff take on some of their duties tends to dissipate. Chief Mike Brown of the Salt Lake City Police Department said his officers would welcome more professional staff: "I went to a lineup, ... and one of the questions that came up was, 'Hey, Chief, when can we get some more police civilian response team members?' I think that's the litmus test that it's been accepted and embraced."

Sometimes, however, public support for civilianization waxes and wanes. In Milwaukee, Chief of Staff Heather Hough stated "the community was generally very supportive of civilianizing positions for the purpose of being able to respond to calls for service more quickly. However, with the passage of Act 12 and its mandate to increase sworn staffing to 1,725 officers, some of the council members were like, 'Why should we give you double the resources?'"

# Orientation and Training of Professional Staff

In its 2014 publication, "Integrating Civilian Staff into Police Agencies," the COPS Office called attention to how "civilians won't receive the benefit of academy and field training." Because of this, agencies should "provide [professional staff] an appropriate level of training and orientation, as well as a career ladder."<sup>103</sup>

#### Orientation

New employee orientation programs should involve more than reviewing policies on high-risk, high-liability issues and completing paperwork for payroll and human resources. This is an opportunity to thank them for their service and to emphasize that they are as valuable to the organization as sworn personnel. Former LAPD Chief Michel Moore liked to greet new professional staff by thanking them for "stepping forward as public servants in their communities and calling out how their background is



LAPD Service Representatives

different than many other public sector employees because they are involved in law enforcement."

It's also important for professional staff to learn about what police officers do. This can be facilitated by interacting with sworn personnel during orientation. Cara Garcia, Deputy Director of Compliance with the Albuquerque Police Department, is adamant that police auditors take "field trips" as part of their onboarding. These field trips include sitting with a dispatcher, going to the crime lab, visiting the evidence room, doing a ride-along with a patrol officer, and attending a roll call briefing. "If their shift starts at 10PM," Garcia said, "we're there at 10PM, introducing ourselves, giving a little introduction on what we're doing and who we are, and taking criticism as fuel to do better and to bridge the gap between us and the officers. That's how you change culture."

Professional staff members also should learn about the entire police organization and how their unit fits in and collaborates with other units. In addition, many professional staff members, especially those who are new to the community their agency serves, would benefit from an introduction to the community, its history, demographic makeup, challenges, and opportunities. All of this information will help new professional staff see the big picture and better appreciate where and how they can contribute.

103. William R. King and Jeremy M. Wilson, "Integrating Civilian Staff into Police Agencies," 2014, Washington, DC: Office of Community Oriented Policing Services, https://portal.cops.usdoj.gov/resourcecenter/content.ashx/cops-p290-pub.pdf.

#### Training

Whereas state training commissions heavily regulate police officer positions, there is comparatively little state oversight of professional staff in law enforcement agencies. In fact, with rare exceptions (for example, crime laboratory personnel and communications dispatchers), agencies independently decide the training their professional staff receive, if any.

One exception is North Carolina, where the legislature authorized Civilian Traffic Investigators to provide "non-emergency services that are essential to motorist safety, such as assistance to stranded motorists, traffic direction, and vehicle crash investigation as allowed for by State law."<sup>104</sup> The statute also requires each investigator to "attend a training program designed by the North Carolina Justice Academy [and], upon completion of the training program, ... spend not less than four weeks of field training with a law enforcement officer who has experience conducting traffic crash investigations."<sup>105</sup>

The Orange County (FL) Sheriff's Office is exploring sending some of its professional staff to the police academy after completing an orientation process. For example, Undersheriff Mark Canty said Field Service Officers (FSOs) "would skip the highliability stuff like defensive tactics and firearms, but they would still go to driving and CPR and first aid, some of the legal background, and some of the operational background, like how to investigate a burglary or a traffic crash."

In the Salt Lake City Police Department, Community Response Specialists attend an in-house academy for six weeks, and then they spend another 10 weeks in field training with a variety of units. According to Chief Mike Brown, the department



**RCMP** Civilian Criminal Investigators

has received "quite a few applications for this position. We were surprised at how many people wanted to be part of this team. We've had some retired police officers that want to come back, and some of our police explorers have been hired into these positions. It's really been a windfall."

In the Royal Canadian Mounted Police (RCMP), training for new Civilian Criminal Investigators (CCIs) is extremely robust as compared to most professional staff positions in U.S. law enforcement agencies. They participate in a comprehensive, 24-month training program, including an "Introduction to Police Sciences" and the "Federal Policing Investigations Training" program (FPIP).<sup>106</sup> The one-week IPS course includes content ranging from the "RCMP Code of Conduct, applicable domestic statutes, legal authorities, types of offenses, gathering evidence and handling exhibits, judicial authorizations, interviews and court process. Upon completion of the IPS, candidates [are] granted limited Peace Officer Status and progress to the ... FPIP, including coaching in investigation practices."107

<sup>104.</sup> City of Greensboro, "Civilian Traffic Investigator," October 4, 2023, https://www.governmentjobs.com/careers/greensboronc/jobs/ newprint/4230960.

<sup>105.</sup> North Carolina General Assembly, "NC Gen. Stat. § 160A-499.6 – Civilian Traffic Investigators," June 23, 2023, https://casetext.com/statute/general-statutes-of-north-carolina/chapter-160a-cities-and-towns/article-21-miscellaneous/ section-160a-4996-civilian-traffic-investigators.

<sup>106.</sup> Royal Canadian Mounted Police, "Civilian Criminal Investigators," Accessed May 17, 2024, https://www.rcmp-grc.gc.ca/en/civilian-criminal-investigators.

<sup>107.</sup> Ibid.

## **Recruiting and Retaining Professional Staff**

#### While civilianization provides law

enforcement agencies with another staffing option, "Recruitment for civilian positions is also difficult," says former Chief Art Acevedo, who has led police departments in California, Texas, and Colorado. Agencies should not assume that hiring and retaining professional staff will be any easier than it presently is for sworn personnel. The RCMP, for example, has created 50 Civilian Criminal Investigator (CCI) positions, but Workforce Management and Modernization Director Lori Wilkinson says "it's a real challenge to fill them. The workload could support about 150 CCI positions, but we've never hit our full complement of 50."

In the LAPD, former Chief Michel Moore identified the challenges of attracting and retaining qualified professional staff to fill hundreds of position vacancies. "There is a scarcity of qualified applicants for a number of different fields," he said. "We're having difficulty hiring people who are interested in public service and working in a public sector position. And the other departments we're competing against for scarce talent — the water and power departments, the airport — can pay higher wages, offer bonuses and educational incentives, and allow employees to work from home."

Milwaukee PD Chief of Staff Heather Hough attributed this challenge to the difference in pay between the public sector and private sector for similar work. In the department's most recent effort to hire crime analysts, Hough said "the applicant pool was small, and a lot of people declined the offer once they learned the salary."

Recruiting can be especially challenging in highly specialized fields such as information technology, where police departments are competing with the private sector to recruit top talent. Staff Inspector Armil DeGuzman with the New York State Police said, "It's sometimes a challenge getting highly qualified people to accept the position based on the compensation they're going to get."

While the challenges of recruiting professional staff are real and not easily overcome, there are some strategies that agencies can take to get ahead of the curve.

## **Prioritize College Graduates**

Agencies should prioritize the recruitment of recent college graduates for professional staff positions. While administering a summer internship program at police departments for students from Historically Black Colleges and Universities



Former Chief of Police Art Acevedo



Captain Colin King, Tucson (AZ) Police Department

(HBCUs),<sup>108</sup> PERF found that many of today's university students are eager to work in public service professions, including law enforcement, even if they don't want to be sworn police officers. According to Captain Colin King, Commander of the Administrative Resources Division, this is why the Tucson Police Department (TPD) is increasingly looking to college graduates to fill professional staff positions such as Public Safety Investigator (PSI). Notably, TPD has also seen greater interest in these positions from women and applicants with diverse educational backgrounds.

Professional staff positions provide alternatives to traditional policing for those interested in serving the community but not as a sworn officer. The Baltimore Police Department found this to be true when recruiting Investigative Specialists to work in the Internal Affairs Division. According to Deputy Commissioner Brian Nadeau, "Seventy-five percent of our applicants were 22 to 24 years old and had some type of law enforcement or criminology degree. Having seen all the negativity about police, they told us, 'I really want to be in law enforcement, but I don't want to be on the street. I don't want to deal with that."

### Work to Improve Retention

As this report has previously noted (see p. 24), many agencies are finding it as challenging to retain professional staff as it is to retain sworn personnel. Orange County (FL) Undersheriff Mark Canty said "The biggest challenge for us is retaining people. I think we've done a pretty good job of hiring, but trying to retain people has been immensely difficult. ... Deputy and communications center positions are our two biggest and hardest jobs to fill, so we've had to do a lot over the last couple of years to try to make those positions more competitive. But we've also lost IT personnel and some HR personnel, particularly due to compensation. ... We lost an analyst to another company that doubled her salary and allowed her to work from home five days a week. How can we compete with that?"

The New York State Police has experienced similar difficulties in hiring and retaining communications specialists. According to Staff Inspector Armil DeGuzman, "We're constantly short staffed and constantly have trouble hiring those personnel, so troopers are often filling in for the dispatchers. ... They can't work remotely, they work long shifts plus holidays and weekends, and they're paid half of what a police officer makes."

Agencies are employing a range of strategies to help boost the hiring and retention of professional staff.



New York State Police Dispatchers Charles Ford (FAR LEFT) and Sharlene Sisco (LEFT)

108. Police Executive Research Forum, "Immersing Students in Police Agencies Can Improve Recruitment and Community Trust: Lessons from the PERF-HBCU Summer Internship Program," February 2024, https://www.policeforum.org/assets/HBCUInternship.pdf.

#### Part-time employment

The Orange County (FL) Sheriff's Office is attempting to improve pay and benefits for professional staff who only want to work part-time. "We have one or two background investigators who are full time, but the bulk of them are part time. … Recently, we raised their starting salary a little, and then we provided them with some holidays as well, like Thanksgiving and Christmas, just to encourage them to be here and come to work," said Undersheriff Mark Canty.

While not every professional staff position is appropriate for part-time work, many are. Working part-time might be especially attractive to parents who need to juggle work and child-care responsibilities, as well as retirees or others who are thinking of re-entering the workforce.

#### **Working From Home**

Some agencies have begun enacting work-fromhome policies for professional staff whose duties don't require them to always be in the office. The Albuquerque Police Department is one of these agencies. Its standard operating procedure "recognizes that remote work helps with recruiting and ensuring continuity of essential services during national or local emergency events that may disrupt normal operations. Additionally, remote work enhances work-life effectiveness and allows Department personnel to better manage their work and family obligations, thereby retaining a more resilient, results-oriented workforce." The SOP also lists the job duties that are appropriate for remote work, including "analytical work, research, advising, computer-oriented duties, or work that does not require public or constituent interaction."109

The Orange County (FL) Sheriff's Office is another agency that permits some professional staff to work from home one or two days per week, but there are multiple restrictions attached to the policy that do not typically apply to similar positions outside the law enforcement profession. <sup>110</sup> These include not being permitted to work remotely on Mondays and Fridays and an inability to transfer their remote work privileges to a new assignment.<sup>111</sup>

The COVID-19 pandemic accelerated the movement toward remote work, and it is unlikely many office jobs will ever return to being in-person full time. For law enforcement agencies to compete with other public and private sector employers for new talent, especially in highly specialized fields such as information technology that lend themselves to remote work, agencies will need to be flexible about alternative work options. Agencies will also need to sufficiently invest in technology to make remote work efficient.

### Career Path and Growth Opportunities

The paramilitary structure of law enforcement agencies has always provided advancement opportunities through promotion for sworn personnel. Likewise, the diversity of assignments in the profession has afforded officers and deputies a chance to pursue a wide variety of other interests (depending on the size of the agency), such as positions in criminal investigations, special operations, and administrative units. The same career pathways have not historically been available to professional staff. Successfully integrating and retaining civilian employees in law enforcement agencies requires creating career paths for them to grow and advance.

San Jose Acting Chief Paul Joseph talked at length about this issue with PERF.

One of the greatest challenges we have with our professional staff employees is their career path. What opportunities do they see if they're going to spend 25 to 30 years in this organization? What opportunities do they have to either promote or vary their career a

<sup>109.</sup> Albuquerque Police Department, "SOP 3-7: Remote Work," February 24, 2024, 3-07-remote-work.pdf (cabq.gov).

<sup>110.</sup> PERF interview with Orange County Undersheriff Mark Canty, November 15, 2023.

<sup>111.</sup> Orange County Sheriff's Office, "G.O. 4.2.6: Civilian Remote Work," September 13, 2023, https://public.powerdms.com/ORCSO/ documents/3230319.

little bit? One of the great things about being a San Jose PD police officer is you can do 10 million things. You have all these cool units, you can fly a helicopter, you could be on the SWAT team, you can ride a motorcycle. But that's not the case with Community Service Officers. If there's no path for a CSO to ever promote, or do anything different than the same job they're doing right now for the next 25 to 30 years, is that going to be a retention issue? I would imagine it probably will. So, we're trying to figure out what to do with them."

Addressing the issue of career paths and growth opportunities for professional staff can take many forms, including creating regular promotional opportunities (including a path for professional staff to become sworn officers), ensuring civilian positions are properly classified, looking internally to fill supervisory and managerial roles, and, importantly, ensuring the professional and sworn staff are treated equitably.

#### **Promotional Steps**

Recognizing the limited opportunities for career growth, the Albuquerque Police Department has begun adding promotional steps for professional staff. "It's very new for civilians to have a career ladder and a longevity map to stay in these positions long term. I added two senior auditor positions to the unit that would be a step in between an audit position and an audit manager position," said Deputy Director Cara Garcia. "Any auditors that are currently with our agency now have at least three steps of potential opportunity for them."

The Baltimore Police Department is developing a similar plan to retain its Investigative Specialists. "We don't want them to get bored," said Deputy Commissioner Brian Nadeau. "They may not all plan to work here for 20 to 25 years, but we want to create that opportunity for them. I've already made one of them a field trainer for new investigators in Deputy Commissioner Brian Nadeau, Baltimore Police Department



the unit; my next plan is to put them in supervisory roles. At some point that could save us sergeant positions, and then maybe, as they get more experienced, move them up to the equivalent of a lieutenant."

#### **Career Immersion**

Although those who seek employment as a professional staffer may not envision a career as a sworn member, joining an agency as an explorer or cadet is a natural pathway to becoming a police officer trainee or professional staff employee. Furthermore, civilian investigators, crime scene technicians, crime analysts, community engagement liaisons, and other professional staff may also discover, after being immersed in the profession and working alongside police officers, they would prefer to become a part of the sworn ranks. Encouraging these employees to pursue their career ambitions and creating a clear pathway for them to apply to become police officers can help with both employee retention and sworn staffing.

Indeed, immersing professional staff inside a law enforcement agency is an excellent way of breaking down barriers and changing attitudes toward the profession. PERF discovered this when it developed and administered the PERF-HBCU<sup>112</sup> Summer Internship Program in 2022 and 2023. As reported in "Immersing Students in Police Agencies Can Improve Recruitment and Community Trust," the eight- to 10-week program "led some interns to consider becoming a police officer and others to

<sup>112.</sup> Historically Black Colleges and Universities.

consider seeking a professional staff position within a police agency."  $^{^{\prime\prime}113}$ 

#### Look Internally to Fill Positions

Cara Garcia, Deputy Director of Compliance with the Albuquerque Police Department, has made a point of looking inward to fill positions, especially when it comes to advancement opportunities. "Sometimes we shoot ourselves in the foot by inflating job descriptions, assuming we're going to attract the best talent," she said. "So, when I became the audit manager, I already knew I was sitting on talent. Civilians who were already working for the department had institutional knowledge that I needed to leverage. You don't want your job descriptions to close out people already in the department, so I ensured that I had specific language that said related education and experience may be interchangeable on a year-foryear basis. Those types of contingencies allowed me to hire people who may not have had a bachelor's degree but had 23 years of experience with the department."

Agencies might also consider advertising professional staff positions first to internal personnel, before opening up the process to external candidates. This will help ensure that current employees are aware of openings and have an opportunity to apply if they are interested.

#### Treat Professional and Sworn Staff Equitably

Often, the key to retaining professional staff is quite simple: Treat them as you would sworn personnel. Unless contractually prohibited, agencies should provide professional staff the same benefits and opportunities for career growth and advancement as police officers.

An excellent example of this is in the San Jose Police Department, which arranges body scans every year for employees who want to be screened for diseases. The department was offering these scans "at roughly a 90/10 split — "90 percent cops and 10 percent professional staff," according to Acting Chief Paul Joseph. "We switched it to two-thirds cops and one-third professionals, because that's the makeup of the department. Our professional staff employees should get the same benefit."

Another area where professional staff have sometimes been overlooked is in agencies' awards programs. While it is certainly important and appropriate that agencies recognize the heroism, bravery, and performance of sworn personnel, they also should recognize the contributions of professional staff who support the work of sworn personnel and improve agency operations.

113. Police Executive Research Forum, "Immersing Students in Police Agencies Can Improve Recruitment and Community Trust: Lessons from the PERF-HBCU Summer Internship Program," February 2024, https://www.policeforum.org/assets/HBCUInternship.pdf.

# **Civilianization Success Stories**

#### Throughout this project, PERF learned of

agencies' many successes with civilianization. Several of these success stories are shared here to illustrate how civilianization can improve organizational performance, increase public trust in the quality of police service provided, and overcome the challenges of the staffing crisis.

### Communications Center Manager – Charlotte-Mecklenburg Police Department

When Tammy Pippen joined CMPD in 2020, the highest-ranking person in the 911 center was a captain who had limited experience and knowledge in running a 911 center. This is typical in many law enforcement agencies, but Pippen, Director of CMPD's Human Resources Division, saw an opportunity to upgrade the center's operations. She reclassified the position from Police Captain to Communications Manager and added two other professional staff members, one in charge of administration and the other overseeing operations.

These three professional staff members brought profound changes, Pippen explained to PERF: "There was a significant decrease in employee complaints and grievances. We saw improvement in morale and overall operations, and we created consistency of knowledge and continuity within the unit because we weren't rotating sworn personnel in and out of key leadership positions every year or two."

### Community Response Specialists – Salt Lake City Police Department

Salt Lake City Police Chief Mike Brown effusively praised the department's Community Response Specialists. "They do a fantastic job of handling lower-level calls so that our police officers can focus on higher priority ones," he said. "With 16 of these specialists, we're covering more hours per day. And we have plans to build that team out because it's been a windfall for us. From January 8 to November 29 of [2023], they handled 2,484 calls for service. The call they go on the most is 911 hangups, but they also handle calls like found property, evidence pickup, traffic hazards, vehicle inspections, car prowlers, and civil disputes."

Having the Community Response Specialists means that these calls are being handled more promptly than if they had to be answered by sworn officers. This arrangement also allows sworn officers to focus on more serious or urgent calls for service for which enforcement powers are critical. Furthermore, it affords police officers more time to engage in proactive enforcement, community outreach, and problem solving, activities that often get short shrift in a work environment with high 911 call volume and short staffing. These benefits promote public safety and strengthen public confidence in the police.

## Investigative Specialists – Baltimore Police Department

Deputy Commissioner Brian Nadeau spoke to PERF about how BPD executives challenged themselves to identify as many positions as possible that could be civilianized. "We started talking about different positions in the agency where we had police officers. We asked ourselves, 'When we're short hundreds of officers and are bleeding overtime to fill patrol cars, why did we need a cop to do something a civilian could do?'"

As the Deputy Commissioner in charge of the Public Integrity Bureau, Nadeau's mind quickly went to Internal Affairs investigators. "Historically, it's been tough to find officers who want to work there. And they need to have the right background, understand the mission, and understand the process. It's a hard position to fill."

Ultimately, Nadeau opted to take away eight sworn detective positions in exchange for ten professional Investigative Specialist positions. He ticked off the benefits: Two more staff members, lower salaries, less training, less turnover, excellent writing skills, no uniform costs, and lower pension costs. Nadeau gives high marks to the six Investigative Specialists BPD has hired since 2022 to work in the Internal Affairs Section. "[E]very sergeant, lieutenant, and commander in this building would tell you that they're great as writers, they're really good at sifting through facts, and they don't easily get swayed or misled during investigative interviews," Nadeau explained. Given this success, BPD intends to hire up to ten Investigative Specialists, but the department is taking a deliberate approach to maintain personnel standards.

## Professional Staff Investigator – Tucson Police Department

In 2023, TPD began hiring for a "Professional Staff Investigator" (PSI) position. PSIs do not have arrest powers, but they "work alongside police detectives investigating criminal incidents, conducting followup, collecting evidence, preparing reports, and developing probable cause."<sup>114</sup> Captain Colin King of the Administrative Resources Division says there is little work commissioned officers do that PSIs can't.

"There has been a lot of interest in the position," King said. Notably, 60 percent of the applicants and 75 percent of those ultimately hired for the position were women. This portends good things for the department's efforts to increase the role and visibility of women, and may even have implications for

> the 30x30 Initiative, which seeks "to advance the representation and experiences of women in all ranks of policing across the United States."<sup>115</sup>

The PSI position wasn't TPD's only civilianization success story in 2023. According to King, other highlights included creating, recruiting, and hiring over 30 new

Public Integrity Bureau Division Chief Olufemi Akanni meets with Baltimore Police Investigative Specialists

```
114. https://www.jobapscloud.com/Tucson/sup/bulpreview.asp?R1=2306&R2=6210&R3=001.
```

115. Policing Project at NYU School of Law, 30x30 Initiative, "A National Initiative to Advance Women In Policing," Accessed April 2, 2024, https://30x30initiative.org/.





professional staff positions; filling 35 existing professional staff vacancies; and increasing Community Service Officer staffing by 35 percent.

## Sex Offender Notification Unit – Phoenix Police Department

In March 2023, for the first time in more than 15 years, PPD not only complied with state law requiring the department to notify the community within 45 days of a sex offender's registration but exceeded it. Commander Sara Garza, PPD Commander of Community Engagement, Employment Services, and Wellness, attributes the department's longawaited compliance to "putting the right people in the right places," including hiring professional staff with pertinent experience.

According to Garza, "Even with seven sworn personnel [assigned to the unit], we had challenges complying with the 45-day notification laws." But within six months of onboarding and training three Police Civilian Investigators, PPD's Sex Offender Notification Unit (SONU) met the 45-day statutory requirement. In fact, PPD cut down the time from registration to notification almost in half from their 2022 averages. Tucson Police Department Community Service Officer

Given the unit's daunting workload, this is a significant achievement. SONU manages approximately 5,500 registered sex offenders who reside in the City of Phoenix, or about one-third of all registered sex offenders in Arizona. Now staffed by one sergeant, two detectives, three Police Civilian Investigators,116 and two Police Assistants,117 the SONU processed 7,300 sex offender registrations in a recent 12-month period, far exceeding the unit's previous output. SONU also mailed approximately 800,000 community notification flyers concerning 1,414 of its highest-level offenders, submitted 131 felony cases for prosecution, arrested 21 offenders for failure to register, and digitized over 20,000 sex offender paper files.

## Third-Party Vendors – New Orleans Police Department

In addition to hiring more professional staff to reduce the workload of sworn personnel, some agencies have begun outsourcing certain law enforcement duties to private companies. After a five-year pilot program, the NOPD signed a contract with a third-party vendor in 2022 to respond to minor traffic accidents. According to NOPD Superintendent Anne Kirkpatrick, the vendor responded to 540 of 906 eligible calls in the month of November 2023, and "arrived on scene much faster than what officers can do." Over the course of a year, the vendor projects it will respond to roughly 10,000 calls for traffic accidents, "which equates to about 13 NOPD officers or 25,000 hours saved."<sup>118</sup>

<sup>116.</sup> Police Civilian Investigators are "actively involved in supporting sworn police in detailed/complex criminal investigations" in units such as the Drug Enforcement Bureau, Family Investigations Bureau, Property Crimes Bureau, and Violent Crimes Bureau. https://www.phoenix.gov/hrsite/jobdesc/62560.pdf.

<sup>117.</sup> Police Assistants support sworn personnel and Police Civilian Investigators by performing research and administrative tasks and responding to non-emergency calls that do not require a sworn officer. https://www.phoenix.gov/hrsite/jobdesc/62160.pdf.
118. Lily Cummings, "Mayor Cantrell Signs Contract With Company to Respond to Car Accidents," March 3, 2023, https://www.wwltv. com/article/news/local/orleans/cantrell-signs-contract-with-private-company-to-respond-to-car-accidents/289-26473a4f-2762-4dad-be2d-6ffebd5bb310.

## Training Specialists – Baltimore Police Department

BPD provides an example of how onboarding professional educators can transform an agency's training function in a relatively short time. In 2017, BPD negotiated a consent decree with the Department of Justice, requiring reform in most operational and administrative areas: community policing and engagement; stops, searches, arrests, and interactions; impartial policing; responding to and interacting with people with behavioral health disabilities or in crisis; use of force; interactions with youth; transportation of persons in custody; First Amendment-protected activities; handling of reports of sexual assault; technology; supervision; misconduct investigations and discipline; coordination with the Baltimore City School Police; and recruitment, hiring, and retention.<sup>119</sup>

As part of the compliance process, the consent decree imposes training requirements in all these areas. To meet the requirements, BPD hired a cadre of professional educators — including an academic director, curriculum writers, and law instructors — to augment the sworn personnel working in the training academy. The results were swift and impressive. According to the department's Consent Decree Monitoring Team, "The overall quality of the Department's training is significantly higher than it was when the Consent Decree process began. Specifically, BPD has established and prioritized a robust, dynamic training paradigm grounded in scenario-based, problem-solving, and adult learning techniques."120 According to BPD Commissioner Richard Worley, "These achievements wouldn't have occurred without adding professional educators to the department's training staff. They've brought expertise and stability to a unit that has always been challenged by a revolving door of sworn personnel who typically lack backgrounds in academic research, instructional design, adult learning, and public speaking."

The monitoring team's report also noted, "In April 2021, BPD's training academy was one of only six academies selected nationwide, through a highly competitive process, by the International Association of Directors of Law Enforcement Standards and Training to participate in the Academy Innovations project," which "seeks to foster evidence-based training methods for law enforcement with the objective of establishing national best practices."<sup>121</sup>

<sup>119.</sup> Department of Justice, "Fact Sheet: Justice Department Consent Decree with Baltimore Police Department and the City of Baltimore," https://www.justice.gov/media/877381/dl?inline.

<sup>120.</sup> Baltimore Police Department Consent Decree Monitoring Team, "Compliance Review & Outcome Assessment Regarding BPD Training," February 2022, https://www.bpdmonitor.com/s/BPD-Training-Assessment-February-2022-nn2w.pdf.

<sup>121.</sup> Quoted in Baltimore Police Department Consent Decree Monitoring Team.

## What Agency Civilianization Studies Have Found

#### In recent years, as difficulties in recruiting

and retaining sworn personnel have challenged law enforcement agencies to meet the demands of an increasingly complex and demanding profession, many agencies have commissioned or conducted staffing studies to identify positions appropriate for civilianization. "Review[ing] the business processes and detailed tasks required of each sworn officer in the department" is useful, according to the National Policing Institute,<sup>122</sup> in developing a strategic plan that prioritizes creating civilian positions to complete tasks that do not require arrest powers.

This section summarizes several civilianization studies. Notably, most of these studies applied the same basic decision-making methodology to assess whether a given position could be converted from sworn to professional staff, by answering three or more of the following questions:<sup>123</sup>

 Does the position require law enforcement duties (i.e., powers of arrest, use of force, statutory requirements, carrying a firearm)?

- 2. Are the skills, training, experience, or credibility of a sworn officer required to fulfill the duties of the position?
- 3. Would assigning a sworn officer to the position be helpful in developing their leadership skills?
- 4. Would assigning a sworn officer be helpful for other reasons?
- 5. Could a specially trained professional staff member fulfill the requirements of the position?

## **Baltimore Police Department**

The **Baltimore Police Department (BPD)** has conducted several staffing studies in recent years, including in 2017, 2018, and 2020. All have addressed civilianization, either exclusively or partially.

The 2017 report recommended civilianizing 297 of the department's sworn positions, which would have increased the percentage of professional staff from 13.6 percent to 21 percent. One year later, the National Policing Institute — in "assess[ing] the

<sup>122.</sup> The National Policing Institute was previously known as the Police Foundation.

<sup>123.</sup> See Police Foundation, "Baltimore Police Department Staffing Study," August 2018. The study, which also references the 2017 report discussed here, can be found in *United States of America v. Baltimore Police Department, et al.*, "Notice of Approval of Staffing Study Under Paragraph 428 of the Consent Decree," https://www.documentcloud.org/documents/5691880-Baltimore-PoliceFoundation-Staffing-Study-2018. Charlotte-Mecklenburg Police Department, "2021 Charlotte-Mecklenburg Police Department Civilianization Opportunities," December 30, 2020, sent to PERF via email on December 8, 2023, by Kellie High-Foster. Houston Police Department, "Proposed Operational Staffing Enhancements for the Houston Police Department," October 2014, https://houstontx. gov/police/department\_reports/operational\_staffing/Staffing-Recommendations-for-the-HPD-Final.pdf. Matrix Consulting Group, "Final Report on Police Department Capacity and Deployment Options: Milwaukee, Wisconsin," January 6, 2023. Sent electronically to PERF by Milwaukee Police Department Chief of Staff Heather Hough. Declan Sullivan & Alaynah Tombridge, "Civilianization in the Philadelphia Police Department," University of Pennsylvania Fels Institute of Government, August 2021, https://www.documentcloud. org/documents/23118177-civilianization-in-the-ppd.

appropriate number of sworn and civilian personnel to perform the functions necessary for BPD to fulfill its mission, enable supervision, and satisfy the requirements of [the consent decree]" — supported the report's recommendation, noting that BPD's ratio of professional staff to sworn personnel was "lower than many agencies across the country."<sup>124</sup> Although the department made some progress toward implementing the studies' civilianization recommendations, progress was slow due to multiple changes in leadership and organizational structure.125

Meanwhile, in only two of the eight years from 2015 through 2022 did the department hire as many sworn personnel as separated from the agency, leading to a net loss of more than 600 sworn officers over this period (Figure 3).<sup>126</sup> In response to the rate of sworn attrition, BPD reprioritized hiring additional professional staff to serve in the following units and positions (Table 5): 127



#### Table 5: Professional Staff Positions – Baltimore Police Department

- Crime Scene Technicians
- District Detective Unit
- Cold Case Unit
- Internal Affairs
- Forensics Unit
- Executive Secretaries

- Fleet Support
- Recruitment/Human Resources
   Public Relations
- Academy Instructors
- IT Specialists and Support
- Fiscal Services
- Background Investigators
- Crime Analytics
- Records Management
- 911 Dispatchers
- 124. Police Foundation, "Baltimore Police Department Staffing Study," August 2018. The study, which also references the 2017 report discussed here, can be found in United States of America v. Baltimore Police Department, et al., "Notice of Approval of Staffing Study Under Paragraph 428 of the Consent Decree," https://www.documentcloud.org/documents/5691880-Baltimore-PoliceFoundation-Staffing-Study-2018.

125. Ibid. Between 2017 and 2020, BPD changed police commissioners four times (Kevin Davis, Darryl De Sousa, Gary Tuggle [(Interim], and Michael Harrison) and mayors three times (Catherine Pugh, Barnard "Jack" Young, and Brandon Scott).

126. Baltimore Police Department, "2022 Recruitment & Retention Annual Report," https://www.baltimorepolice.org/sites/default/ files/2024-01/Recruitment%20Annual%20Report%20FINAL%20Submission.pdf.

127. Baltimore Police Department, "Civilianization," Accessed March 4, 2024, https://www.baltimorepolice.org/civilianization.

As of April 29, 2024, 21 percent, or 515, of the BPD's 2,465 total employees were professional staff, a substantial increase from 2017 and an amount equal to the national average. Notably, 243 (45 percent) of these professional staff were assigned to either the Forensic Services and Evidence Division or the Communications Section. Outside of these two assignments, only 9 percent of BPD's employees were professional staff.<sup>128</sup> This suggests that while the BPD has been successful in civilianizing these two units, there is still room for the department to increase the number of professional staff in other areas.

## Charlotte-Mecklenburg Police Department

Struggling to recruit and retain sworn personnel, the Charlotte-Mecklenburg Police Department in 2020 tapped its Director of Business Services, Kellie High-Foster, to lead a team of lieutenants examining every sworn position in the agency to determine which positions might be appropriate for civilianization.

The team recommended transitioning the following positions from sworn to professional staff in the first year of a three- to five-year implementation process: <sup>129</sup>

- Rotunda Officers (building security personnel)
- Recruitment (background investigators)
- Communications Division (operations managers)
- Training Academy (instructors)
- Crime Scene Unit (crime scene manager)
- Court Liaison Supervisor
- Cyber Crimes (forensic analysts)
- Technical Surveillance Unit

- Financial Crimes (police investigative technician)
- Real Time Crime Center (investigative analysts)
- Logistics Unit (police equipment technicians)
- Secondary Employment/Special Events

#### **Chicago Police Department**

One of the most ambitious civilianization projects PERF examined is contained in Chicago Mayor Brandon Johnson's 2024 budget, which "eliminates more than 800 vacant street cop positions and creates almost 400 new civilian positions."<sup>130</sup> According to press reports, the administration said these actions "will free up more officers to patrol the streets. The budget also beefs up training and supervisory roles that could help bring the department in line with the federal consent decree."<sup>131</sup>

One hundred of the new positions for professional staff are earmarked for trainers within the Office of Constitutional Policing and Reform; another 22 are earmarked for domestic violence advocates. Other prospective professional staff positions include 31 investigators in the Bureau of Internal Affairs, 22 crime victim advocates, and 21 retired law enforcement officers who will review use of force incidents.<sup>132</sup>

This is not the first time CPD has sought to civilianize sworn positions. In 2013, the City of Chicago Office of Inspector General (OIG) recommended the department convert 292 sworn positions to professional staff. It made this recommendation upon finding "sworn law enforcement officers [were] performing purely administrative tasks such as travel arrangement (Finance Division), data entry (Records Inquiry Section), nursing (Medical Services Section), graphic design (General Support Division), accounting (Bureau of Organized Crime), timekeeping (Office of the

132. Ibid.

<sup>128.</sup> Baltimore Police Department.

<sup>129.</sup> Charlotte-Mecklenburg Police Department, "2021 Charlotte-Mecklenburg Police Department Civilianization Opportunities," December 30, 2020, sent to PERF via email on December 8, 2023, by Kellie High-Foster.

<sup>130.</sup> Alice Yin, "Brandon Johnson won office with a nontraditional vision for policing. Does his first CPD budget line up?" *Chicago Tribune*, November 25, 2023, https://www.chicagotribune.com/2023/11/25/brandon-johnson-won-office-with-a-nontraditional-vision-for-policing-does-his-first-cpd-budget-line-up/.

<sup>131.</sup> Ibid.

First Deputy Superintendent), and grant writing (Research and Development Division)."<sup>133</sup> The OIG estimated civilianization of these 292 positions would save the city between \$6.4 million and \$16.6 million annually, depending on the replacement civilians' salaries.<sup>134</sup>

As with many such civilianization plans, the OIG's 2013 proposal didn't fully come to fruition. How, then, does CPD intend to make Mayor Johnson's plan to create nearly 400 new professional staff positions a reality? According to CPD Deputy Director Ryan Fitzsimons, it's a combination of prioritization of needs and relentless follow-up:

> Every month, we determine our priorities and identify the positions we want to push this month. And then we have a meeting with city HR, and we drill down on each position. Where are we with this title? Where's the holdup? Is it our people who need to get back to you? If it's our people, we get them to do what they need to do. If it's not our people, we ask city HR the source of the holdup.

Thus, CPD's greatest challenge to implementation is managing a large government bureaucracy — the CPD has over 12,000 sworn and professional staff. Removing barriers and holding personnel across organizations accountable for timely completion of tasks are critical. There are some positive signs this approach is working, says Fitzsimons:

> Historically, the city's Department of Human Resources has not allowed us to begin posting position titles until March. This year we were able to begin posting in January and have an increased number of titles that we are allowed to post every month. We are managing this process weekly with a cross-functional team that involves CPD, the Office of Public Safety Administration, and the Department

Deputy Director Ryan Fitzsimmons, Chicago Police Department



of Human Resources. These meetings have proven invaluable in making steady progress to untangling the complicated bureaucracy involved in city hiring.

This year we also have a dedicated budget to promote these civilian vacancies that we have never had in the past. As of Quarter 1 of this year [2024], we have posted and promoted 17 titles for over 200 jobs. These offers will be made in Quarter 2 of this year.

## **Houston Police Department**

A 2014 report from the Houston Police Department (HPD) recommended an "infusion" of approximately 1,220 officers and 140 supervisors into patrol and investigative operations to deliver high-quality "core service work."<sup>135</sup> In considering the degree to which civilianization could contribute to the proposed expansion, HPD acknowledged that its previous rationale for determining whether sworn personnel or professional staff ought to perform certain jobs "ha[d] been less than clear."<sup>136</sup> As a result, HPD applied the five-step decision-making methodology described above and concluded that 443 sworn positions "could be subjected to civilianization."<sup>137</sup>

<sup>133.</sup> City of Chicago, Office of Inspector General, "OIG Recommends Civilianizing 292 Police Officer Positions to Save City At Least \$6.4 Million Annually," January 23, 2013, https://igchicago.org/wp-content/uploads/2013/01/CPD-Civilianization-Release-Final.pdf.
134. *Ibid.*

<sup>135.</sup> Houston Police Department, "Proposed Operational Staffing Enhancements for the Houston Police Department," October 2014, https://houstontx.gov/police/department\_reports/operational\_staffing/Staffing-Recommendations-for-the-HPD-Final.pdf. 136. *Ibid.* 

<sup>137.</sup> Ibid.

Additionally, PERF and Justex System, Inc. conducted an independent study of HPD's "operational staffing" in 2014 and concluded "each division ... ha[d] several officers assigned to perform routine administrative work or manage the division's information systems."<sup>138</sup> To optimize the department's operational capacity, the study identified sworn personnel assigned to administrative positions in every division, including the following assignments it recommended HPD consider for civilianization:

- Auto Dealers Detail
- Vice Division
- Bicycle Administration and Training Unit
- Special Events Group
- Technical Surveillance Unit
- Narcotics Division Administration Unit

Despite its best intentions, HPD has struggled to implement its civilianization plans due to periodic budget cuts which have disproportionately impacted professional staff.<sup>139</sup>

#### **Milwaukee Police Department**

A 2023 report commissioned by the City of Milwaukee to study the Milwaukee Police Department's "capacity and deployment options" recommended adding 127 positions to the department, including 116 professional staff.<sup>140</sup> The specific recommendations included:

- Civilianize two sworn positions in the Office of Management, Analysis and Planning;
- Create a Community Service Officer classification to respond to certain types of low-priority calls for service that do not require a sworn

officer, and hire 19 professional staff into this position;

- Create eight Community Response Teams comprised of a clinician and EMT (16 professional staff total) to divert non-life-threatening calls for service from sworn personnel;
- Civilianize the five remaining sworn Forensic Investigator positions in the Evidence Collection Unit;
- Civilianize five vacant sergeant positions within the Internal Affairs Section;
- Civilianize the sworn Civil Litigation position;
- Civilianize four of the police officer positions in the Inspections Section;
- Civilianize two sworn positions in the Quartermaster; and
- Civilianize and add numerous positions in the Property Control Division, including Property and Evidence Technicians and Supervisors, Facilities Custodians, Records Specialists, and Open Records staff.

#### **Philadelphia Police Department**

"Given the operational, financial, and cultural challenges to recruiting new officers" for the Philadelphia Police Department (PPD), an independent 2021 study identified "an organizational need to utilize as many existing sworn officers within the Department as possible in roles that require law enforcement powers and training."<sup>141</sup> The study recommended over 800 sworn positions the department could transition to professional staff, which would roughly double its number of civilian employees.<sup>142</sup>

<sup>138.</sup> PERF and Justex System, Inc., "Houston Police Department: Operational Staffing Model," May 2014, https://www.houstontx.gov/council/committees/pshs/20140602/workdemand.pdf.

<sup>139.</sup> PERF interview with HPD Executive Assistant Chief Chandra Hatcher on January 31, 2024.

<sup>140.</sup> Matrix Consulting Group, "Final Report on Police Department Capacity and Deployment Options: Milwaukee, Wisconsin," January 6, 2023. Sent electronically to PERF by Milwaukee Police Department Chief of Staff Heather Hough.

<sup>141.</sup> Declan Sullivan & Alaynah Tombridge, "Civilianization in the Philadelphia Police Department," University of Pennsylvania Fels Institute of Government, August 2021, https://www.documentcloud.org/documents/23118177-civilianization-in-the-ppd.
142. *Ibid.*

Specifically, the study identified the following patrol district positions as appropriate for long-term civilianization:

- Sending and Receiving<sup>143</sup>
- Front Desk
- Reports Officer
- Captain's Clerk
- Crime Prevention Officer
- Victim's Assistance Officer
- Quality Assurance Officer
- COMPSTAT Officer
- Crime Analyst

Additionally, the report recommended PPD consider civilianizing positions in the following administrative and specialized units:

- Audio Visual Unit
- Automotive Services
- Commissioner's Office
- Court Liaison Unit
- Crime Scene Unit
- Deputy Commissioner/Operations
- Documents Examination Unit
- Delaware Valley Intelligence Center
- Employee Assistance Program
- Equal Employment Opportunity
- Evidence Custodian
- Executive Officer
- Firearms Identification Unit
- Forensic Science Division
- Forensic Service
- Grants Administration

- Graphic Arts
- Gun Permits
- Human Resources Bureau
- Impound Lot
- Internal Affairs Administration
- Mobile Communications
- Public Affairs
- Quality Assurance Bureau
- Radio Room
- Records and Identification
- Recruit Background Unit
- Reports Control
- Research and Planning
- Real Time Crime Center
- Tow Squad
- School Guards
- Special Advisor to the Commissioner
- Police Administration Building Security
- Philadelphia Crime Information Center
- Personnel Unit
- Police Detention Unit

As this report explains in detail (see p. 26), PPD's union has strongly resisted the agency's civilianization efforts, and implementation progress has been minimal.

## San Jose Police Department

A 2010 city auditor report on civilianization opportunities in the San Jose Police Department (SJPD) identified 88 positions the SJPD could convert from sworn to professional staff, yielding an estimated savings of \$5.1 million annually.<sup>144</sup> Positions

144. Sharon Erickson, City of San Jose, "Audit of Civilianization Opportunities in the San Jose Police Department," January 10, 2010, https://www.sanjoseca.gov/Home/ShowDocument?id=33700.

<sup>143.</sup> *Ibid.* "This function is responsible for handling all basic 'Sending and Receiving' functions of the district by sending forms and reports required by directive to PPD headquarters, documenting various information in standardized forms such as daily staff activity, individuals held in detention, maintenance requests, daily staff assignments, daily complaint summary, etc. The role is fundamentally data entry."

identified for conversion from sworn to professional staff included assignments in the following units:

- Research and Development
- Public Information
- Permits/Secondary Employment
- Gaming Control Division
- Recruiting
- Backgrounding
- Training
- Range/Firearms
- Community Services/Police Athletic League
- Air Support
- Main Lobby

- Pre-Processing/Corrections
- Traffic Enforcement
- Homicide/Crime Scene Investigator
- Vehicular Crimes/Accident Reconstruction
- Court Liaison Unit

SJPD has adopted a methodical approach to implementing the audit's recommendations. According to Lisa Perez, Manager of the Police Fiscal Administration and Personnel Division, "Civilianization review is an ongoing process that has been embedded in the department's internal budget process for consideration of items to put forth in the city's budget process."<sup>145</sup> This has led to the following actions since the 2010 audit:<sup>146</sup>

New Professional Staff Roles	Former Sworn Roles, Now Professional Staff	
Body Worn Camera Project	Court Liaison Unit	
Community Service Officer Program	Video and Warrants Unit	
Evidence Management	Bureau of Technical Services	
Cannabis Regulation Program	Crisis Management	
Recruitment	Personnel	
Forensic Analyst	School Safety	
Crime Prevention Supervisor	Background Investigators	
Crime Data Analysts	Public Information Officer	
Gaming Control Auditor		
Permit Unit		
Crime and Intelligence Analysts		
Public Records Act Requests		

145. Email from Lisa Perez, November 15, 2023. 146. *Ibid*.

## **Evaluating the Results of Civilianization**

Any time an organization implements a major structural or policy change with implications for its performance, resource allocation, and culture, metrics are needed to track and assess the effects of the change. In the case of civilianization, police agencies should be able to describe the inputs, outputs, and outcomes of converting sworn positions to professional staff positions over time.

Unfortunately, law enforcement agencies have not yet undertaken systematic evaluations of their civilianization efforts. Projected outputs and outcomes are plentiful, such as the expectation that "add[ing] civilian positions to the [Chicago Police D]epartment and return[ing] hundreds of officers to law enforcement tasks, including patrol, will reduce overtime costs."<sup>147</sup> But as a matter of practice, agencies have not implemented rigorous practices to determine whether they are meeting their civilianization goals. In fact, when asked about their data collection and evaluation practices related to civilianization, most officials interviewed for this project acknowledged these efforts were missing.

External audits of agencies' civilianization plans have also identified this as an issue. In New York City, the Office of the Comptroller pinpointed data tracking and other record keeping as a primary recommendation in its 2022 audit of the NYPD's civilianization efforts. According to the audit, the NYPD should, "Ensure it has the capacity to produce and appropriately share the data and other records it maintains related to personnel and the civilianization process to enable it and the public to determine if it is meeting the objectives of its civilian mandate.<sup>\*148</sup> **PERF recommends every agency commit to rigorous data collection, analysis, and information sharing related to its civilianization efforts.** 

## What Agencies Should Measure

Although the type and number of metrics chosen will vary by agency, all agencies should consider collecting data in three key areas before and after positions are civilianized: work efficiency, cost savings, and crime response. This will enable them to effectively evaluate the impact of civilianization and to appropriately inform the public and government officials about the results of significant changes to how police services are delivered and funded. Specifically, it will empower agencies to answer important questions such as:

- How many police officers have been transitioned from administrative to operational roles?
- Are the vacancy rates for sworn personnel and professional staff increasing or decreasing?
- Is attrition among sworn officers leveling off or declining?

<sup>147.</sup> Heather Cherone and Jared Rutecki, "Chicago Spent \$524M on Overtime in 2023, Including \$293 for Police, Setting New Records," March 12, 2024, https://news.wttw.com/2024/03/12/chicago-spent-524m-overtime-2023-including-293m-police-setting-new-records.
148. Office of the Comptroller, City of New York, "Audit Report on the New York City Police Department's Civilianization Efforts," January 19, 2022, https://comptroller.nyc.gov/wp-content/uploads/documents/MG20\_117A.pdf.

## RCMP's Audit and Evaluation of the Civilian Criminal Investigator Position

The RCMP, eager to assess the efficacy of how it is implementing the Civilian Criminal Investigator (CCI) position, has engaged its Audit and Evaluation Group to design a study methodology. In partnership with CCI managers, who will help define the study's scope and ensure it is realistic, the Audit and Evaluation Group will endeavor to answer the following kinds of questions:

- 1. What were the investigators' experiences?
- 2. Did the investigators receive training?
- 3. Was the training timely?
- 4. Are investigators performing tasks according to policy and procedure?
- 5. How were the investigators integrated into the agency?
- 6. Did the investigators feel like part of the team?
- Has the agency's response time to calls for service decreased?
- Are more criminal cases being cleared?
- Are overtime costs for sworn personnel decreasing?
- Are professional staff performing at a level equal to or higher than sworn personnel who previously served in the roles?

#### **Work Efficiency**

When agencies consider civilianizing positions, assessing whether such a transition improves work efficiency — that is, achieves maximal output with minimal wasted input — is crucial.<sup>149</sup> Agencies can evaluate improvements in work efficiency through various metrics.

One evaluation method involves analyzing the *speed* at which tasks are completed, while upholding high-quality standards, before and after civilianization. For example, an agency could assess the work efficiency of a civilianized position that involves analyzing crime patterns or processing evidence at crime scenes by tracking the number of analyses

completed or the number of crime scenes processed within a specified timeframe.

Assessing the *quality* of work produced is another measure of work efficiency. By comparing the quality of work pre- and post-civilianization, agencies can determine whether there has been any discernible improvement in work efficiency. In the case of writing lesson plans for the training academy, it would be important to assess whether a professional curriculum writer hired for this role develops lesson plans that are more consistent with established rubrics for adult learners than those previously developed by a police officer.

#### **Cost Savings**

Saving money is a primary goal of civilianization, so agencies should measure the budgetary impact of civilianizing positions.

The Polk County (FL) Sheriff's Office (PCSO) is an example of how employing civilians can generate cost savings. Using funding from the Edward Byrne Memorial Competitive Grant Program, which (among other things) provides funding to law

149. Peter Eichorn and Ian Towers, Principles of Management: Efficiency and Effectiveness in the Private and Public Sector, 2018, Springer International Publishing.

enforcement agencies to hire civilians for certain functions, the PCSO created a Sheriff's Services Officer (SSO) program.<sup>150</sup> The SSO program assigns civilians to respond to non-emergency calls such as motor vehicle accidents without serious injury, criminal mischief, theft, fraud, and "cold" burglary cases where the offender is no longer at the scene. In turn, deputy sheriffs prioritize responding to more serious and violent calls for service.

Because civilians receive lower pay and benefits than sworn deputies, the PSCO saved nearly \$500,000 per year by hiring professional staff for non-emergency calls rather than continuing to rely on an equal number of sworn officers.<sup>151</sup> PCSO's experience suggests that agencies should document their costs for staff in specific positions before and after civilianization to quantify any savings over time.

#### **Crime Response**

When assessing the impact of civilianization on crime response, it is useful to look at both the direct response to crime (e.g., calls for service) and the investigative process.

In the PCSO, the primary objective for civilianizing positions was to alleviate the burden on sworn deputies of responding to minor issues. This enables the deputies to focus on more serious and dangerous calls for service and to engage with the public and problem solve. Agencies should compare response times for various types of calls for service under civilianization compared to the previous model. Ideally, agencies should experience decreased response times for both serious and less serious calls.

At the same time, agencies should consider measuring the success of professional staff at resolving, for example, minor traffic issues and burglary cases, including how quickly reports were filed and how community members felt their issues were handled. Agencies will want to assess the benefits of enabling sworn officers to focus on strategic priorities (e.g., increasing officers' time on patrol, attending community meetings, or implementing a community violence intervention program) and the effects of professional staff responding to calls for service that sworn officers previously handled. Surveying members of the community is one way to measure their level of satisfaction.

Agencies should also assess whether professional staff improve investigative outcomes. For example, rather than training sworn personnel to become intelligence analysts, police departments can hire professional staff with the education and knowledge to perform crime mapping, data analysis, and crime analysis. Agencies that do so should evaluate whether employing professional staff in these roles improves investigative outcomes, such as faster and more accurate suspect identification, enhanced evidence tracing, or more timely case dispositions.

Additionally, non-sworn crime analysts and investigators can free up sworn investigators' time by doing some of their legwork. When professional staff help perform critical investigative tasks such as conducting criminal history checks and social network analyses, interviewing witnesses, writing search warrants, and creating flyers for wanted persons, detectives can handle heavier caseloads more effectively.<sup>152</sup> Thus, the rates at which investigative tasks are completed and cases are solved with professional staff support are meaningful metrics for assessing civilianization.

In addition to helping detectives with the most serious crimes, professional staff investigators can assume responsibility for investigating crimes such as identity theft, burglaries, stolen autos, larcenies from auto, and incidents such as traffic crashes.<sup>153</sup> If departments judiciously delegate some of these responsibilities to professional staff, they can give the detectives investigating the most serious

150. Robert C. Davis *et al.*, "Civilian Staff in Policing: An Assessment of the 2009 Byrne Civilian Hiring Program," Police Executive Research Forum, December 31, 2013, https://www.ojp.gov/pdffiles1/nij/grants/246952.pdf.

<sup>151.</sup> Ibid.

<sup>152.</sup> Ibid.

<sup>153.</sup> Ibid.

offenses — murder, sexual assault, robbery, and aggravated assault — caseloads that are more in keeping with investigative best practices.

To gauge the effectiveness of reallocating investigative responsibilities between sworn and professional staff, agencies should consider tracking the assignment of cases by employee classification (i.e., sworn or professional staff), case type, tasks completed, time spent performing tasks, and case disposition.

#### Sample Evaluation Plans

In determining whether a position is amenable to civilianization, it is good practice to adopt a systematic approach such as a decision tree, as the Vancouver (BC) Police Department (VPD) did in its civilianization study.<sup>154</sup> The VPD asked three of the five questions (referred to above, see p. 51) commonly used to determine whether a sworn position is suitable for civilianization:

- 1. Does the position require law enforcement powers, such as the authority to make arrests, use force, adhere to statutory mandates, or carry a firearm?
- 2. Are the skills, training, experience, or credibility of a sworn police officer required to fulfill the duties of the position?
- 3. Can a specially trained civilian fulfill the requirements of the position?

This section applies these questions to three common police agency roles — human resources (HR), crime analyst, and court liaison — as examples of how an agency might consider whether positions are suitable for civilianization.

#### Human Resources

An agency's HR unit plays a crucial role, especially amid the ongoing challenges of recruiting and retaining quality personnel.<sup>155</sup> Inadequate staffing levels often force agencies to reduce services and units,<sup>156</sup> so a robust and efficient HR unit is vital to an agency's effective operation.

HR *specialists* are responsible for frontline HR duties, including recruiting, screening, interviewing, and placing new hires.<sup>157</sup> HR *managers* oversee and coordinate the organization's administrative functions, including supervising HR specialists during recruitment and hiring.<sup>158</sup> Both types of HR professionals typically hold at least a bachelor's degree and possess industry experience. Leveraging their formal education, training, and experience, professional HR personnel may complete HR-related tasks more precisely and efficiently than sworn staff.

Agencies have multiple ways to measure the impact of switching from sworn personnel to professional staff performing HR-related duties. First, because recruiting and hiring are crucial functions of HR specialists, agencies should measure a variety of performance indicators:

- Number of applicants;
- Diversity of applicants;
- Number of applicants who meet a position's minimum requirements;
- Time needed to complete each step of the application process (respond to inquiries from prospective applicants, collect documents for the background investigation, ensure background investigators and others are processing applications in a timely manner, etc.); and

<sup>154.</sup> Curt Taylor Griffiths, Nahanni Pollard, and Tom Stamatakis, "Assessing the effectiveness and efficiency of a police service: The analytics of operational reviews," *Police Practice and Research*, Vol. 16, No. 2, 2015, https://doi.org/10.1080/15614263.2014.972621. 155. Bureau of Justice Assistance and Office of Community Oriented Policing Services, "Recruitment and Retention for the Modern

Law Enforcement Agency," 2023, https://bja.ojp.gov/doc/recruitment-retention-modern-le-agency.pdf.

<sup>156.</sup> International Association of Chiefs of Police, "The State of Recruitment: A Crisis for Law Enforcement," 2019, https://www.theiacp. org/sites/default/files/239416\_IACP\_RecruitmentBR\_HR\_0.pdf.

<sup>157.</sup> Bureau of Labor Statistics, "What Human Resources Specialists Do," September 6, 2023, https://www.bls.gov/ooh/business-and-financial/human-resources-specialists.htm#tab-2.

<sup>158.</sup> Bureau of Labor Statistics, "What Human Resources Managers Do," September 6, 2023, https://www.bls.gov/ooh/management/human-resources-managers.htm#tab-2.

Also, because the quality of personnel who are hired is essential to an agency's success, departments could consider comparing the performance of personnel hired by sworn staff and by professional staff. For example, they could compare employees' years of service (retention), performance evaluations, disciplinary records, attendance history, commendations, and promotion record.

#### **Crime Analyst**

Crime analysis is an essential function within police agencies; effective crime analysis helps support criminal investigations, enhances prosecutorial efforts, and facilitates operational functions.<sup>159</sup> With technological advances enabling new ways to commit crime as well as new ways to measure, locate, and visualize it, crime analysis is a challenging endeavor, demanding extensive time for data collection, classification, and pattern identification.<sup>160</sup>

Traditionally, crime and intelligence analyses have been predominately carried out by sworn personnel.<sup>161</sup> The increasing integration of professional staff into these roles reflects a growing recognition that sworn officers often lack the formal education, training, and experience required for proficient crime analysis.<sup>162</sup> Agencies that use sworn officers as crime analysts typically must both train them for this duty and identify other officers to fill the operational roles they vacated. Employing professional staff with the credentials to serve as crime analysts relieves agencies of these burdens.

To evaluate the impact of civilianizing the crime analyst position, agencies should consider assessing

the quality of their work product at each of the five steps of crime analysis:

- 1. Data Collection;
- 2. Classification;
- 3. Pattern Identification;
- 4. Prediction; and
- 5. Visualization.<sup>163</sup>

For example, a comparative analysis between sworn and professional staff could determine the quantity and quality of data collected. Agencies could also evaluate whether professional staff analysts classify data and identify patterns more accurately than sworn officers. And they could assess the relative effectiveness and quality of predictive analytics and data visualizations generated by the two groups.

#### **Court Liaison**

Court liaisons serve a vital administrative role in supporting police departments. Their responsibilities encompass tasks such as collaborating with prosecutors and representing arresting officers in cases that do not go to trial.<sup>164</sup> Court liaisons also undertake such duties as managing hearing notices and subpoenas, handling department paperwork, tracking court dispositions, maintaining records, and preparing reports.<sup>165</sup> Their regular presence as a point of contact for the prosecutor's office and other court officials streamlines information exchange, saving valuable time for prosecutors and on-duty officers.

Officers receive overtime pay to appear in court; this cost can add up quickly if the case is

- 163. Sathyadevan, Devan, and Gangadharan.
- 164. Davis et al.
- 165. Ibid.

<sup>159.</sup> Bureau of Justice Assistance, "Overview of Crime Analysis," https://bja.ojp.gov/sites/g/files/xyckuh186/files/media/document/ OverviewofCrimeAnalysis.pdf.

<sup>160.</sup> Shiju Sathyadevan, M. S. Devan, and S. Surya Gangadharan, "Crime analysis and prediction using data mining," First International Conference on Networks & Soft Computing (ICNSC2014), August 2014, https://ieeexplore.ieee.org/document/6906719.

<sup>161.</sup> John Kiedrowski *et al.*, "The Civilianization of Police Services in Canada," Compliance Strategy Group, 2015, https://doi.org/ 10.13140/RG.2.2.35759.12969.

<sup>162.</sup> Ibid.

not promptly adjudicated or multiple officers are required to appear as witnesses.<sup>166</sup> Using liaisons to interface with court officials until officers are needed to testify should generate cost savings given the liaisons' lower salaries and the ability of departments to prohibit them from working costly overtime.<sup>167</sup> Appropriate metrics for evaluating the impact of civilianizing the crime court liaison position include salary savings and the amount of time officers spend in court rather than performing their primary duties. One tangible measure might be annual overtime pay expenditures before and after establishing a professional court liaison position. Another measure could be the number of court cases where officers fail to appear. If an agency identifies this as a problem, the addition of a court liaison should be associated with a drop in officers failing to appear in court.

166. Ibid.

<sup>167.</sup> William R. King and Jeremy M. Wilson, "Police Consolidation: Integrating Civilian Staff into Police Agencies," Office of Community Oriented Policing Services, 2014, https://portal.cops.usdoj.gov/resourcecenter/ric/Publications/cops-p290-pub.pdf.

# **10 Tips for Successful Civilianization**

#### For years now, many law enforcement

agencies have made good-faith efforts to implement civilianization. As commendable as these efforts have been, many agencies have encountered an undeniable reality: civilianization in policing is difficult to achieve. There are a number of reasons why, including tradition and culture, resistance from sworn employees and their unions, skepticism among some public officials and members of the public, and short-term budgetary pressures.

But there are agencies that have committed to civilianization and confronted the obstacles in ways that are both creative and common-sense. For this project, PERF studied 20 of these agencies and reviewed what the research literature says about civilianization. Based on that review, we have identified the following ten tips for agencies to follow as they look to implement a successful civilianization program.

(1

#### Call Civilians "Professional Staff"

What we label something — especially employees in an organization — can have a profound impact on individual perceptions and organizational culture. In fact, according to David S. Slawson, "Anthropologists recognize naming as 'one of the chief methods for imposing order on perception."<sup>168</sup> In law enforcement agencies, how personnel are named or identified has important implications for how their status is perceived in the organization. As Deputy Chief Greg Halstead of the Sacramento Police Department said, "You hear a lot of agencies refer to professional staff as civilians, but we transitioned our terminology about four or five years ago, to really help make them feel more included."

To promote a workplace culture where everyone is equally valued and committed to supporting the organization's mission, agencies should follow the lead of the Sacramento PD and others and refer to employees as "sworn personnel" and "professional staff." Use of the terms "non-sworn" and "civilian" should be discouraged. Adoption of this practice can be expedited by issuing a policy document -ageneral order, chief's memorandum, or training bulletin — that explains why use of the term "professional staff" is important. In addition, agency general orders and other policy documents should be reviewed and updated to reflect this language. Agency leadership should then reinforce this policy by using the term in all communications and taking corrective action when personnel refer to professional staff as "non-sworn" or "civilian."

## 2 Adopt Civilianization as an Organizational Best Practice

Some agencies may be inclined to view civilianization as a temporary solution, needed only as long as the duration of the sworn staffing crisis.

168. Julie Louceil Germain Walker, "I now pronounce you...uhh": A qualitative autoethnographic exploration of women's and men's marital surname-choice experiences, 2012. [Master's thesis, Minnesota State University, Mankato]. Cornerstone: A Collection of Scholarly and Creative Works for Minnesota State University, Mankato. https://cornerstone.lib.mnsu.edu/etds/50/.

This is short-sighted. The challenge of recruiting and retaining police officers may be the catalyst to civilianizing positions, but the benefits of increasing agencies' professional staff should long outlive the crisis. For example, the advantages of sending professional staff rather than police officers to behavioral health calls for service where the subject is unarmed and non-violent extend beyond dispatching fewer 911 calls to sworn personnel; using professional staff can improve outcomes and reduce the risks of these situations resulting in the use of force. And the improved instructional quality that professional curriculum writers deliver will serve agencies' training interests well into the future.

Police departments should embed into their organizational culture the many benefits that come with civilianization: increased skills, specialization, improved performance, role stability, less costly salaries and benefits, fewer training requirements, more balanced workloads, and optimization of police officers' discretionary time. Beyond these benefits, once the sworn staffing crisis has abated, the development of a robust civilianization plan is an opportunity to increase hiring standards for police officers — for example, to require a bachelor's degree, raise the minimum age, or require prior employment experience.

## **3** Develop a Comprehensive Implementation Strategy

Civilianization is a significant undertaking. To increase its chances of success, agencies are encouraged to develop a comprehensive implementation strategy with the following components: job analysis, policy development, role classification (sworn or professional staff), position description, recruitment, hiring, onboarding, goals and objectives, timelines, key partners, task assignments, stakeholder input, projected benefits and outcomes, communications strategy, and evaluation plan.

The first step is to conduct a job analysis. The employment website *Indeed* defines a job analysis as "the practice of gathering and analyzing details about a particular job, such as responsibilities, day-to-day duties, hard and soft skills, qualifications, education, expected outcomes, interaction, performance standards, work conditions, physical abilities and supervision."<sup>169</sup> Once a job analysis is completed for all positions an agency is considering for civilianization, an experienced and diverse committee should be tasked with answering five questions to classify each position as either sworn or professional staff:

- 1. Does the position require law enforcement duties (i.e., powers of arrest, use of force, statutory requirements, carrying a firearm)?
- 2. Are the skills, training, experience, or credibility of a sworn officer required to fulfill the duties of the position?
- 3. Would assigning a sworn officer to the position be helpful in developing their leadership skills?
- 4. Would assigning a sworn officer be helpful for other reasons?
- 5. Could a specially trained professional staff member fulfill the requirements of the position?

A position is typically suitable for civilianization if the team answers "no" to questions 1 through 4 and "yes" to question 5, although some agencies may decide there are benefits to civilianizing a particular position even if their answers to these questions do not align exactly. Agencies are encouraged to include this decision-making process in a policy written specifically to address civilianization. A civilianization policy can be helpful in explaining to various stakeholders — employees, union leaders, elected officials, budget-makers, and residents — how personnel decisions are made, the key role of professional staff in a law enforcement organization, and the multitude of benefits civilianization brings.

The next steps of the implementation strategy are perhaps a bit more familiar to most law enforcement agencies: creating position descriptions and recruiting, hiring, and onboarding personnel. Nevertheless, agencies should be mindful that a push to hire and onboard large

<sup>169.</sup> Indeed, "What Is Job Analysis?" Accessed June 12, 2024, https://www.indeed.com/hire/c/info/what-is-job-analysis.

numbers of professional staff in a short time can strain the capacity of human resources and recruitment personnel. This is why it is critical to establish realistic goals and objectives (including timelines) for implementation of the civilianization strategy.

As part of the strategy, agencies should identify and assemble key partners. For example, in its effort to hire nearly 400 professional staff in 2024, the Chicago Police Department secured the full commitment of the City's Department of Human Resources and Office of Public Safety Administration. Without their participation, the CPD knows it will not realize its projected benefits and outcomes, which include "increasing the number of cops on the street by freeing officers assigned to desk duty, . . . [and] rein[ing] in costs."<sup>170</sup>

An additional component of a well-developed civilianization strategy is a communications plan that reaches key stakeholders. Among these stakeholders are public officials with budgetary authority, current employees, union representatives, other involved government agencies, and the public, who will want to know how civilianization may affect the police services they receive and how their tax dollars are spent.

As discussed below (see Tip 10), the strategy should also include an evaluation plan to determine whether the project's goals and objectives have been achieved according to the implementation plan. Evaluation is essential not only for accountability and transparency purposes, but also for building support to civilianize additional positions if desired outcomes are being achieved.

## 4

## Set Ambitious Goals

In 2006, professional staff represented roughly 16 percent of the Vancouver Police Department's total personnel.<sup>171</sup> Due to an ambitious plan designed to "establish itself as the clear leader in civilianization among North American police departments,"<sup>172</sup> today 30 percent of the department is staffed by professional staff.<sup>173</sup> More recently, Chicago's 2024 budget allocated funding to create nearly 400 new professional staff positions in one fiscal year.<sup>174</sup>

PERF encourages other law enforcement agencies to establish similarly ambitious goals for civilianization. With 21 percent of personnel in local law enforcement agencies made up of professional staff (as of 2020),<sup>175</sup> there is tremendous opportunity for growth in this area. Once shortterm goals are achieved, and agencies provide their administrations and the public with evidence of the benefits of civilianization (for example, cost savings, improved officer morale, increased employee retention, role stability, more proactive officer engagement, and performance improvements), opportunities to further increase the number of professional staff can be pursued.

## **5** Prepare for Internal Resistance

Former Aurora (CO) Police Chief Art Acevedo told PERF, "There wasn't any pushback from the city or union to create these [professional staff] positions. The city sees it as good management, and the officers — who are understaffed — are happy to have the help." It is encouraging to hear police chiefs and sheriffs say their officers have welcomed professional staff with open arms. But

<sup>170.</sup> Alice Yin, "Brandon Johnson won office with a nontraditional vision for policing. Does his first CPD budget line up?" *Chicago Tribune*, November 25, 2023, https://www.chicagotribune.com/2023/11/25/brandon-johnson-won-office-with-a-nontraditional-vision-for-policing-does-his-first-cpd-budget-line-up/.

<sup>171.</sup> Vancouver Police Department, "Civilianization in the Vancouver Police Department," March 13, 2006, https://council.vancouver. ca/documents/rr1onfile4.pdf.

<sup>172.</sup> Ibid.

<sup>173.</sup> Adam Palmer, PERF Annual Meeting, May 30, 2024, Orlando, Florida.

<sup>174.</sup> Alice Yin, "Brandon Johnson won office with a nontraditional vision for policing. Does his first CPD budget line up?" *Chicago Tribune*, November 25, 2023, https://www.chicagotribune.com/2023/11/25/brandon-johnson-won-office-with-a-nontraditional-vision-for-policing-does-his-first-cpd-budget-line-up/.

<sup>175.</sup> Sean E. Goodison, "Local Police Departments Personnel, 2020," Bureau of Justice Statistics, November 2022, https://bjs.ojp.gov/sites/g/files/xyckuh236/files/media/document/lpdp20.pdf.

some police officers may be reluctant to support civilianization efforts, and agencies should be prepared for resistance.

Although some agencies endure a protracted collective bargaining process over multiple contract negotiation cycles to civilianize the desired number of sworn positions (e.g., see the Philadelphia Police Department, page 26), most executives said officers' misgivings about civilianization can be assuaged by explaining why the personnel moves are being made and how they will impact officers' current assignments and future opportunities for advancement.

A good way to learn about officers' concerns regarding civilianization is by speaking with union officials or informal leaders in agencies that are not unionized. Other avenues for obtaining feedback include an organizational survey, suggestion boxes located in stationhouses and other facilities, email, chain of command, or an ad hoc committee comprised of representatives from various divisions. However the feedback is received, it will likely revolve around officers' fears: of being pushed out of desirable assignments, of being medically forced out of the job because administrative assignments are filled by professional staff, and of having fewer opportunities for promotion.

Command personnel should address these issues head on to dispel rumors and calm anxieties. When Deputy Commissioner Brian Nadeau of the Baltimore Police Department spoke to Internal Affairs detectives about the department's plans to hire Investigative Specialists, he illustrated the kind of forthright conversations agency leaders might have with their personnel about civilianization: "I told everyone, nobody who currently works here is going to be transferred out. Are we going to take in civilians? Yes. Will some sworn personnel that [transfer or promote from] here not have their positions refilled? Yes. But at the end of the day, nobody was getting removed, and we weren't looking to completely make Internal Affairs a civilian shop." Agencies that are planning to reassign existing sworn personnel because of civilianization should be honest about the reasons for the moves and the process and timelines that will be followed.

	Z	
	0	
<b>_</b>		

## **Treat Professional Staff as Equals to Sworn Staff**

Although the roles and responsibilities of professional staff and sworn personnel differ, leadership should clearly communicate to all employees that everyone is equally valued. Agencies can uphold the value of professional staff in a variety of ways: recognition at awards ceremonies, involvement in employee appreciation events, participation in meetings with sworn personnel, inclusion and authority in decision-making, promotion to command positions, referring to them as "professional staff" rather than "civilians" or "non-sworn," providing ongoing training and professional development opportunities, and public discussion of the key roles professional staff play in law enforcement operations and delivering public safety services.

Agencies are encouraged to periodically survey their employees to assess whether they believe professional and sworn staff are valued equally and treated fairly. Open-ended questions should be included in the survey to identify issues management may not otherwise know about.



7

#### **Provide Career Growth Opportunities for Professional Staff**

Many police officials told PERF it is as challenging to hire and retain professional staff as it is sworn staff. Qualified applicants may be dissuaded by comparatively low salaries and minimal opportunities for career growth, such as variety of assignments, training, promotions, and consistent raises. Professional staff who already work for a law enforcement agency are often compelled to seek positions in other fields where such incentives are more readily available.

To overcome these challenges, agencies should prioritize creating a career path for as many professional staff positions as possible. Professional staff who work as trainers, crime analysts, crime scene technicians, community service officers, auditors, and investigators, for example, can be supervised
by professional staff who are more experienced and credentialed for these specialized assignments than many sworn supervisors. Agencies can also adopt personnel policies that give preference to current professional staff over external candidates for promotions and lateral assignments.

Agencies are also encouraged to collaborate with a cross-section of professional staff to develop a comprehensive training program that meets the diverse needs of professional employees. It should include a robust orientation process for new employees, with sufficient flexibility to ensure that everyone's onboarding needs are met regardless of position status or unit of assignment. The orientation program should also discuss how to acclimate to the law enforcement environment and work with sworn members. Annual continuing education courses (with a minimum number of hours to be taken by all employees) should also be part of the program. This ongoing training can be provided by the agency, other government agencies (local, state, and federal), or through external sources such as colleges and universities and private companies. Employees and supervisors should be informed of available training opportunities at the beginning of each calendar or fiscal year so they can set schedules and establish opportunities for selecting courses to attend. All required training hours should occur during work hours, and agencies should create a professional staff training budget to meet the needs of their employees.

## Prioritize College Students and Recent Graduates

8

PERF's research of civilianization in law enforcement agencies revealed an interest among college students to work in policing. In fact, contrary to public sentiment that younger workers hold persistently negative attitudes toward police, the Baltimore Police Department and Tucson Police Department have found tremendous success in hiring recent college graduates into professional staff positions as Investigative Specialists and Professional Staff Investigators. Notably, both departments have also reported that women have shown proportionately more interest in these professional staff positions than sworn positions, and once hired, they've admirably performed their duties.

PERF found similar results among college students and recent college graduates while administering the PERF-HBCU Summer Internship Program. By interacting with college students and creating opportunities to immerse them in the law enforcement profession, PERF learned the interns are more likely to consider becoming police officers or professional staff members within a police agency. As PERF's study on the internship reported, "By 'going upstream' to identify college students currently interested in policing or cultivate an interest in students to move into the field, agencies can invest in their future and attract some of the next generation's best and brightest to a career in the policing profession."

For many specialized positions, such as information technology and data analysis, a college education is a prerequisite. In addition, college graduates are likely to bring a range of experiences and perspectives that are helpful to law enforcement agencies serving increasingly diverse communities.

## Offer the Most Competitive Compensation Possible

9

Law enforcement agencies can't solve every problem by throwing money at it, and budgetary practicalities often limit their ability to vie with private industry for the most highly credentialed professional staff. But offering competitive salaries and other incentives is as essential for recruiting and retaining talented professional staff as it is for police officers.

As such, agencies should consider applying some of the strategies that have been successfully used in recruiting and retaining police officers to their efforts to recruit and retain professional staff. These strategies, many of which PERF detailed in its August 2023 report, "Responding to the Staffing Crisis: Innovations In Recruitment and Retention,"<sup>176</sup> include routinely surveying the

176. PERF, "Responding to the Staffing Crisis," August 2023, https://www.policeforum.org/assets/RecruitmentRetention.pdf.

salaries of similar positions in public and private industries to remain competitive in the marketplace; communicating with fiscal decision-makers the importance of professional staff in running highperforming police organizations; paying relocation costs; offering hiring and longevity bonuses; providing robust healthcare plans and employee wellness programs; and improving retirement options.

A paradigm shift in policing is potentially afoot, marked by a significant increase in the percentage of professional staff who are serving in roles and carrying out duties previously performed almost exclusively by sworn personnel. For the profession to realize the benefits offered by this transformation, it is incumbent upon police executives to lobby for competitive salaries on behalf of professional staff as hard as they have for sworn personnel.

In the Seattle Police Department, for example, executives pursued pay compression between professional staff and sworn personnel who performed similar duties. According to Chief Operating Officer Brian Maxey, "This not only brought pay parity, but it affirmed the value of the department's professional staff."

## 10

## **Evaluate Implementation**

The most consistently overlooked component of a comprehensive civilianization plan is evaluation. This is contrary to good management practices and leaves officials unable to answer the most basic and important questions: Did we accomplish what we set out to achieve? Did we solve the problem? Did we improve performance?

Agencies are often unable to answer these questions because they fail to develop a plan for collecting data. Thus, before implementing the civilianization process, agencies should determine what needs to be measured and how they should measure it. Table 6 provides several examples of the questions agencies may want to answer and the data they could collect to do so.

Data collection, analysis, and evaluation should be an ongoing process for agencies to determine whether their goals around civilianization are being met. If goals are being met, agencies may want to seek additional opportunities for civilianization, citing cost savings, effective utilization of resources, and improved performance as reasons for increasing the number of professional staff. If goals are not being met, agencies should explore the reasons why. Was the civilianization plan fully implemented? Were professional staff properly trained and oriented to the organization? Were pay and benefits commensurate with their education, skills, experience, and job duties? Did sworn staff treat professional staff as equally valued employees? Did the agency provide professional staff with sufficient opportunities for career growth? All these issues, and more, should be considered when evaluating the outcomes of civilianization.

## Table 6

Question	Baseline Data	Outcome Data
Did hiring professional staff as firearms instructors (i.e., former/ retired police officers) reduce assignment turnover and provide role stability in the training academy?	Length of time each sworn firearms instructor was assigned to the training academy before civilianization.	Length of time each professional staff firearms instructor has been assigned to the training academy since the civilianization process began.
Has the number of hours officers spend working patrol overtime been reduced since the department hired professional staff Community Service Officers?	Number of hours officers spent working patrol overtime during the past five years before the agency hired professional staff Community Service Officers for each patrol district.	Number of hours officers spent working patrol overtime since the agency hired professional staff Community Service Officers for each patrol district.
How many sworn personnel have been reassigned from administrative roles to operational roles since the civilianization process began?	Number of sworn personnel assigned to administrative roles and operational roles before civilianization.	Number of sworn personnel reassigned from administrative roles to operational roles since the civilianization process began.
Are Part 1 crime clearance rates higher since Professional Staff Investigators were hired to assist sworn detectives?	Clearance rates for all Part 1 crime in the five years before the agency hired Professional Staff Investigators to investigate criminal cases.	Clearance rates for all Part 1 crime since the agency hired Professional Staff Investigators to investigate criminal cases.

# Conclusion

#### Perhaps the biggest crisis facing law

enforcement agencies today is attracting and retaining sworn police officers.

Over the last several years, PERF has been tracking trends in officer hiring, as well as resignations and retirements. Annual surveys have found that, in general, hiring has declined and resignations and retirements have increased, especially since the onset of the COVID-19 pandemic and the social unrest following the death of George Floyd in police custody. While PERF's latest survey suggests the staffing crisis may be easing, agencies should not be lulled into thinking that they are out of the woods just yet. Large police departments and sheriffs' offices continue to face serious challenges, which is affecting their ability to adequately staff patrol cars, detective squads, and specialized units without taking drastic and costly measures such as mandatory overtime.

Albert Einstein is credited with saying, "In the midst of every crisis, lies great opportunity."<sup>177</sup> The crisis in police officer staffing presents a unique opportunity for law enforcement agencies to rethink how they allocate resources and deliver public safety services to the community. Civilianization can be a key strategy for addressing the staffing crisis in smart, strategic, and costconscious ways.

Civilianization just makes sense. It moves sworn officers from assignments that don't

require a badge and a gun into roles that they are uniquely trained and equipped for: responding to emergency calls for service, investigating crime and arresting offenders, and working with the community to prevent crime and build safer neighborhoods. At the same time, civilianization can bring educated, experienced, and diverse professionals into many of the assignments that are critical to today's law enforcement operations. These include highly specialized fields such as information technology, data analysis, forensics, public affairs, and the like. If done strategically and methodically, civilianization can both improve agency performance and reduce costs.

Civilianization is not easy, even for agencies that are committed to the process. There will be obstacles, including bureaucracy, internal resistance, and even public skepticism. This report has laid out many of these barriers. But it has also offered strategies on how to overcome them. The report provides common-sense and practical guidance on how to implement a civilianization program and how to evaluate its impact. Importantly, the report provides useful examples from agencies that have made important strides toward civilianization and have learned valuable lessons along the way.

This is a crucial time for policing. While homicides and other violent crimes have declined recently, they remain stubbornly high in many communities. So do the rates of drug abuse and

177. Albert Einstein, Accessed June 12, 2024, https://www.goodreads.com/quotes/10196552-in-the-midst-of-every-crisis-lies-great-opportunity.

overdose deaths. And there are new threats — as well as new opportunities — posed by technologies such as artificial intelligence.

To address these and other challenges, law enforcement agencies need to ensure they have, in the words of management guru Jim Collins, "the right people on the bus ... in the right seats." By hiring qualified and dedicated professional staff, working alongside sworn personnel focused on the jobs they have been trained and equipped for, agencies can create more effective organizations and safer communities.

# Appendix A: Interview Guide

#### In researching this report, PERF consulted

with 20 different law enforcement agencies about their experiences with civilianization. PERF staff used the following interview guide when talking with the agency subject matter experts. Not every question was asked of every interview subject, and some follow-up questions naturally deviated from the basic interview script. However, these questions formed the basis of the interview that uncovered much of the valuable information contained in the report.

- 1. Why did your agency decide to transition some of its sworn positions to professional staff positions?
- 2. Are you still transitioning sworn positions to professional staff positions?
- 3. How many positions did your agency transition from sworn to professional staff personnel?
- 4. Which positions were transitioned?
- 5. How long did it take to create the positions and onboard personnel?
- 6. Can you share with us the position descriptions and qualification requirements?
- 7. How were the positions funded?
  - A. Were sworn positions cut? If yes, how many?
  - B. Are these cuts permanent?
  - C. Were funds temporarily reallocated from sworn to non-sworn positions?
    - 1) Is there a plan to refund the sworn positions?

- 8. Are there any certification requirements for the positions? What are they?
  - A. Are employees expected to have the certifications when they apply?
- 9. What are the training requirements for the positions?
  - A. How long does it take to complete the training?
  - B. What are the costs of the training? How does this compare to training sworn personnel?
  - C. Is the training provided in-house or externally?
  - D. Is the training provided pre- or post-hire?
- 10. Did you have to make any changes to local or state laws to facilitate the transition of these positions?
- 11. What was community sentiment toward transitioning these positions from sworn to civilian (i.e., were people upset that sworn officers weren't responding to or handling incidents they previously handled?)? How strong was the sentiment, and how did it manifest?
- 12. Was there political support or opposition to the moves? How were the politicians helpful or obstructive?
- 13. Would you characterize the city/county/state government/administration (including HR) as helpful or an impediment to the transition? What specific actions did they take?

- 14. We often hear of union or labor opposition to the transition of positions from sworn to professional staff personnel. What was your experience?
  - A. How did the rank-and-file (separate from the union) respond to these moves?
- 15. What have been the results (outputs and outcomes) of transitioning the position(s) from sworn personnel to professional staff?
  - A. Cost savings?
  - B. Sworn personnel transitioned from administrative to operational roles?
  - C. Reduced time to hire and train personnel?
  - D. Work efficiencies (e.g., additional cases processed, clearance rates, other metrics)?

- 16. What were the greatest challenges of this transition process?
- 17. What have been the greatest benefits?
- 18. In addition to the positions you've already transitioned to professional staff, are there are any other positions you think could be transitioned? What do you think the benefits would be?
- 19. Is there anything you haven't already said that you would recommend to other agencies who are considering making this transition?
- 20. That concludes my questions. Is there anything you would like to add?

# Appendix B: Position Descriptions

**This appendix contains sample position descriptions** of some of the professional staff jobs that agencies shared with PERF as part of the research for this report.



Background Investigator: San Jose Police Department<sup>178</sup>

#### Job Summary

Under close supervision by a sworn officer or supervisor, conducts comprehensive prebackground investigations that meet all current legal standards. Responsible for developing, conducting, and reporting on background investigations to assure compliance with all minimum standards for appointment and all CA Peace Officer Standards and Training ("POST") "Areas of Investigation" regulations and/or all San Jose Police Department ("SJPD") procedures and protocols.

#### **Minimum Qualifications**

- Graduation from high school or equivalent and five (5) years' experience as a peace officer in good standing with a California law enforcement agency, including two years of investigative experience.
- Possession of a valid California Class C Driver's License is required and must be maintained during the entire term of employment in the job class.

#### Basic Competencies

- Job Expertise Demonstrates knowledge of and experience with applicable fair employment practices, professional/technical principles and practices, Citywide and departmental procedures/policies and federal and state rules and regulations.
- Analytical Thinking Approaches a situation or problem by defining the problem or issue; identifies a set of features, parameters, or considerations to consider, collects and analyzes data, uses logic and intuition to arrive at conclusions and recommendations.
- Communication Skills Communicates and listens effectively and responds in a timely, effective, positive, and respectful manner; written reports and correspondence are accurate, complete, current; well-organized, legible, concise, neat, and in proper grammatical form.

<sup>178.</sup> Source: San Jose Police Department, position posted 2/1/2017.

- Maintaining Personal Credibility/Meeting Ethical Standards – When confronted with ethical dilemmas, acts in a way that reflects relevant law, policy and procedures, agency values, and personal values.
- Multi-Tasking Can handle multiple projects and responsibilities simultaneously; has handled a wide variety of assignments in past and/or current position(s).
- Problem Solving Approaches a situation or problem by defining the problem or issue; determines the significance of problem(s); collects information; uses logic and intuition to arrive at decisions or solutions to problems that achieve the desired outcome.
- Reliability Completes quality work assignments in a timely and efficient manner; fulfills responsibilities and maintains confidentiality as appropriate.

#### **Desired Qualifications**

- Knowledge and experience conducting background investigations.
- Experience as an officer with the San Jose Police Department.
- Knowledge of applicable local, state, and federal fair employment laws.
- Ability to articulate the information gathered from a wide variety of sources and summarize findings and recommend suitability.
- Knowledge of interview techniques, the ability to conduct interviews and the ability to prepare investigative reports.
- Knowledge of department standards and procedures for conducting investigations
- Ability to observe and accurately recall places, names, descriptive characteristics, pertinent facts, and details.
- Ability to acquire a working knowledge of various criminal and vehicle codes, departmental policies, rules and instructions, and police report writing techniques.

#### **Duties**

- Prepares background packets, which includes information and questionnaires for applicants to complete to begin the background process.
- Meets with candidate to explain the background packet and questionnaire; schedules the Personal History Statement (PHS) interview.
- Reviews the PHS and other documents; confirms that the candidate meets minimum requirements; prepares report for any areas that need further investigation.
- Conducts background interview with the candidate and collects all required documentation. Conducts follow-up with any areas that might lead to a screen-out.
- Schedules fingerprints and polygraph exams.
- Conducts all law enforcement checks, and checks of other agencies applied to, sends out questionnaires to candidates' references, and reviews personnel files. Conducts follow-up with training officers and academy training files, if relevant.
- Conducts background investigation; confirms information provided by candidate; conducts home visits and neighborhood checks; interviews references, including family, personal, and law enforcement; generate secondary references, and follow-up. May include travel to locations outside of the county and/or outside of the state as necessary to present a complete background package.
- Reviews polygraph results, law enforcement checks, and other information gathered during the investigation; conducts follow-up with any areas that might lead to a screen-out, any negative information or discrepancies, including pulling police reports from law enforcement agencies.
- Prepares final report and background summary.
- Conducts discrepancy interviews.
- Presents background to the hiring board.
- Performs other duties of a similar nature or level.



### Civilian Criminal Investigator: Royal Canadian Mounted Police<sup>179</sup>

#### Job Summary

Civilian Criminal Investigators (CCIs) play an important role in the RCMP of the future. They work side-by-side with police officers conducting Criminal Code investigations related to cybercrime and financial crime. While CCIs have valid security clearance and limited peace officer status, they will not be armed and will not make arrests. CCIs will play integral roles in investigations, such as:

- Interviewing witnesses, victims, and suspects
- Obtaining and executing warrants
- Participating in site searches
- Providing court testimonies

#### **Duties**

As a CCI, you will be an integrated member of financial crime and cybercrime teams working side by side with police officers and other civilian members. You will:

- Collect and preserve evidence
- Attend and provide testimony in court
- Provide advanced and specialized skills, experience, advice, and recommendation in relation to the Criminal Code of Canada.

#### **Crimes Investigated**

#### Cyber Crime

- Online thefts of personal identifiable information
- Network intrusions, ransomware, and distributed denial of service

- National security
- Online serious fraud
- Serious internet drug-based trafficking

#### Financial Crime

- Serious fraud
- Serious capital market related offences
- Money laundering
- Proceeds of crime
- Anti-corruption

#### Knowledge, Skills, and Abilities – Cyber Crime

- Computer science
- Information technology
- Computer programming
- Administration of servers, networks, or workstations

## Knowledge, Skills, and Abilities – Financial Crime

- Accounting
- Business administration
- Commerce
- Finance
- Compliance, trading, or securities investigations
- Capital market misconduct investigations

<sup>179.</sup> https://www.rcmp-grc.gc.ca/en/civilian-criminal-investigators.



## Civilian Traffic Investigator: Greensboro (NC) Police Department<sup>180</sup>

#### Job Summary

The responsibility of the Civilian Traffic Investigator/ Greensboro Motorist Assistance Patrol (GMAP) is to ensure adequate service to the citizens of the City in the form of providing non-emergency services that are essential to motorist safety, such as assistance to stranded motorists, traffic direction, and vehicle crash investigation as allowed for by State law.

#### **Duties**

Some of the daily job tasks include: (1) Monitoring police radio dispatch channels, responding to nonemergency vehicle crash incidents, and completing necessary reports and/or exchange slips, as allowed by State law. Requesting City contracted towing services to remove any vehicles that cannot be driven away from the scene and completing required vehicle vouchers. (2) Patrolling City streets and proactively locating stranded motorists, disabled vehicles, and traffic hazards; subsequently assisting, such as changing a tire, providing sufficient fuel to relocate the vehicle to the nearest gas station, or providing traffic directions until the hazard may be removed from the roadway. (3) Assisting the Traffic Safety Unit for special events, such as traffic enforcement campaigns, license checking stations, DWI checkpoints, and pre-planned City permitted road closures. Assistance will require transporting cones, barricades, light trailers, and other equipment, as well as removing vehicles from the roadways subsequent to checkpoints. During emergency incidents such as power outages and storm response, GMAP will assist TSU with transport, hook-up, and refueling of generators necessary to power traffic signals.

#### **Minimum Qualifications:**

- High School Diploma / GED <u>with</u> related experience in non-emergency motorist safety (e.g., monitoring radio dispatch for vehicle crashes, traffic hazards, and disabled vehicles) and/or directly related field
- Traffic direction skills
- Basic mechanical skills with small tools (e.g., the ability to change a tire)
- Must possess a Valid Driver's License
- Certification as a Civilian Traffic Investigator through the North Carolina Justice Academy
- Certification for NCIC/DCI

#### **Desired Qualifications**

Experience working in law enforcement

180. https://www.governmentjobs.com/careers/greensboronc/jobs/newprint/4230960.



### Community Engagement Liaison: Orange County (FL) Sheriff's Office<sup>181</sup>

#### Job Summary

This position will create and implement a long-term community engagement plan in order to strengthen community relations, increase public safety, and reduce crime through proactive engagement, outreach, and communication. This position will report directly to the Community Relations Captain.

#### **Duties**

- Serves as agency liaison between Orange County Sheriff's Office (OCSO) and public and private community-based organizations (i.e., nonprofit organizations, diverse interfaith groups, local churches, government agencies, educational institutions, community organizers, etc.) to help OCSO achieve its goals and objectives.
- Identifies and establishes a network of sustainable relationships and resources in the community. Builds a volunteer base in the community. Coordinates with those relationships/resources/ volunteers to provide focus and direction for community improvements, public safety, and crime reduction.
- Researches and gathers recommendations from the community regarding their needs. Prepares analyses on community engagement related topics for the Sheriff and senior staff.
- Facilitates and organizes appropriate and needed services for the community.
- Develops and oversees programs for the community in order to prevent and reduce crime. Creates initiatives to stop the cycle of violence.
- Organizes, coordinates, and attends community meetings. Listens to community concerns

and provides information about community engagement.

- Makes presentations throughout the community and answers questions regarding programs and services available.
- Creates and maintains databases of resources and community members/volunteers that can provide expertise.
- Evaluates community engagement programs by implementing surveys and receiving feedback to determine what is and is not effective for the community.
- Completes additional duties and projects as necessary.

#### **Minimum Qualifications**

A bachelor's degree (B.A. or B.S.) from an accredited four-year college or university in Business, Public Administration, Social Sciences or closely related field AND two (2) years' experience in public/ community engagement, community advocacy or community organizing/outreach with diverse demographics OR an equivalent combination of education and experience.

Must have valid Florida driver's license. Must attend and successfully complete the agency sponsored Law Enforcement Vehicle Operations (LEVO) Training if assignment includes driving agency vehicle. Use of agency vehicle would require appropriate driving history and passing agency biennial driver's physical exam. Must successfully pass a medical exam.

181. https://www.governmentjobs.com/careers/ocso/classspecs/1261881?page=4&pagetype=classSpecifications.

#### Knowledge, Skills, and Abilities

- Comprehend and communicate fluently in verbal and written English.
- Read, analyze, and interpret common scientific and technical journals, financial reports, and legal documents.
- Respond to common inquiries or complaints from citizens or members of the business community.
- Communicate effectively with diverse socioeconomic levels.
- Effectively present information to top management, public groups, and/or boards of directors while maintaining a positive image in person and over the phone.
- Establish and maintain effective working relationships across cultural differences with community organizations, businesses, and the public.
- Encourage team building and provide conflict resolution.

- Define problems, collect data, establish facts, and draw valid conclusions.
- Think critically and expansively while interpreting an extensive variety of information to solve complex community problems.
- Learn, understand, and apply the current goals and objectives of OCSO.
- Identify key organizations and key players in the community who can coordinate with OCSO for community engagement purposes.
- Maintain records, prepare reports, and manage projects.
- Plan, organize, prioritize work and be detail oriented.
- Basic computer skills to include word processing, spreadsheet, and database applications.
- Possess working knowledge of PowerPoint and the internet.
- Passion for the betterment of Orange County.



## Community Response Specialist: Salt Lake City Police Department<sup>182</sup>

#### Job Summary

Under the supervision of a police supervisor, Community Response Specialists perform various non-emergency, low-hazard duties both in the office and in the field. This position interacts with the public and completes data entry.

Specialists perform a variety of specialized and technical non-emergency, low-hazard police duties including:

- Assist with abandoned property and securing evidence
- Help secure roads when traffic hazards are present
- Help motorists with tire changes and lockouts

Specialists provide support by responding to calls-for-service that have been determined to be low-hazard and that do not require police officer authority.

#### **Minimum Qualifications**

- High school diploma or equivalent.
- 18 years of age or older at the time of a background investigation.
- Considerable human relations and communications skills.
- Communicate effectively, both orally and in writing, with individuals from diverse organizations and backgrounds.
- Ability to work independently, make critical decisions, and use initiative and common sense.
- Possess valid state driver's license or Utah driving privilege card (or the ability to obtain one within 30 days of employment).
- Ability to pass the Salt Lake City Police Department's Civilian Response Training Program including classroom instruction, field work, and vehicle operations.

<sup>182.</sup> https://slcpd.com/careers/civilian/crs/.



## Community Services Officer: San Jose Police Department<sup>183</sup>

#### Job Summary

CSO I is the entry level class in the CSO series. Incumbents perform assignments which involve responsible public contact work in crime and burglary investigation and the delivery of nonemergency police services. CSO I incumbents are expected to progress with appropriate training, experience and satisfactory performance to CSO II, the journey level of the class series. Incumbents are expected to wear a uniform but are unarmed and may be assigned to any shift including evenings, weekends, and holidays.

#### **Minimum Qualifications**

#### Community Services Officer I

• Completion of high school or equivalent (General Education Development [GED] Test or California Proficiency Certificate) AND one (1) year of experience involving a substantial amount of contact with the public.

#### Community Services Officer II

• Completion of high school or equivalent (General Education Development [GED] Test or California Proficiency Certificate) AND two (2) years of public contact experience including at least one (1) year within a law enforcement agency at a level equivalent to Community Services Officer I.

#### **Basic Competencies**

 Job Expertise – Demonstrates knowledge of and experience with applicable professional/ technical principles and practices, Citywide and departmental procedures/policies and federal and state rules and regulations.

- Communication Skills Effectively conveys information and expresses thoughts and facts clearly, oral, and in writing; demonstrates effective use of listening skills; displays openness to other people's ideas and thoughts.
- Computer Skills Experienced with common business computer applications including but not limited to: MS Outlook, MS Word, MS PowerPoint, MS Access, and MS Excel.
- Teamwork and Interpersonal Skills Develops effective relationships with co-workers and supervisors by helping others accomplish tasks and using collaboration and conflict resolution skills.
- Analytical Thinking Approaches a problem or situation by using a logical, systematic, sequential approach.

#### **Duties**

- Assist patrol teams with non-enforcement duties; completes routine police reports; maintains records of daily work activities;
- Performs non-hazardous investigative duties related to the commission of crimes against property such as residential, commercial and vehicle burglary, petty theft, grand theft, vehicle theft and vandalism;
- Collects and preserves evidence at crime scenes which includes the processing and lifting of latent fingerprints and taking photographs at designated crime scenes;
- Recovers stolen vehicles and processes for evidence where found unattended;

183. https://www.governmentjobs.com/careers/sanjoseca/jobs/4345590/community-service-officer-i-ii-police.

- Responds to and investigates traffic complaints such as road hazards;
- Investigates non-injury vehicle accidents;
- Directs and controls crowds and traffic at accidents or special events including setting up cone and/or road flare patterns;
- Receives and responds to citizen inquiries; gives general assistance or directions as appropriate;
- Performs routine office functions such as word processing, filing, record keeping, including the preparation of police reports;

- Assist law enforcement in taking reports of and searching for persons reported as missing;
- Protects crime scenes from bystanders;
- Transports seized, found, lost, or abandoned property or evidence (non-controlled substances)
- Administers first aid as necessary;
- Carries less lethal oleoresin capsicum OC for personal protection;
- May assist in the training of new employees and less experienced subordinates; and
- Testifies in court when necessary.



#### Job Summary

The primary objective for this position is to work with the community and the personnel of the North Precinct to reduce and prevent crime.

The Crime Prevention Coordinator will provide crime prevention expertise, training and support to community members to increase their capacity to take action(s) individually and collectively to reduce their chance of becoming a victim of crime and, in general, to reduce opportunities for crime to occur. The Crime Prevention Coordinator will support Seattle Police operations, directing crime prevention interventions at locations generating a high volume of calls for police service, and addressing community members' public safety concerns requiring crime prevention information or support. Finally, the Crime Prevention Coordinator will perform as liaisons representing the Seattle Police Department in problem-solving efforts with precinct and department-level units, stakeholders from local and other government agencies and a wide array of community stakeholders to address emerging and long-term nuisance, crime and safety issues.

#### **Duties**

- Develops and supports the implementation of a broad array of crime prevention strategies that are informed by the department's data analytics.
- Analyzes SPD data analytics and input from the community to develop profiles for areas throughout the City; assesses crime trends, hotspots, and prepares reports for presentation to department, individuals and groups, including community leaders, and elected officials.

- Works with communities, businesses and individual community members to identify and define crime problems; develops tactics and strategies to address problems and assists in implementing solutions.
- Develops and plans concepts and methods to encourage community member participation in department crime prevention programs and projects; plans, organizes, publicizes, and conducts community and business group meetings to disseminate information, encourage responsibility for dealing with problems and enlist participation in organized crime prevention activities.
- Responds to inquiries from the general public via phone, in-person, social media, email, or in writing; provides information about crime statistics and crime prevention techniques and programs; researches and resolves complaints and problems.
- Employees are expected to complete and maintain professional certification in Crime Prevention Through Environmental Design (CPTED).
- Conducts CPTED security surveys of single and multi-family residences, commercial and public spaces; recommends improvements and provides technical information concerning appropriate security equipment; and prepares written reports of findings and recommendations.
- Collaborates with other City departments to provide crime prevention and CPTED feedback on plans and projects.
- Organizes special Seattle Police Department functions such as Night Out, Community Clean Up, and help organize and participate in annual Precinct Picnics.

184. https://www.governmentjobs.com/careers/seattle/jobs/newprint/3119231.

#### **Minimum Qualifications**

Bachelor's degree in public relations, communications, education, criminal justice, urban studies, social sciences or a related field and a minimum of one year of experience in public relations or the delivery of social services or a combination of education and/or training and/or experience which provides an equivalent background required to perform the duties of this position.

#### **Desired Qualifications**

- Two or more years of experience in public relations or the delivery of social services.
- Experience analyzing crime incident reports, collating crime statistics and developing profiles for areas throughout the City.

- Experience assessing crime trends, determining methods of criminal operation and preparing reports for presentations to individuals and groups, including community leaders, elected officials and the media.
- Experience planning, preparing content, and conducting educational presentations on crime prevention or related topics to the general public, business organizations and community groups.
- Experience engaging members of diverse and under-represented communities with sensitivity and respect.
- Accomplishments in developing displays, setting up and staffing booths at fairs and trade shows. Developing and providing public service announcements for the media on crime prevention or related programs.



## Crime Scene Investigation Lead Specialist: New Orleans Police Department<sup>185</sup>

#### Job Summary

Advanced technical and administrative duties involved in the collecting, documenting, and preserving of evidence at a crime scene, and related work as required.

#### **Minimum Qualifications**

• High School graduation or GED Equivalency Diploma issued by a State Department of Education.

- Sixty (60) credit hours from an accredited college or university with at least twelve credit hours in Criminal Justice, Chemistry, Biology, Forensic Science, or a closely related scientific field.
- Valid Driver's License.
- Five (5) years of full-time experience in crime scene investigation.

**Note:** Additional crime scene investigator experience may substitute for the required college credit at the rate of one (1) year of related experience equals 30 hours (one year) of college credits.

 $185.\ https://www.governmentjobs.com/careers/neworleans/jobs/3635182/crime-scene-investigation-lead-specialist-class-code-5283$ 



## Information Technology Specialist 2: New York State Police<sup>186</sup>

#### Job Summary

Provide technology and support services to the State Police Field Operations.

#### **Duties**

- Ensuring Division compliance with applicable state and federal information security.
- Actively participate in project and process design, including review of business processes and proposed technology solutions to ensure that they meet Division's technology and security requirements.
- Participate in Division's audit program to ensure internal and external security program requirements are being carried out effectively and efficiently.
- Responsible for monitoring information security violations and incidents; conducting inquiries, assessing potential damage, and recommending corrective or preventative action, as appropriate in conjunction with ITS.
- Working with ITS establishing, maintaining and ensuring the implementation of access control policies, procedures and systems that aim to prevent unauthorized access, modification, disclosure, misuse, manipulation or destruction of information stored on computer systems and networks.
- Review ITS and vendor contracts, service level agreements, memorandum of understanding language, and other documents to verify needs, requirements, and alignment with State Police policies and standards.

- Establishing and maintaining a program to classify data utilized in Division's business processes based on its need for confidentiality, integrity and/or availability; adhering to Division policies, as well as State and Federal policies.
- Developing, implementing and administering an agency information security risk assessment program.
- Establishing and administering an information security awareness program.
- Representing the NYSP regarding information security matters with other New York State agencies and outside organizations.
- Determines strategies for system security, system architecture, and for disaster recovery and other methods to maintain continuity of business operations to executive management.
- Monitoring Division's technology resources for misuse, including audit logs.
- Analyze Division's information security requirements (including security requirements for hardware, software and architecture that transports, processes and/or stores Division data), make appropriate recommendations and ensure the requirements are met.
- Acts as information security lead on projects and initiatives to ensure security by design through implementation of the Secure Systems Development Lifecycle (SSDLC).
- Identifies, evaluates, reports, and advises executive management on cybersecurity risks, with consideration for compliance and regulatory requirements.

186. New York State Police, position posted 6/15/2022.

#### **Minimum Qualifications**

- Bachelor's degree or higher in Computer Science, Computer Information Systems, Management Information Systems; or
- Bachelor's degree or higher in a related field with eighteen (18) credit hours in Computer Science; or
- A total of four (4) years of experience in the following computer-related areas: network, server, storage, and systems management; telecommunications; IT customer support and training; computer installation; diagnosis and repair; technical writing; computer security; knowledge management; database administration, design and management; internet/intranet development, design, and maintenance; information technology project management; design and development of geographic information systems or computer aided drafting applications; computer programming; business/systems analysis; program design; or program testing.

#### **Desired Qualifications**

- Information Security certifications:
  - (ISC)<sup>2</sup> Certified Information Systems Security Professional (CISSP)
  - (ISACA) Certified Information Security Manager (CISM)
  - (ISACA) Certified Information Systems Auditor (CISA)

- Knowledge and understanding of the organizational structure, functions, goals, objectives and workflow of Division programs;
- Working knowledge of the implications of applicable laws, rules and regulations governing the Division and its employees as it relates to information security;
- Knowledge and understanding of the major hardware and software systems currently in use by the Division, including their capabilities and limitations;
- Knowledge of trends and current developments in information security;
- Experience in program development; including problem identification, research into alternative solutions, selection of a cost-effective solution, implementing procedures, and evaluating the results;
- Ability to organize and present support for recommendations and programs both orally and in writing; and
- Ability to work effectively with end users and technology service providers.
- Experience in remediating Cyber Security Risk based on the NIST Special Publication 800-53r4 security framework, which has been adopted by New York State as the minimal best practices for Information Security.



## Investigative Specialist: Baltimore Police Department<sup>187</sup>

#### **Job Summary**

An Investigative Specialist I is responsible for performing administrative professional work assisting in investigations conducted and managed by the Baltimore Police Department. Members in this classification assist in conducting and reviewing administrative investigations and/or a variety of criminal investigations and prosecution activities.

#### **Duties**

- Conducting investigative research for all internal affairs cases of alleged misconduct by BPD members.
- Documenting areas of violation, collecting and preserving case evidence.
- Analysis of case documentation, including but not limited to audio-taped statements, photographs, payroll records, daily activity sheets, criminal databases, intelligence reports, and police incident reports.
- Recommending an appropriate investigative course of action for misconduct cases.
- Conducting preliminary case interviews to identify all accused members of BPD.
- Drafting all case correspondence upon completion of the investigation.

#### **Minimum Qualifications**

• Bachelor's degree from an accredited institution of higher education, with focus on Criminal Justice or a related field; OR

- High School Diploma/GED plus two (2) years of experience working as an investigator in any function, including but not limited to: criminal, civil, environmental, housing, code violations, or performing administrative audits and inspections.
- At least 21 years of age
- Driver's license
- Equivalencies Each additional year of education at an accredited college or university with focus on Criminal Justice or a related field may substituted for six (6) months of the experience requirement.

#### Knowledges, Skills, and Abilities

- Knowledge of investigative methods, techniques, practices and procedures.
- Skill in conducting investigative interviews and eliciting cooperation of individuals and businesses.
- Skill in investigative methods.
- Ability to comprehend, interpret and apply rules, regulations and policies relevant to criminal and civil investigations.
- Ability to utilize sound judgment and remain calm under stressful situations.
- Ability to communicate effectively, both orally and in writing.
- Ability to establish and maintain effective working relationships with superiors, coworkers, governmental employees and officials and enforcement officers.

 $187.\ https://www.simplyhired.com/job/SZ78xBIuG5tLHMah9f60Mll7EAyDhocDsewLztuqT_9XlirYBsPH1w.$ 

- Ability to deal effectively with the general public.
- Ability to testify as an expert witness in court and defend findings.
- Ability to prepare narrative reports explaining investigative activity and findings and justifying prosecution of a case.
- Ability to utilize photographic equipment to photograph and document criminal evidence.
- Ability to maintain confidentiality of sources and records.

- Ability to accept direction and criticism and to function in an organization with strict rules and regulations.
- Ability to participate and successfully complete all mandated phases of entrance level training including classroom, field and skills training.
- Ability to operate motor vehicles safely and effectively and to enter and exit such vehicles frequently.



## Law Enforcement Analyst: Philadelphia Police Department<sup>188</sup>

#### Job Summary

Employees in this class have responsibility for independently performing technical work for the purpose of substantiating criminal patterns and/or trends and predictive analysis. Work includes correlating, integrating, and evaluating varying types of information from criminal or operational activities for the purpose of generating strategic, operational, or tactical level analysis reports. Work includes utilizing computer hardware and software associated with law enforcement information systems for reporting and analysis.

#### **Duties**

- Independently performs analysis using crime, economic and demographic data to project crime trends and patterns; performs evaluation and analysis of complex data using standard qualitative and quantitative methods; prepares reports documenting results of findings; participates in formal presentations of findings.
- Plans intelligence or research questions and objectives for crime analysis products; collates data from computer systems, field observations and interviews; applies appropriate analytical tradecraft, and develops output reports for analysis products; collects, collates, and analyzes data and information from various sources including police information management systems, surveillance cameras, confidential sources, public records, social media, and other open-source systems.

- Confers with departmental representatives; reviews policies, procedures, forms, and systems used for data collection and analysis.
- Collaborates with representatives from other government organizations to share information or coordinate intelligence and research activities on multiple simultaneous assignments.
- Designs or modifies current or new information systems and programs using a variety of methods and techniques.
- Independently reviews literature and investigates new analytical techniques in program analysis and evaluation.
- Performs related work as required.

#### **Required Knowledge**

- Standard sources and uses of information in law enforcement
- Qualitative and quantitative analysis techniques
- The principles and practices of statistical analysis
- Law enforcement and statistical research methodology for the research assignment
- Principles, methods and techniques for research, analysis, and data collection
- Computer based systems used for data gathering, organization, and analysis
- The principles and practices of utilizing computers for management reporting and analysis

188. https://www.phila.gov/departments/office-of-human-resources/job-specs/6C26.htm.

- Information system resources needed to design computerized data entry
- Query languages, report writers, interactive database programs, spreadsheets and/or application generators or other software related to intelligence analysis
- Database management, geospatial software, and other software packages to manage data and produce tables, maps, and graphic displays if required by assignment

#### **Required Skills**

- Using analytical techniques and scientific principles to evaluate data
- Writing a variety of narrative reports
- Performing crime and intelligence analysis using economic and demographic data
- Projecting crime trends and patterns

#### **Required Abilities**

- Design qualitative studies for intelligence analysis
- Process and analyze data using query languages, report writers, interactive database programs, spreadsheets and/or application generators
- Express ideas and facts clearly and effectively both orally and in writing

• Establish and maintain effective working relationships with associates and other law enforcement agencies

#### **Minimum Qualifications**

- Completion of a bachelor's degree program at an accredited college or university in a closely related field; and
- Two years of experience performing criminal investigative research or information management analysis work for a law enforcement agency, intelligence agency, government or non-profit organization, research institution, or private sector consulting firm; or
- Any equivalent combination of education and experience determined to be acceptable by the Office of Human Resources which has included the completion of a bachelor's degree at an accredited college or university as an educational minimum.



## Police Civilian Investigator: Phoenix Police Department<sup>189</sup>

#### Job Summary

The Police Civilian Investigator will perform a variety of tasks in support of law enforcement activities within an investigative bureau of the Phoenix Police Department. This position will serve a critical role supporting the Phoenix Police Department's mission: to serve, protect and reduce crime in Phoenix while treating everyone with dignity and respect.

This position provides investigative or support responsibilities to various locations within the City of Phoenix, for example: Drug Enforcement Bureau, Family Investigations Bureau, Property Crimes Bureau, and Violent Crimes Bureau. Duties will vary by assignment in the investigative bureau. This position is supervised by a Police Sergeant. Some positions require shift work on Shift I or Shift II.

This is a non-sworn, unarmed position within the Police Department. This position will be actively involved in supporting sworn police in detailed/ complex criminal investigations. The Police Civilian Investigator is distinguished from a Police Officer since the employee is not a sworn officer, does not carry a firearm, does not respond to in-progress incidents, and does not have any arrest authority.

#### **Duties**

- Authors original and supplemental Incident Reports, which will vary in length and content.
- Conducts follow-up phone calls, emails, and inperson contacts with members of the public, law enforcement, and various investigative partners.
- Collects data or information from various sources (i.e., computerized crime and traffic databases, etc.).

- Contacts other law enforcement agencies, investigative leads, probation officers, etc. for additional information, and utilizing automated systems to research criminal history and conduct background checks.
- Conducts interviews with victims, witnesses, parents/caregivers, and suspects at the request of a detective or supervisor.
- Assists with writing and reviewing Subpoenas, Court Orders, and Search Warrants, and completes required paperwork, evidence impounds, etc.
- Creates investigative support material, such as Photographic Line-ups, Crime Bulletins, Flyers, etc.
- Drives unmarked police vehicles at the discretion of an investigative supervisor for investigative or administrative purposes.
- Reviews various reports on impounded evidence for the purpose of property purges, crime analysis, pended lab results, etc.
- Assists investigative supervisors with various responsibilities in the Records Management System (RMS) to include updating case management and case management queries.
- Impounds property or evidence by following Impound Procedures in Operations Orders.
- Produces reports, forms, and paperwork that are used to file misdemeanor or felony charges against suspects.
- Creates, updates, or maintains spreadsheets, timelines, or other digital records of large scale or high-profile investigations.

<sup>189.</sup> https://www.phoenix.gov/hrsite/jobdesc/62560.pdf.

- Attends court hearings for the purpose of testifying to job duties, reports, etc.
- Assists with training of new employees in this same job classification.
- Attends training classes in police methods, investigative trends, and subjects related to assigned area.
- Demonstrates continuous effort to improve Police Department operations, decrease investigative turnaround times, streamline work processes, and work cooperatively and jointly to provide quality seamless customer service.

#### **Minimum Qualifications**

- Two years of investigative experience in law enforcement, public safety, loss prevention, crime scene management, forensics, or other relevant legal or private sector fields.
- High school graduate or GED equivalency.

## **Desired Qualifications –** The minimum qualifications listed above, plus:

- Bachelor's degree in criminal justice, communications, or public/ business administration.
- Valid drivers' license on or before the hire date.
- Experience in complex investigations in administrative law.
- Experience in complex investigations in criminal law.
- Experience in complex investigations in civil law.
- Experience in Microsoft suite: Word, Excel, PowerPoint, and Visio.
- Experience working in various databases: ACJIS, CJIS, CLIPS, RMIN, EPIC, etc.

#### **Ideal Candidate**

- Strong attention to detail.
- Ability to communicate effectively with others.
- Passion for investigative research, uncovering facts and details.
- Ability to communicate effectively with all members of the public.
- Ability to draw connections and correlations between subjects.
- Meticulous with details, persistent, and called to serve the local community.



Police Media Relations Specialist: Mesa Police Department<sup>190</sup>

#### Job Summary

A Police Media Relations Specialist is responsible for developing, implementing, promoting, and maintaining a positive department image through the implementation of a Public Information Program for the Police Department. Specific duties include: proactively developing and facilitating releases to the media on developing/breaking stories regarding crime offenses, investigations, and/or other areas of public concern; creating and monitoring the content for standard social media platforms (example: Facebook, Twitter, YouTube, Snapchat, and blogging); implementing public information strategies to project a positive image of the City and the Police Department; promoting the department through the identification/provision of information on stories of interest to the media, and periodic public service messages; researching and writing articles of interest for publication in local/national periodicals and professional journals; writing speeches and feature stories; preparing briefings of major, unusual, or interesting items for Police administration staff; conducting on-camera, radio, and in-person interviews with members of the media and public; developing promotional strategies for getting the Police Department's message on crime/crime prevention/other activities to the general public; producing video and slide productions; and planning and composing brochures, flyers, bulletins, television scripts, and various periodic and special purpose reports. This position will also be responsible for answering written and telephone inquiries regarding Police Department activities; developing and maintaining a rapport with news media representatives; and serving as an informational resource for City management, the press, and the general public.

#### **Minimum Qualifications**

Any combination of training, education, and experience equivalent to graduation from an accredited college or university with a bachelor's degree in public relations, communications, marketing, journalism, or closely related field. Considerable (3 - 5 years) experience involving responsible public relations or journalism work. Experience with electronic media (example: internet, radio, and/or television).

#### Preferred/Desirable Qualifications

Knowledge and experience with HTML or Front-Page is also desired. Knowledge of video shooting, production and editing is also desired. Bilingual skills: ability to speak, translate, and write English and Spanish is highly desirable.

#### Knowledge/Skills/Abilities

- General theories and complex principles and practices of marketing, public relations, and public information, and basic communication techniques;
- Advertising and publicity techniques and practices;
- Printing techniques and style guidelines for writing press releases and publications;
- Techniques of publication preparation and design of brochures, displays, and visual aids;
- English language usage and terminology used by various media;
- Search engine optimization (SEO) and search engine marketing (SEM) strategies and utilizing social media analytics;

<sup>190.</sup> https://apps.mesaaz.gov/jobdescriptions/Documents/JobDescriptions/cs4888.pdf.

- Mobile applications and related technology;
- HTML and website production; standard social media platforms (example: Facebook, X, YouTube, and blogging);
- Project management and research methods/ techniques;
- Social media analytics, and principles and practices of composing and editing informational material;
- Effectively communicating with the general public and news media representatives;
- Making oral presentations;
- Producing graphic designs, brochures, and other materials for training programs or public presentations;
- Establish and maintain effective working relationships with coworkers, city management, media personnel, and the general public;

- Develop marketing and promotional materials;
- Present information clearly, both verbally and in writing to various audiences;
- Attend community and business meetings and participate in various community group boards and programs on behalf of the police department;
- Develop educational materials (example: pamphlets, posters, public service announcements);
- Interact tactfully and courteously with the public;
- Identify and respond to public, city council, and police department issues and concerns;
- Operate computerized informational databases for tracking programs and related information;
- Keep accurate records and prepare reports; and
- Effectively handle comments and feedback from the public and news media.



## Police Service Aide: Albuquerque Police Department<sup>191</sup>

#### Job Summary

Provide police service that otherwise would be lost or delayed because of workload saturation on sworn officers, relieve sworn officers of non-related or low priority police service so that they may pursue anti-crime activities more effectively. Collect and preserve physical evidence in the field; ensure the preservation of all items taken into evidence and testify in court regarding the chain of custody and integrity of evidence.

#### **Minimum Qualifications**

- Minimum of 18 years of age and have intention of becoming a police officer
- High school diploma or GED
- Must pass the Police Service Aide Written Examination and other required examinations
- Must pass a Class I physical examination

- Vision must be correct to 20/30 or better in both eyes
- Must be a United States citizen or have a valid work permit
- Must be able to do work shift work
- Must not have any felony convictions
- Must pass rigid background investigation
- Must attempt to proceed into the sworn rank
- Must apply for sworn rank when eligible and if rejected, must reapply for the next class

#### **Additional Requirements**

- Possession of a valid New Mexico Driver's License, or the ability to obtain by date of hire
- Possession of a City Operator's Permit (COP) within 6 months from date of hire

191. https://www.governmentjobs.com/careers/cabq/jobs/4191966-0/police-service-aide.



## Professional Staff Investigator: Tucson Police Department<sup>192</sup>

#### Job Summary

- Investigates and analyzes evidence to determine the cause and source of crimes. Manages caseloads, assists the public and prescreens police and professional staff job applicants.
- This is a civilian classification, meaning the employee is not a sworn officer, does not carry a firearm, does not respond to in-progress incidents, and does not make arrests.

#### **Duties**

- Occasionally directs helpers, assistants, seasonal employees, interns, volunteers or temporary employees.
- Investigates crimes by drafting warrants, interviewing witnesses and suspects, collecting and analyzing evidence, drawing diagrams of the crime scene, conducting research, and showing lineups.
- Assists public and law enforcement agencies by responding to telephone calls and correspondence, discussing cases and other issues with citizens, and providing statistics and general information to law enforcement agencies.

- Manages caseloads by preparing and maintaining files, processing paperwork, writing reports, and processing evidence.
- Prescreens applicants by reviewing their paperwork, conducting interviews, conducting background investigations, and providing assistance to personnel as needed.
- Performs related duties by testifying in court, training employees, and maintaining vehicle.

### **Minimum Qualifications**

- Associate degree.
- At least two years of investigative experience in law enforcement, public safety, loss prevention, crime scene management, forensics, or related field.
- Valid and Unrestricted Class D Driver License.

192. https://www.jobapscloud.com/Tucson/sup/bulpreview.asp?R1=2306&R2=6210&R3=001.



## Quality Assurance Auditor: Albuquerque Police Department<sup>193</sup>

#### Job Summary

Perform auditing activities within assigned Division; audit, evaluate, analyze and report on a variety of operations, the achievement of goals, financial accuracy and record keeping and compliance with applicable laws, policies and regulations; assist in the implementation of program goals and objectives and perform a variety of professional and technical tasks in support of assigned area of responsibility.

#### **Duties**

- 1. Develop audit plans and perform initial and follow-up audits in accordance with professional standards.
- 2. Evaluate audit findings; prepare and presents the results of audit work and recommendations to management in the form of oral and written communications.
- 3. Coordinate and interact with staff and external audit agencies, as needed.
- 4. Consult with and advise staff on operational and administrative issues.
- 5. Stay abreast of policies and procedures, current developments in accounting and auditing professions, and changes in local, state, and federal laws, as applicable.

#### **Minimum Qualifications**

Education and experience directly related to the minimum requirements below may be interchangeable on a year for year basis.

- Bachelor's degree from an accredited college or university in business administration or accounting; *and*
- One (1) year of auditing or accounting experience.
- Possession of a valid New Mexico Driver's License.
- Possession of a City Operator's Permit (COP) within six (6) months from date of hire.

#### Preferred Knowledge

- Pertinent Federal, State and local codes, laws and regulations
- Operations, services, and activities of an internal auditing program
- Procedures, methods and techniques of budget preparation and control
- Modern office procedures, methods and equipment including computers
- Principles and practices of operational and financial auditing
- Principles and practices of accounting and financial record keeping
- Principles and practices of program development and administration
- Methods and techniques of research, data collection and analysis
- Principles of business letter writing and technical report writing and grammar

 $193.\ https://www.simplyhired.com/job/iHyMeL4QTBn9hsjp4ItRCNe-35sfLhlzGnfvbnu-dYqNl4SBvAsA6w.$ 

#### **Preferred Skills and Ability**

- Spreadsheet software skills to quantify and illustrate routine financial reports, comparisons, impacts, and/or projections
- Analyze and solve problems
- Supervise and train assigned staff
- Effectively communicate accounting information, policies, and/or procedures in a manner easily understood by the customer
- Current changes and/or developments in applicable federal, state, local laws, and policies and procedures

- Work effectively with diverse populations
- Analyze processes and make recommendations for improvements
- Public auditing policies, standards, and procedures
- Communicate effectively
- Establish and maintain effective working relationships with those contacted in the course of work including City officials and the general public
- Perform the essential functions of the job with or without reasonable accommodation



## **Research and Policy Analyst:** Chicago Police Department<sup>194</sup>

#### Job Summary

This position is assigned to the Research and Development Division of the Chicago Police Department and is engaged in researching, analyzing and writing Chicago Police Department directives and reports to support department operations, consent decree and accreditation compliance, and related duties as required.

#### **Duties**

- Develops new policies and/or makes modifications to existing departmental policies and coordinates with executive and command staff regarding final approval.
- Evaluates current, new or proposed changes to department directives, state and/or federal legislation, consent decree requirements or accreditation changes from the Commission on Accreditation for Law Enforcement Agencies (CALEA).
- Manages comprehensive research studies including working with department stakeholders to identify and outline operational needs and requirements; developing surveys and collection models; and gathering and reviewing programmatic and statistical data.
- Prepares comprehensive and narrative reports detailing impacts of new legislation, trends, and results of research studies affecting department directives and policies.
- Maintains current and monitors government and accreditation performance standards (e.g., CALEA) to ensure department orders and directives are compliant with requirements.
- Conducts best practice reviews of other law enforcement agencies and academic resources on

current and emerging policing policies, initiatives, and compliance evaluations.

- Maintains records including the cataloging, classifying and archival of all current and archived departmental directives and standard operating procedures.
- Researches department policies and procedures in order to respond to requests for information (e.g., FOIA, subpoena, litigation) in a timely manner.
- Provides training to department staff relative to new or modified policies and procedures.
- Represents the department at community events to discuss new or proposed changes to department directives.
- Serves on various inter-agency committees and working groups to ensure appropriate implementation of new or modified department directives and policies.
- Maintains confidentiality of sensitive information.
- Develops written presentations of policy and procedural changes for department executive and command staff.

#### **Minimum Qualifications**

Graduation from an accredited college or university with a bachelor's degree in public administration, business administration or the social sciences or a directly related field, plus four years of work experience in policy research and development or legislative research and/or analysis, or an equivalent combination of education, training, and experience provided that the minimum degree requirement is met.

<sup>194.</sup> https://chicago.taleo.net/careersection/100/jobdetail.ftl.



## Training Officer: Chicago Police Department<sup>195</sup>

#### Job Summary

Under general supervision, this position provides employee training and development services in a department with diverse training needs and performs related duties as required.

#### **Duties**

- Duties may vary and may include classroom teaching, acting as a role player in scenario-based training.
- Research subject areas and study materials to develop new training programs or to incorporate new information into existing programs.
- Prepares program materials including training outlines, instruction modules, and visual aids for use in the presentation of training programs.
- Conducts training sessions on a variety of topics to meet the training needs of staff.
- Arranges for guest lecturers and schedules class times, locations, and staff for special training classes.
- Reviews evaluations and suggestions made by program attendees and incorporates changes to improve curriculum.
- Reviews and recommends approval of employees' requests to attend Department of Personnel training classes.
- Conducts new employee orientation programs.
- Researches and evaluates seminars and training sessions offered by consultants and recommends suitability for department employees.

- Coordinates work efforts with consultants and training vendors providing specialized and technical training to departmental employees.
- Prepares the department's training budget.
- Prepares work reports on training activities.
- May supervise staff engaged in preparing and disseminating informational materials on training and staff development programs.
- Oversees clerical staff registering training participants, reproducing training materials, maintains training records, and performs other clerical support duties.

#### **Minimum Qualifications**

• Graduation from an accredited college or university with a bachelor's degree supplemented by three years of training or teaching experience, or an equivalent combination of training and experience.

#### **Desired Qualifications**

- Previous experience creating instructional materials, writing lesson plans, or creating eLearning modules.
- Technical skills related to data analysis.
- Experience teaching adults and employing adult learning techniques.
- Ability to develop and implement new training programs and evaluate the effectiveness of existing training programs.

195. https://chicago.taleo.net/careersection/100/jobdetail.ftl.

# About the Police Executive Research Forum

#### The Police Executive Research Forum (PERF)

is an independent research organization that focuses on critical issues in policing. Since its founding in 1976, PERF has identified best practices on fundamental issues such as reducing police use of force; developing community policing and problemoriented policing; using technologies to deliver police services to the community; and developing and assessing crime reduction strategies. Over the past decade, PERF has led efforts to reduce police use of force through its guiding principles on use of force<sup>196</sup> and innovative Integrating Communications, Assessment, and Tactics (ICAT) training program.<sup>197</sup>

PERF strives to advance professionalism in policing and to improve the delivery of police services through the exercise of strong national leadership; public debate of police and criminal justice issues; and research and policy development.

The nature of PERF's work can be seen in the reports PERF has published over the years. Most of these reports are available without charge online at http://www.policeforum.org/free-online-documents. All of the titles in the *Critical Issues in Policing* series can be found on the back cover of this report and on the PERF website at https://www.policeforum. org/critical-issues-series. Recent reports include *Transforming Police Recruit Training: 40 Guiding Principles*<sup>198</sup> and *Lessons Learned from the COVID-19*  To learn more about PERF, visit: www.policeforum.org

Pandemic: What Police Learned from One of the Most Challenging Periods of Our Lives.<sup>199</sup>

In addition to conducting research and publishing reports on our findings, PERF conducts management studies of individual law enforcement agencies; educates hundreds of police officials each year in the Senior Management Institute for Police,<sup>200</sup> a three-week executive development program; and provides executive search services to governments that wish to conduct national searches for their next police chief.

All of PERF's work benefits from PERF's status as a membership organization of police officials, who share information and open their agencies to research and study. PERF members also include academics, federal government leaders, and others with an interest in policing and criminal justice.

All PERF members must have a four-year college degree and must subscribe to a set of founding principles, emphasizing the importance of research and public debate in policing, adherence to the Constitution and the highest standards of ethics and integrity, and accountability to the communities that police agencies serve.

PERF is governed by a member-elected President and Board of Directors and a Board-appointed Executive Director.

<sup>196.</sup> PERF, "Guiding Principles on Use of Force," March 2016, https://www.policeforum.org/assets/guidingprinciples1.pdf.

<sup>197.</sup> https://www.policeforum.org/icat

<sup>198.</sup> https://www.policeforum.org/assets/TransformingRecruitTraining.pdf

<sup>199.</sup> https://www.policeforum.org/assets/COVIDPandemic.pdf

<sup>200.</sup> https://www.policeforum.org/smip

# About the Motorola Solutions Foundation

#### As the charitable and philanthropic arm of

Motorola Solutions, the Motorola Solutions Foundation partners with organizations around the globe to create safer cities and equitable, thriving communities. We focus on giving back through strategic grants, employee volunteerism and other community investment initiatives. Our strategic grants program supports organizations that offer first responder programming and technology and engineering education, and align to our values of accountability, innovation, impact, diversity and inclusion. The Foundation is one of the many ways in which the company lives out its purpose of helping people be their best in the moments that matter.



For more information on the Foundation, visit: www.motorolasolutions.com/foundation

#### Rethinking the Police Response to Mental Health-Related Calls: Promising Models

Responding to the Staffing Crisis: Innovations in Recruitment and Retention

Building Public Trust Podcast

Women in Police Leadership: 10 Action Items for Advancing Women and Strengthening Policing

Transforming Police Recruit Training: 40 Guiding Principles

Police Chiefs Compensation and Career Pathways: PERF's 2021 Survey

Rethinking the Police Response to Mass Demonstrations: 9 Recommendations

Lessons from the COVID-19 Pandemic: What Police Learned from One of the Most Challenging Periods of Our Lives

Municipal and Campus Police: Strategies for Working Together During Turbulent Times

How Local Police Can Combat the Global Problem of Human Trafficking: Collaboration, Training, Support for Victims, and Technology Are Keys to Success

An Occupational Risk: What Every Police Agency Should Do to Prevent Suicide Among Its Officers

Chapter 2: How Police Chiefs and Sheriffs Are Finding Meaning and Purpose in the Next Stage of Their Careers

Reducing Gun Violence: What Works, and What Can Be Done Now



Police Executive Research Forum

Police Executive Research Forum 1120 Connecticut Avenue, NW, Suite 930 Washington, DC 20036 202-466-7820 www.PoliceForum.org

Promoting Excellence in First-Line Supervision: New Approaches to Selection, Training, and Leadership Development

The Police Response to Homelessness

The Changing Nature of Crime and Criminal Investigations

The Revolution in Emergency Communications

ICAT: Integrating Communications, Assessment, and Tactics

Guiding Principles on Use of Force

Advice from Police Chiefs and Community Leaders on Building Trust: "Ask for Help, Work Together, and Show Respect"

Re-Engineering Training on Police Use of Force

Defining Moments for Police Chiefs

New Challenges for Police: A Heroin Epidemic and Changing Attitudes Toward Marijuana

The Role of Local Law Enforcement Agencies in Preventing and Investigating Cybercrime

The Police Response to Active Shooter Incidents

Civil Rights Investigations of Local Police: Lessons Learned

Policing and the Economic Downturn: Striving for Efficiency Is the New Normal

An Integrated Approach to De-Escalation and Minimizing Use of Force

Improving the Police Response to Sexual Assault

How Are Innovations in Technology Transforming Policing?

Labor-Management Relations in Policing: Looking to the Future and Finding Common Ground

Managing Major Events: Best Practices from the Field Is the Economic Downturn Fundamentally Changing How We Police?

Guns and Crime: Breaking New Ground By Focusing on the Local Impact

Gang Violence: The Police Role in Developing Community-Wide Solutions

Violent Crime and the Economic Crisis: Police Chiefs Face a New Challenge — PART I

Violent Crime and the Economic Crisis: Police Chiefs Face a New Challenge — PART II

Violent Crime in America: What We Know About Hot Spots Enforcement

Police Chiefs and Sheriffs Speak Out on Local Immigration Enforcement

Violent Crime in America: "A Tale of Two Cities"

Police Planning for an Influenza Pandemic: Case Studies and Recommendations from the Field

Strategies for Resolving Conflict and Minimizing Use of Force

Patrol-Level Response to a Suicide Bomb Threat: Guidelines for Consideration

Violent Crime in America: 24 Months of Alarming Trends

A Gathering Storm — Violent Crime in America

Police Management of Mass Demonstrations

Exploring the Challenges of Police Use of Force

Challenge to Change: The 21st Century Policing Project

We are grateful to the Motorola Solutions Foundation for its support of the Critical Issues in Policing Series



MOTOROLA SOLUTIONS FOUNDATION

## **Critical Issues in Policing Series**